Father O'Flynn's Bingo evening is not reported in the Catholic Herald

But you would be forgiven for thinking that it was. The Catholic Herald provides a complete home and overseas news service for its readers. It has Correspondents throughout Britain and in most overseas Capitals. Their reports are back up by Reuters and the National Catholic Youth Service.

Among our regular contributors are Norman St. John-Stevas, Conservative Member of Parliament, and Kevin McNamara, Labour Member of Parliament.

SPECIAL OFFER
23 copies of The Catholic Herald are available for £2.00 from:

The Circulation Director,
63 Charterhouse Street,
London EC1M 6LA.

Please send Catholic Herald for 23 weeks to:

Name
Address

I enclose cheque/postal order for £
CONTENTS

EDITORIAL: FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES ................................. 1
FORMATION OF A CELIBATE ........................................... 10
Celibacy: a monastic attitude ......................................... 21
- Dominic Milroy, o.s.B.
The evolution of chastity .................................................. 31

Christ after the flesh ..................................................... 44
- Rev Professor Colin Morris

Blake's Divinity ............................................................. 53
- Ian Davie

Newman on Infallibility: 1870 and 1970 ............................. 61
- Rev Roderick Strange, s.T.L., D.Phil.

The Making of a Monastic Historian—1 ............................. 71
- The Editor

BOOK REVIEWS .............................................................. 92

COMMUNITY NOTES ......................................................... 106

SUBSCRIPTIONS:

Full edition (including notes on Ampleforth College):
Annual subscription ...................................................... £4.20
Single copy ................................................................. £1.00

Articles and Reviews edition:
Annual subscription ...................................................... £3.40
Single copy ................................................................. £1.35

Back Numbers are available at the above rates

THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL, Ampleforth Abbey, YO6 4EN
Telephone: Ampleforth 225, STD 043 93 225
Literary communications should be sent to the Editor,
Rev A. J. Stacpoole, O.S.B., M.C., M.A.
Business communications should be sent to the Secretary,
Rev T. F. Dobson, O.S.B., F.C.A.
Fr Patrick Barry, Chairman, Headmasters Conference 1975
EDITORIAL:
FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES

*Humanity's sickness is that it has nothing to believe in . . . people cannot live without a sense of significance.*

F. R. Leavis.

It has been made apparent in these pages over the last decade (notably in articles dealing with the population explosion, the resources of the world, the escalation of ecumenical understanding, and biblical interpretation) that the changes we are witnessing are of a rapidity and finality such as the world has never experienced before. History has been witness to deep trauma before, but never on so wide and so ontological a scale; for there was always a strong element of continuity, be it political or social or economic, in all societies undergoing major change. Now there is only movement in all spheres at once—and one ruefully recalls an article in these pages in the Autumn of 1967 entitled, “The Disintegration of an Old Culture”, and an earlier one in *The Spectator* by Lord Radcliffe entitled “The Dissolving Society”. The arguments there deployed are all the more forceful for the passing of the years.

Until recently western society has been strongly tradition orientated, running down the ringing grooves of change by broadening down from generation to generation. Its tradition has been the Christian one, resting on centuries of interpretation of Roman law, Hellenist philosophy and Hebrew scripture, together with the Christ Revelation. But, as we are learning now by hard-headed analysis, historical and philological, much of our inherited tradition has proven either wrong or rooted in its own milieu of assumptions and social process. It is enough to remind ourselves of the old fond belief in the fundamentalist understanding of the creation narratives of Genesis, dispelled at first by Darwinians and now by degrees in all fields of experimental science that yield their story of growth to sophistication and complexity: Jacob’s Ladder, Jacob Bronowski’s vivid portrayal of “The Ascent of Man” is sufficient to tell us that. And when that edifice changes its whole perspective, what then becomes of a dependent edifice of thought—concerning “original sin”?

And there are other subjects equally troubling, in that we can no longer easily accept their traditional interpretation. What are we to make of the pauline view of the place of women in society and in the Church, his words being embedded in Scripture? Today women lead governments in India, Ceylon and Argentina, and may well do so soon in Britain
where the present Cabinet contains Mrs Castle, Mrs Williams and Mrs Hart). Today the General Synod of the Church of England commissions consultative documents on "The Ordination of Women to the Priesthood", knowing that in Hong Kong and the USA women have already been so ordained; it is difficult to find theological reasons for not ordaining women, though there are many other kinds of reasons. And then, what are we to make of the Church's voice over slavery (of which the New Testament approved) and usury (of which it disapproved, it being a basis of much modern business)? And then, what of the old rigorous interpretation of the phrase extra ecclesia nulla salus, granted that there is in our present view (Cf Lumen Gentium 11.16 on Non-Christians) every hope of salvation for men of right heart even outside the confines of the formal Christian Church—one need only consider the riches of the Buddhist tradition and its effect on many of its close followers? And then, what kind of a revolution have we witnessed in the years between 1870, when the Primacy and Infallibility of the Papacy ex se et non ex consensu ecclesiae (without need of the Church's acceptance) was promulgated in a storm; and 1970, when the Vatican decree on The People of God began to be lived, bishops consulting their Rock before flying to consultation at the Rome Synod, and the democratic processes being mooted for the appointment of bishops? And then, how different have our views concerning the interplay of the sexes become from those of the nineteenth century, when theologians judged all acts of sexual expression to be "grave matter" if they were not ordained to the procreation of children by legitimate partners? And there are more . . . more such areas of traditional thought and teaching which have proven sometimes merely outmoded, sometimes once deeply inhibiting of positive living, and sometimes frankly wrong.

Of recent time society and the Church have, at first gradually, been parting company, until now it is estimated that England is ninety per cent non-religious in practising terms. The process has been veiled partly by the continuing impetus of traditional mores, and partly by the degree to which social and legal custom has rested on the tenets of Christianity, where life is held sacred and liberty of conscience is held as the last forum of moral rectitude. Now that double impetus is running down, the veil is being torn away, and the few who remain stand to be counted in a society of barefaced social convenience. And with this religio-moral stripping away of old values marches a radical change in values concerning personal private property, so that it is becoming impossible in western democratic states to live out one's own values and standards where they conflict with those of society at large—witness, for instance, the pressures now put upon private education, and the inheritance of private firms or farms. We must all become secular and competitive together now. The process is being speeded up by modern communications, which propagate change as earnestly as they propagate merely humanist values.

This has been accompanied also by a great advance in the understanding of human psychology, and so of the general pattern of men's social and psychological behaviour. And this in turn has issued in a widespread dependence of the population not upon the mundane ministrations of their own families and pastors, but upon the esoteric skills of experts; in Britain today one woman in six and one man in nine are treated for a psychiatric disorder in hospital during some stage of their lifespan. Another instance at a less specialised level is the ramification of marriage guidance work—courses, conferences, literature and monthly team activities in city after city—irrevaluable work which may remind us how far the combined insights of Freud and the father confessor have penetrated society. New books are being written not only on individual states of breakdown or soul-crisis, but on "The Family as Patient", or on such as the forces brought upon children nurtured in one-parent families, clinically analysed. Great strides have been made in the last twenty years (pace the President of the Royal College of Psychiatrists) upon such diseases as schizophrenia, which affects one in a hundred of us; so that much more is now known of the hereditary factor as against the influence of parents' narrowly conventional and punitive attitudes as factors inhibiting healthy mental growth. Good as all this must surely be, it results in so much less being accorded to faith or custom, and so much more to modern research and the confessorial role of various kinds of doctors. The troubled heart is not stilled by spiritual consolation, but by trust reposed in experts.

The consequences among men are indeed radical, for so many of the old presumptions have been eroded and replaced by new ones whose horizons are bounded by the span of life on earth. Man is exalted not as the supreme architecture of God, being made fit for Him; but as a phenomenon in himself. His gifts and goodness are attributed not to grace or the gift of God, but to his own innate natural virtue. He is encouraged to live his life according to his own convenience, free of external moral code—for codes of behaviour are seen as social signals of mutual tolerance, and so are negotiable. Moral behaviour is judged, not by any eternal or final law, but by changes in the law of the land or popular pressures of taste or conviction (and thus abortion was a subject for shock one day, and the next, after 1967, for enlightenment among those who took their
standards from their MP). And inevitably the desire to make sacrifices to train oneself for long and responsible careers of ultimate service to the community has given way to the desire for quicker returns, so that all the higher professions are suffering—and more than the call to religion.

So society slides into forms of secular utilitarianism—that is, the convenience of individuals who are strongly placed, in virtue perhaps of being in the prime of life, or a high earning position, or in a place of influence. The emphasis is put upon the freedom of man for self-gratification, or self-fulfilment, or what is sometimes called “full self-realisation.” Harsh words, these, but let us test their validity by examining five manifestations of modern life, public and personal—

VIOLENCE has increased in the whole world as a way of political expression as much as social or class expression, and nowhere more strikingly than in the West. There have been more than a hundred wars since the end of the Second World War, and there is seldom a week when TV and international journals do not need to cover a new outbreak of racial or internal violence amounting to insipient civil war. The extent of it, the persistence of it, the dissemination of it over the media have blunted man’s sense of outrage, so that he no longer resists sometimes so much so that he no longer feels the stress of conscience over what he is doing. An illustration may be taken from the recent summing up by Mr Justice McGonigal at a trial of eleven women and a man who were connected with the Irish Protestant paramilitary organisation, the Ulster Defence Association: the judge called it “a vicious and brutal organisation of people who take the law into their own hands by Kangaroo courts, intimidation and terrorism—gang law... gang vengeance which knew no reason and no mercy.” The case involved a woman beaten to death while her six year old daughter heard the process, crying out outside the door. Two girls in their teens completed the murder, stopping for a smoke during the beating, then going off for a drink and then to a disco, unperturbed by what they had perpetrated. (Cf Times, 7th Feb. 75). What is so awful is that their consciences remained unperturbed by the ghastliness of what they had done, and that such behaviour is becoming almost commonplace. Hope of the young and indecent assault, kidnapping, hijacking of planes and vehicles, knife fights, football hooliganism, muggings and the rest are the main grist of daily newspapers; and the recent acceleration of crime (a constant theme of responsible police officers and judges) is evident to anyone who can remember the changing pattern of newspaper reports. The subject has even come to the attention of working psychologists such as Erich Fromm (“The Anatomy of Human Destructiveness”, 1974, Cape £4.50), who finds the root causes for destructiveness among families that have failed to develop creative ties of love, and a society which has devalued the dignity of life as a vibrating, living experience. The offspring of such families and societies turn to love of machinery, physical and mechanical technique, “fun” instead of joy, superficial sentimentality instead of tender devotion, and harsh sensa-

FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES

BUSINESS MORALITY is suffering throughout the world because the belief in honesty, in the word of a gentleman, in honour among colleagues, in duty to your customers, in a fair day’s work for a fair day’s wage, in always giving full measure, in honouring your pledges and so forth have all wilted as maxims before the general corruption of public life, be it political or financial or among the social services and civil servants. One has only to call to mind in this country the ramifications of conspiracy and corruption that have been unearthed by the trials connected with John Poulson; and on a wider scale the deals of international financiers, some of whom have ended serving prison sentences. We hear today (if we are to believe the Sunday Times “Insight” team) that even the Vatican finances have not been left unaffected by banking irregularities with which Michele Sindona, the Sicilian international financier is connected, he having fled to avoid facing the collapse of his “empire” under the weight of what seems like massive dishonesty. And with dishonesty in this and the political fields must be coupled ruthless personal competitive ambition which uses society at large (small people living simple, loving, family lives) as a counter in a game instead of placing it at the centre of all ultimate purpose.

MARRIAGE is now held ever more cheaply, many of the young refusing to enter it at all while there are those of the old who happily enter their fifth marriage when they are 56. (There have been recorded cases of those who have entered their fourth marriage before they are 30.) The symptom of the breakdown of the final sanctity of the vows of marriage is the clamour in countries that do not already have liberal divorce laws for them to be introduced—Italy again comes to mind, with its May 1974 referendum, and now Portugal with its amendment to the Concordat. The Pope has recently had good cause to speak to the judges of the Sacred Roman Rota (the Church Court of Appeals, which handles marriage cases throughout the Catholic Church), reminding them that marriage is indissoluble provided that it is “a true and perfect marriage, i.e. one which is ratified and consummated”. He reminded them that their first task must be to defend values which “for biblical, theological and rational reasons beyond dispute bear the character of inviolable authority”; and their next task must be to defend “the institution of marriage, and by consequence the institution of the family—the fundamental basis for a moral, healthy and civilised society”. How real this task is can be gauged by listing the divorce petitions in Britain in the recent past: from 1959 to 1968 the number of petitions rose from 26,000 to 55,000, and from then to the new Divorce Act (1971) they continued to rise to 111,000 after which they
have settled at that high figure year by year, without evidence of a foreseeable drop—indeed the evidence of researchers is that between a sixth and a quarter of all marriages (a third in the USA) will end in divorce, that being a phenomenon of all western society. A radical instability has set in when the search for self-fulfilment has become the criterion of life.

ABORTION, once fairly universally held to be infanticide, has by law become the norm in Austria, Germany and France as well as our own country; and is being clamoured for in such supposedly Catholic countries as Italy, where the Constitutional Court has now declared it legal when the mother's physical and mental health are in serious danger (Ruling of 18th February). In Britain 163,000 legal abortions were carried out in 1974, slightly less than in 1972; and of those, about 56,000 per year are for women from abroad. More than 70,000 of the 1972 abortions were performed on unmarried mothers (illegitimate conception having doubled since the 1967 Abortion Act was passed). So prevalent has the abortion morality become now, that good doctors are being driven out of the profession by it, and few gynaecologists are finding themselves able to honour their “conscience clause” and find appointments or promotion, even by only general practitioners consulted in the first instance. The Lane Committee called to examine abuses of the 1967 Act wrote a report amounting to complacent white-washing; and so a slide into a vicious law morality continued until two young journalists, Michael Litchfield and Susan Kentish, exposed the worst practices in their book, “Babies for Burning” (Serpentine Press, 75p). What these two journalists discovered was that legalised abortion has opened the way to a particularly disgusting form of racketeering, which, far from enlarging man’s freedom, has involved violence to woman’s most creative and fulfilling impulses. Back-street racketeering has given way to Harley Street operations where, higher charges being exacted on the unfortunate woman, her foetus is then sent to research laboratories or cosmetic factories or left to cry in a disposal bin. It is worth recalling, in the light of what is evidently a human right to life. It is not a recognition by someone else which constitutes this right. This right precedes recognition; it demands recognition, and it is strictly unjust to refuse to give it . . . when the ovum is fertilised, there is inaugurated a life that is neither that of the father nor of the mother, but is a new human being which develops on its own. (Genetic science gives valuable confirmation to this constant evidence.)

EUTHANASIA is by degrees becoming a real legal possibility in our Society. Bills were introduced into Parliament to legalise it not only in 1936 (just after the formation of a Euthanasia Society) but in 1969; and Cardinal Heenan was recently prompted to warn us that “legal euthanasia is a short but logical step from legal abortion”. Baroness Stocks, in Age Concern (1972), advocated the right of people in possession of their wits to sign a paper instructing their doctors that when they are no longer thinking humans or when they become incurably ill they should be put to sleep. Doctors such as George Mair (“Confession of a Surgeon”, 1974, Wm. Luscombe, £3.95) are now willing to write their memoirs at the end of their working lives admitting that they have practised prudential and private euthanasia over a long period, without expecting from the public either a summons or a show of ostracism. They regard themselves as trend setters who are the bow wave of what must inevitably come about in a progressively “enlightened” society. The matter is now even being discussed on TV as an open question (BBC 2, 8th February 75, “A Suitable Case for Killing?”): Dr Gertrudie Postma, a Dutch village doctor, recently carried out what is customarily called “mercy killing” on her own mother because (as she said, “motivated by love”) she believed it to be a normal medical duty for her. Her trial, which divided Dutch public opinion, was re-enacted before a studio panel, including professionals who actually have to live with the problems surrounding the whole issue of maintaining life in the last stages; and a discussion followed as to whether euthanasia should be legalised in Britain. It then became the subject of the first article in The Listener of 13th February 75, “Euthanasia: a Good End?”, where it was proposed in bold capitals that “the time is coming when people will die voluntarily, rather than wait for a fractured femur or a stroke to carry them off. They will ask for dying to be arranged for them.” Soon afterwards The Times carried a Saturday religious article, “Euthanasia: the Challenge to Christian Ethics” by Fr David Forrester (15th February 75). So prevalent of late has become the mood in favour of euthanasia that the Catholic hierarchy was moved to issue a statement to be read out on Sunday, 8th December distinguishing between the positive and kindly support of those near death—alleviation of pain or distress by medical treatment that may in fact hasten the process of dying, or not going to inordinate lengths to prolong life while consoling the dying—and the deliberate and direct ending of one’s own or another’s life, which is forbidden by the law of God and the law of the land. Yes, but for how long more by the law of the land? Its convenience, like that of contraception and abortion, is too attractive for society, in its present mood, to forgo it for much longer. This desertion of Christian idealism for secular utilitarianism in human evaluation has produced an inevitable loss of respect for persons: self convenience invariably involves a loss of self reverence, and with it self discipline, and with that an appreciation of the dignity of human being and time. It might be an indicative test of this to recall that the Chairman of the National Childbirth Trust had recently to issue a public protest against hospitals indulging in induced or “forced” childbirth, though aware of the hazards which include death or permanent brain
damage to the infant caused by over-intense artificially induced con-
tractions in labour: the reason for such induced premature births turned out to be nothing more than the Christmas convenience of hospital staff! A more searching and universal test is to ask whether there is more smoking, drinking, drugging, gambling and voyeurism in Britain today than before. The annual report of the Customs and Excise Commissioners for 1973-4 revealed that smoking had increased by 5.4 per cent, beer consumption by 7.1 per cent, and wine had soared by 30 per cent. Alcoholism in Britain has reached a new peak, with almost a third of a million people incapacitated, a third of them severely. Over the period 1972-3 there had been an increase of 8.2 per cent on the duty yielded from gambling and betting. More than $5 million worth of drugs had been smuggled into Britain, most of them being picked up in the streets. As to pornographic literature, some three-quarters of a million books, magazines and horror comics had been seized, together with 1,750 "blue" films—all of which signifies a high degree of unpleasant self gratification. One remembers St John's admonition in his First Epistle, "all that is in the world, the lust of the flesh and the lust of the eyes and the pride of life, is not of the Father but is of the world which passes away." Meanwhile the dignity of the human state is a present casualty.

Now all this being so, and in such a suddenly high degree in our society, one is driven to ask what has become of those values which are specifically ordered to the after-life that is so stridently denied by so many in the West. Recently in the press, in connection with the Churches being invited to pay for all religious broadcasting, it was suggested that in the fourth quarter of the twentieth century it was high time the superstitions of the Middle Ages were anyway put to rest. What has become of the specifically eschatologically orientated values and virtues enjoined by Christ—notably the once cherished evangelical counsels of poverty, chastity and obedience? All of these have lost their old sense of dignity in the minds of the "liberated"; poverty as a virtue has been rendered "irrelevant" by full employment and social welfare, and those who practise it for religious reasons are merely considered inefficient; chastity as a virtue has been rendered equally "irrelevant" by modern contraceptive enlightenment and a change of climate as to what constitutes good living (in both senses, clean living and fullness of living); and obedience has been undermined by the exaltation of individualism and accession to power of those without formal initiative through such organs as the trade unions. We may ask especially what has become, of late, of that most other-world ordered of all vocations, the call to consecrated celibacy, virginity for the sake of the Kingdom. It has once been called in these pages "the crucial sacrifice". Archbishop Frederick Temple in the last century wrote of it, "in chastity (the principle of purity) the Hebrews stood alone; and this virtue, which had grown up with them from their earliest days, was still in the vigour of fresh life when they were commissioned to give the Gospel to the nations. The Hebrew morality has passed into the Christian Church." What has become now, in the modern

Christian Church as it lives its life in a post-Christian world, of this precious virtue—life consecrated celibacy for those in vows, and Christian chastity for those baptised unto Christ and called to celibacy except in marriage? It is a good test of whether the end is forgotten or not.

And now we must face the most central question: are there any fundamental, immovable, time unaffected, custom free, principles that man can simply not avoid, though he may just ignore or disobey them? If values can so profoundly and so widely shift as fashions in the wind, are there any fixed laws for mankind at all—is there any final right and wrong, or imperative call? Is man wholly free to choose, and free to act as he wishes? Is there a term to what he may change or discard? Is he no way morally determined by what is outside himself—like duty, or higher love, or final end? Is there in fact a law of nature and must man respond to it? Is there any clear law of God that is finally mandatory? Was there some ground truth in Eden? Is it for every person on earth to answer this alone in his own soul, and then live by it. People cannot live without a sense of significance.

DR ALAN RICHARDSON, K.B.E., DEAN OF YORK

We must sadly record the sudden death on 23rd February of a close friend of the Community and a regular contributor to these pages (his last contribution was an appreciation of Dr Ian Ramsey of Durham in the summer issue, and he had a review of Jurgen Moltmann's "The Crucified God" in hand). Alan Richardson died as he deserved, spared of a long illness—though his health had troubled him for a while. He died on the Lord's Day after Evensong; and that is significant, for it was he who insisted during the long recent years of the restructuring of the Minster from crypt to tower roof, when drills and cranes were at work most days, that during the mid-afternoon a silence should descend within the great space while the canons and choristers of St Peter's, the cathedral of Yorkshire, sang the daily prayer of Evensong as public worship to God. Often present there himself, he was always mindful of it happening; and presiding there last Sunday he completed the blessing of the congregation of some two hundred before he died. His wife Phyllis, as always, was with him.

Had he been alive and well, the Dean was to have placed the 94th Archbishop of York in his throne the following Tuesday, handing him his primatial cross as symbol of his authority as Primate of England, and presenting him to the people. He had had it in mind that after this he would retire as Dean: but the Lord has had other plans. There must be few Deans who have ever given so much of themselves to the life of the Minster and City of York—and, be it added, few Deans' wives who have so supported their husbands' work. An extended appreciation will appear in the summer issue. May he rest in peace.
FORMATION OF A CELIBATE

AN ADDRESS TO THE ABBOTS OF THE ENGLISH BENEDICTINE CONGREGATION

by

Dr J. Dominian, M.A., M.D., B.CHR., M.R.C.P.Ed., M.R.C.Psy., D.F.M.

Education for celibacy is motivated and regulated before everything else by the love of Christ, which is at the bottom of this commitment. Without a deep love of Christ, sacerdotal celibacy loses all meaning. Still, the meaning and exercise of celibacy are conditioned by human elements which must absolutely be looked at.

Gabriel Marie Cardinal Garrone.

The subject is so current, especially so when the Sacred Congregation for Catholic Education has issued its eighty-page "Guide to Formation in Priestly Celibacy" to April this year, carrying out the instructions of the Holy Father in his Encyclical Letter Sacerdotalis Caelibatus Sec. 61 that a guide "be drawn up with the help of truly qualified men treating with all necessary detail the theme of chastity." (It is hoped that this Guide will be discussed in the coming Spring issue).

This is of one of these papers presented at St Benet's Hall, Oxford last Lent. (It is hoped to print the others later). Dr Jack Dominian will be familiar to Journal readers: his first writing for us was his ground-breaking paper of Spring 1968 (p. 3-13), "The Crucial Sacrifice: a married layman's reflections on secularisation and celibacy" (Summer 1970, p. 178-195).

INTRODUCTION:

Your invitation to contribute to your deliberations on the celibate life is one that I have gladly accepted because I believe that the psychological sciences have much to contribute to the renewal of Christian and religious life. This conviction is still a small and rather lonely voice submerged by the suspicion and doubt surrounding the theme and, until very recently, overpowered by the importance attached to the intellect as a major contributor to man's perfection.

It is as well, therefore, at the very start of this paper to express briefly the premises from which I have to operate. I believe first of all that Christianity is facing a challenge unparalleled in its history. There will be those who say that Christianity has and will always face crises. This is true. But the crisis of today is not primarily about Christianity but about God. Contemporary man has had most of his bearings about God systematically eroded as science has become his handmaid in exploring the meaning of the universe for which God is apparently irrelevant.

And by science I do not mean just the technological sciences. I mean also the sociological and psychological sciences which together appear to provide all the tools for investigating and understanding the mystery of man. Now, from the depths of my faith, I know that illuminating as all these sciences are they do not and cannot provide the fulness of justification for man's existence. This is not only because science cannot offer the key to the mystery of the origin of life but, even if it could, we shall never provide a satisfactory answer to the "why" of it all. As far as the "why" is concerned, Christianity has a most arresting answer in Christ.

JESUS CHRIST:

It is not an accident, therefore, that most recent theology has become Christ-centred. For me personally it provides the key to everything. The imagery of God has suffered severe reverses chronicled in that extremely popular book by the Bishop of Woolwich, "Honest to God". And the way back to God the Father is through the Son. That is the cornerstone of all my thinking and it is the key to the life of celibacy which I would like to support by two crucial concepts.

The first one is Christ's own invitation to the single state for the sake of the Kingdom, a point which you will be considering later on.

The second is that such an invitation means that the celibate, like all Christians, has to strive to be Christ-like and here I would like to describe several features about Christ which are indispensable to the human personality when it tries to imitate him.

The first of these is the urgency with which contemporary man is seeking autonomy, the desire to maximise an inward, self directing, self controlling life. The challenge this provides to basic structures of society, be they civil or religious, is something we are all familiar with and yet autonomy, in so far as it is man's freely chosen response in thought, action and behaviour to neighbour and God, is indispensable and the incarnation reinforces it totally. Christ's response to the Father was not that of blind obedience but one of freely chosen love as St John reminds us again and again.

"The Father loves me, because I lay down my life in order to take it up again. No one takes it from me, I lay it down of my own free will." John 10. 17-18

But this autonomy took place always in the context of a relationship, the relationship of love between Father and Son. The essence of living is to be found in relationships of love, not in unilateral isolation of autonomy, nor in the chaos of anomy. Having established the primacy of autonomy, Christ's freely chosen way of life, the next feature is the characteristic of the wholeness of this life succinctly portrayed by St Paul in Colossians:

"He is the image of the unseen God." Col 1.15

"Before anything was created, he existed, and he holds all things in unity." Col 1.17
"As he is the Beginning
he was first to be born from the dead
so that he should be first in every way;
because God wanted all perfection
to be found in him." Col 1.18

When the Christian orientated towards Christ talks of holiness, the
dynamic psychologist orientated towards man calls for wholeness and the
two refer to that personal integrity in which all parts of man, the physical,
intellectual and social are allowed to develop to the fulness of their
potential, in harmony. This Christ had and it leads to another vital factor
of celibate life.

If personal integrity requires the fulness of personal growth, then for
the Christian this realisation of potential is not directed towards the self,
it is characterised by availability for others in and through Christ.
Traditional Christian thought has approached this in the reverse by
referring to the theme of Christ's kenosis or emptying of himself. St Paul
describes this in Philippians:

"In your minds you must be the same as Christ Jesus;
His state was divine,
and yet he did not cling,
to his equality with God
but emptied himself" Phil 2.5-7

This concept of kenosis has been seized upon by many as a basis for
self sacrifice and denial. What, however, must never be forgotten,
particularly by the celibate who is dedicated to the services of others, is
that there can be no emptying if there is no fulness of being and it is this
fulness of being that needs constant attention in the development of the
human personality if it is to imitate Christ. This is really what is meant
by loving one's neighbour as oneself. So often love of self has been seen
by its very nature as a barrier which needs to be removed for growth to take place.

"As the Beginning
he was first to be born from the dead
so that he should be first in every way;
because God wanted all perfection
to be found in him." Col 1.18

So now we have gathered most of the human characteristics relevant to
the Christ life. The sense of freedom and personal choice exercised in
relationships of love, built in the life of community, aiming at the fulness
of being, for the sake of availability to others and we are left with one
last item. To autonomy, integrity, must be added one final word—
authenticity. The word authenticity comes from the Greek and means
literally—"one who does a thing himself". You can see the appropriateness
of this word in the context of this paper. What a person does derives
its validity because it arises from the autonomy and integrity of the
individual. It no longer depends on the presence of fear, blind obedience,
the need to please, to place, to do something for another which does not
correspond to the genuine intention of the doer. Please note that this
does not mean that the only activity must thus be pleasure-seeking and
avoid suffering; the way of the cross can never be this. But it does mean
that what we aim to achieve for ourselves and others represents the genuine
expression (however mistaken) of our inner self and is not dictated by
expediency, summed up once again in that marvellous psychological gospel
of St John:

"As for human approval, this means nothing to me." John 5.41

Here then we have a summary of the total goal of formation of the
celibate. The setting is community life, the reality is relationships of love,
through which personal autonomy, integrity and authenticity are aimed
to achieve the fulness of being which is that of Jesus Christ for the sake
of service to others. In a sense this is the Kingdom of God which is now
already present in the human community orientated towards Christ of
which the religious community must be one of its principal earthly
manifestations.

But how, you may well ask, are these goals achieved? Traditionally
we have replied through the evangelical counsels of chastity, poverty and
obedience. I do not believe that this is a completely satisfactory answer
any longer and, since this is a radical break from tradition, my comment
needs elucidation. All the three counsels will, of course, remain important
but, in my view, apart from chastity—which must remain central—poverty
and obedience have to become ancillary to two other key ideas which are
psychologically orientated, namely healing and growth. The rest of the
paper will now be devoted to developing these ideas.

SUITABILITY OF CANDIDATES:

So, having outlined the goals of the celibate life we must begin at the
beginning and ensure that only those who have the appropriate vocation
are admitted and encouraged to proceed. This brings our attention
to selection and a few vital remarks have to be made here. The celibate
is entering religious life to give testimony to something positive; namely
the reality of Jesus Christ and the fruits of his existence for the meaning
of life. He is not entering to escape from life and the first responsibility
of every religious community is to ensure that it does not become a focus
for those who consciously or unconsciously cannot engage in the taxing
task of living. From extensive professional experience I want to spell out
what this really means.

Most candidates present themselves for the religious life in their late
teens or early twenties. Strict chronological age does not matter; what
really matters is emotional maturity. Please note I have not said physical
or intellectual maturity. The latter may be frequently present in the
absence of emotional maturity or the capacity to achieve it and this is what
really matters. But what do we mean by emotional maturity? We mean
many things but I would like to concentrate on three characteristics.

FORMATION OF A CELIBATE 13
14 THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL

(a) Dependence—Independence:

The first one is the dependence-independence dimension. We all start life in a state of utter helplessness, utterly dependent for our survival on our parents. Some two decades later we have acquired a sufficient sense of our own confidence and self-determination, to take life in our own hands and run it without too much anxiety. This applies to the overwhelming majority of young people, but not to all. There is a sizeable minority who, despite their physical and intellectual adulthood, are still looking for parental substitutes. The Catholic Church, with its authoritarian structures, reflected in turn to the religious community when it is run without proper insight, has been the haven for those emotionally dependent persons. The Church has paid a heavy price for attracting such individuals for, as they slowly mature over the next few years, they no longer need the crutches of the community or the abbot and they depart because their vocation was not to Jesus Christ, but to the need for emotional safety. The few who never grow up remain because the world outside is a place of terror from which they remain permanently in retreat.

This acts as a deterrent that the advantages offered by the community which does not provide these opportunities for its novices will never find out their underlying emotional uncertainty and will make mistakes about a true vocation.

(b) Crisis of Identity:

The crisis of adolescence is not only reflected in the assumption of personal responsibility and its consequences, it also reflects the fact that a young person now feels that he is no longer a child and yet not an adult. The unuttered cry of many such a person is really "Who am I?" The confused and uncertain young man or woman may make the mistake of finding an identity through a socially acceptable role. If they marry, they assume the status of husband-wife, father-mother but, since they are in no sense ready to be either, these externally imposed identities are prematurely placed on an inner world that has yet to discover its bearings. Hence the abnormally high rate of marital breakdown in youthful marriages.

The same applies to the celibate who, unknown to himself, chooses a role; in fact a highly significant role because of its religious context and thereby comes to believe they have resolved their identity crisis. A tradition which has emphasized the need to respond urgently to God's call has urged in the past the acceptance of a vocation when, in fact, what was happening was the trying out of an inappropriate remedy for an inner confusion. I would go as far as to say that the training for celibacy should emphasize the opposite, namely that a vocation must be assumed not to exist until this has been proved to the contrary by the completion of a rigorous training.

SUSTAINING:

The history of monasticism has always shown the importance attached to the work of a community which makes it independent. Work is a vital human need through which we sustain the meaning of our identity and I would say that no-one is fit to enter a religious life who would not otherwise have been able to sustain himself or herself in the world outside.

This may not have applied in the past but must certainly apply now. This acts as a deterrent that the advantages offered by the community which assumes responsibility for personal survival can never be an escape from a difficulty and, unless the difficulty is realised and actively pursued with the aims of changing it, religious life simply accommodates and reinforces the problem, particularly if the community concerned avoids interpersonal relationships and sustains a pseudo-mutuality in which those present are outwardly in contact with each other but are in reality miles apart.

(c) The Inability to Relate:

The third and, in some ways, most vital point is that religious life implies the absence of an intimate, close, one-to-one relationship. Now in my work as a psychiatrist I meet many men and women who have profound difficulties in initiating and sustaining close relationships and from the hundreds of examples I would like to summarise the main reasons. Such men and women are by nature shy, close emotional involvement overstrains them and they avoid it; they are lacking in confidence and self-esteem and therefore are worried that others will find nothing acceptable in them (which forms one of the standard spiritual traps because they escape into the belief that somehow God will accept them, which leads to fatal spiritual cynicism unless they come to accept themselves as genuinely lovable people). Lacking in self-assurance they are highly critical and envious of others and feel therefore the need for the discipline of religious life as a corrective training to hold their impulses in check or their sexual life is so distorted in one form or another that they avoid the responsibility of correcting it by abandoning the goal of sexual activity altogether. I must emphasise that none of these characteristics in themselves is an absolute barrier to religious life, but they all constitute an escape from a difficulty and, unless the difficulty is realised and actively pursued with the aims of changing it, religious life simply accommodates and reinforces the problem, particularly if the community concerned avoids interpersonal relationships and sustains a pseudo-mutuality in which those present are outwardly in contact with each other but are in reality miles apart.

If I had to highlight one of the real dangers of celibate life in community it would be that of pseudo-mutuality in which the community engages in common activities but the participants remain basically and distant from the healing growth that relationships of love demand which now leads me to describe the three characteristics of community life which I would place psychologically as crucial for the wellbeing of a community, namely sustaining, healing and growth.

FORMATION OF A CELIBATE
HEALING:

The idea of healing is very familiar to the Christian. It is couched in terms of a second alienation from God, the need for a redeemer, the self-revelation of God in Jesus Christ, the grace of this revelation and availability to man which, in the Catholic Tradition, has taken a special form in the sacramental life. Within this framework, which in turn has been developed into a code of morals, values and prescriptions for daily life, the Christian has been encountering God’s saving presence.

I believe that the psychological sciences will, in fact, revolutionise our understanding of healing as the information now available to such experts as psychotherapists becomes common knowledge. It is my most earnest desire that the Christian community, particularly the religious life, should reorientate itself as rapidly as possible to grasp the essentials of psychological healing, for here at hand we have one of the most powerful means of advancing God’s cause of salvation.

What does a psychiatrist really mean by healing? Basically he is saying two things. The first is that all of us are subject in our behaviour either to excesses or to deficiencies which prevent us from functioning effectively. These are frequently genetically inherited. We are of course familiar with physical or intellectual defects. As medicine progresses, physical abnormalities become less and less but, even today, we are aware of congenital deafness, blindness, colour blindness, stammering, etc., etc. Equally we know of the ravages of mental sub-normality. But we know little of the problems associated with excessive mood swings which lead people to have overt manic or depressive illnesses, excessive anxiety with all the phobias this produces, excessive tendency to tension with the crippling outburst of aggression, aggressive or sexual impulsiveness, or the opposites such as the lack of energy, drive, the capacity for sustained activity, low threshold to frustration and so on. So far all these disturbances have been seen in the context of moral, i.e., personal defect, and the solution has been to shame people out of them by investing such actions with morally culpable terms such as laziness, selfishness, animal behaviour and so on. By doing this we have of course frequently fallen into the dangerous trap of condemning totally the individual and, secondly, of defining goodness by the avoidance of certain disapproved activity such as is now described. Or even worse, escaping into another dangerous myth, of explaining everything by the idea of original sin which offers a neat hypothetical solution and solves absolutely nothing.

Now, in fact, each of these factors—and many others—is slowly becoming isolated and gradually understood. By the judicious use of drugs, the Pavlovian technique of behaviour therapy and retraining we can attack some of these problems successfully and begin the long haul of the healing of the human personality. Now one vital aspect of healing in the community is to learn how to discern these constitutionally determined handicaps, seek the appropriate solution where one exists, avoid the manipulation of the individual through guilt for happenings over which he or she has no control and therefore enlarge the available energy and resources for the process of healing and growth instead of using it as a way of self-defence from the unjustified accusations of others.

The second thing the psychiatrist is saying is that the adult personality is the product of two factors. The first, just mentioned, is the genetic inheritance, built into the constitution of the individual and further shaped by the health of the individual. The second is the experiences we receive from our parents, teachers and those in authority who in a space of some two decades are responsible for offering us the means of achieving certain essential human characteristics which are associated with maturity. These are the ability to move from total dependence to independence in which we dare not get too close to anyone in case they discover only too quickly our insufficiency and reject us. Christian education which has emphasised asceticism, a false sense of humility, self-abnegation, a deep sense of badness, indeed the negative aspects of man has greatly contributed to this damage and, as I have written elsewhere, the model of Christian education must be affirmative, the enlargement of the self, not diminution to the lowest possible denominator of avoiding the forbidden.

Once again, therefore, the religious community must be a healing community. For this certain vital characteristics, in some ways quite different from those that have prevailed in the past, will be needed in the future. As with sacramental healing, which presupposes the direct encounter between man and God in and through Jesus Christ, so healing is an extension of this in the Christian community whose mystical presence is Christ now encountered in the intimate personal encounter between, to use Buber’s language, an I and a Thou.

The I is a wounded person who is seeking the conditions of security, trust, openness, approval, reassurance, affirmation, not the exaggeration of their faults but the enlargement of their personal significance through unconditional personal acceptance. The Thou is the other person in the community who is blessed with some of these qualities whilst he himself seeks healing in other respects.
Such healing requires intimacy, openness and—above all—the intervention of feelings. No one will deny that, while feelings have always been recognized in the Christian tradition, the intellect has been in the ascendancy in the West. As far as I am concerned that era must now come to an end. Not that we should abandon reason and logic, not at all, but we must recognize the equivalent importance of feelings; for a faith which is based on love which does not give prominence to feelings and emotions is ludicrous, as I think part of our Christian tradition has been.

It should never be forgotten, particularly for the celibate, that our earliest and most vital experiences were the communication of physical and emotional feelings. Long before we could speak we experienced the blessed security of being touched, hugged, smiled at and reassured with loving noises. The body and emotional experiences are the foundations of personal communication, long before words and ideas came into prominence. In due course they do assume importance but to extol them in preference to our earliest and most basic human experiences is to distort the nature of man. If the celibate therefore is going to give up the physical communion of a one-to-one experience of marriage, what he must retain without any shadow of doubt is the compensation of a rich feeling and emotional life. Something which Vatican II stressed. This is, of course, revolutionary for many but we should remember that our everyday life is controlled a great deal by our feelings. Apprehension, fear, anxiety, security, insecurity, trust and mistrust, liking and disliking, anger, hate, acceptance, rejection, comfort and discomfort, feeling relaxed or tense, guilt, forgiveness, repentance, envy, jealousy and many other moment-to-moment experiences which govern so much of our life depend a great deal on feelings and emotions. The religious community must aim at emphasizing the awareness of these characteristics, encouraging friendships, openness and intimacy for the reduction of these negative feelings and the increase in confidence, self-acceptance and self-esteem. Here, of course, all our traditional fears of special friendships have to give way to the sense of a healing community where maturity will act as the brake against fragmentation.

GROWTH:

Healing is in fact the prelude to personal growth. We cannot realize the fulness of our potential until we stop using most of our energy to avoid the danger of personal disintegration from the fears of being found wanting, inseparable, worthless, unlovable and therefore liable to be rejected, ignored, humiliated and cast out. When such fears do not exist, or they exist minimally, we are in a position to discover our talents to the full. These talents may be physical, intellectual, emotional or social.

Many psychologists have written about this process of growth. It has been variously called self-actualisation, self-realisation, individuation and many other names. But at the heart of this is a process in which the potential of the individual is encouraged to unfold to its limits. I am personally convinced that, when a penetrating understanding of Christ's personality is reached, we shall find that this process of self-realisation is central to the mystery of the Incarnation.

This is a process which has humble beginnings and we can understand its essence from understanding the development of children. Child psychology tells us that the child develops in and through phases and the work of Piaget has shown how these phases allow the child to expand its cognitive and social world.

The excessive emphasis placed on the intellect has given us the mistaken notion that, with school or university over, growth somehow ceases. Nothing of the sort happens. It is true that absolute physical and intellectual growth ceases but even this is not quite true for, with the passage of time, we learn to be more effective in the way we use our training. Far more important in the presence of a facilitating environment in which we go on making discoveries of new and hidden talents pointed out by others or discovered by trial and error by ourselves. These can cover a whole range, such as cooking new dishes, learning a new language, improving on gardening or developing our ideas, writing and creativity. Psychologists speak of peak experiences, sudden insights, discoveries which go on continuously in ourselves but which need a positive, affirming environment so that the seedling blossoms into a full grown flower.

Feelings in particular are capable of growth. Our patience, compassion, generosity, understanding, go on improving as we learn to read more accurately the signals that others give which allow us to meet their needs far more accurately and reduce the area of misunderstanding or even active damage.

Thus between them, sustaining, healing and growth become the foundations of all personal relationship and now I must finally return and place these in the context of the three evangelical counsels of the religious tradition.

CHASTITY:

Clearly the feature that divides the celibate from the married is not the presence or absence of sexual pleasure, but the absence of an exclusive one-to-one relationship which is confirmed by the reality and symbolism of sexual intercourse. What the celibate gives up is an exclusive one-to-one relationship and here he is modelling himself on Christ, the man for all, hence the importance of his availability and secondly he is eschatologically anticipating the kingdom in which there will be no taking or giving in marriage but, please note, where personal relationships of love modelled on the Trinity must exist by definition of all that Christianity stands for.

So the challenge for the celibate is not primarily sex or the avoidance of the members of the opposite sex but the incorporation of the psychological characteristics of the opposite, as Christ's gentleness, warmth, acceptance, intuitive insights and understandings incorporated feminine traits and the ability to heal and to grow without an exclusive one-to-one relationship. Anyone who can must these essentials has the capacity to

† Jean Piaget 1896—Eminent Swiss Educational child psychologist.
pursue the celibate life, not as a way of escape from anything but as an outward manifestation of an inner fulness of sexual and personal maturity.

POVERTY:

Of the three evangelical counsels, chastity remains central; not so poverty and obedience for, as far as I am concerned, these are subordinate to healing and growth, and now become means and not ends in themselves. What I am saying here can be summarised thus for poverty. The material poverty of the celibate can certainly be a sign of concern for the poor and also an aid for the avoidance of the traps of richness and worldly concern. But all this pales into insignificance before the richness acquired inwardly by the positive enlargement of the personality. The fuller a person becomes in his own experience of himself, the less he needs material goods or social advantages to enhance his identity. The vow of poverty has not only an eschatological meaning, like chastity; not only has it value in protecting man from the seduction of material goods, but its ultimate meaning emerges when the inner experience of self increases sufficiently to make the external support of self redundant. Surely it is this poverty which means utter abundance. Christ possesses it in His own right through His relationship with the Father, which is what the world is looking for and which the religious community can highlight.

OBLIGATION:

And the same with obedience. Since obedience has come to play such an important role it is necessary to assert that Christ's obedience to the Father was freely given and arose from His total authentic personality, constantly expressing integrity. This was not the obedience of an inferior to a superior; not of a child to a figure of authority. Only when these principles are clearly grasped can we really reach the meaning of obedience. The obedience of love, which is the only obedience appropriate in personal relationships, has to be distinguished from that of an impersonal law or authority for which love has no meaning.

Obedience, therefore, can only operate in the context of egalitarian relationships of love which respect and facilitate the autonomy, integrity and authenticity of the person. It is the freely given response of the individual out of love which ultimately can offer sacrificially the whole of self as Christ did, that belongs truly to the meaning of the evangelical counsel.

May I conclude by a personal credo. I believe that religious life has a future and an important future. For within it, and the family—hence my other concern, namely marriage—are to be found the three essential characteristics of sustaining, healing and growth which are the essentials for human perfection. Furthermore, the world has received the self-revelation of God in His Son where all these three manifestations find their completion. The world can try to pursue these aims but it can only fully fulfill them in the presence and grace of the one and only who, by His life and death, left a permanent model of the way, the truth and life in and through love.
gap. But there is at least an important residue of truth in the proposition that the modern novice thinks like a modern student (after all, he is one), i.e. he tends to relate to the monastic institution in a way not altogether unlike the way in which the university student relates to academic or political institutions. To generalise somewhat, he is, in contrast to many previous generations of students, an instinctive radical. He has an enquiring mind, distrusts any kind of status quo, and takes it for granted that on the whole, change is a good thing in principle. He is suspicious of authority as such, especially if the awful word “paternalistic” be attached to it, and expects to be consulted. He dislikes conformity, rigidity and legalism even more than the rest of us do. He is used to moving in an “open” society of shifting, informal and often intense relationships, prefers an exposed situation to a sheltered one and is willing to take risks in his personal life. He is conscious of a need to commit himself to persons and causes, but prefers to remain uncommitted on a great many issues, often important ones. He does not relinquish these attitudes, which are largely unconscious ones, on becoming a monk; in fact he rather expects the monastery, as a Christian community, to embody the human values which he admires, and to offer him an enriching pattern of close relationships and of intellectual and moral challenges, free of the injustice and prejudice which distort ordinary human society “in the world”.

Nor is the monastery, once he has joined it, any longer a “haven” from outside pressures. The open and speculative character of theological courses will confirm rather than resist whatever radical attitudes he already has. Secular culture, moreover, exerts a far greater influence within the monastery than in the past. Indeed, it is probably true to say that the novel and (where it is available) the cinema are in a very special way for the monk windows into the more problematic areas of modern society; through the images and themes of fiction he keeps his moral sense tuned in to what is happening. That this involves an element of escapism is too obvious to be worth arguing: in this context the point is that it is increasingly felt as a need and accepted as a norm. Thus the characteristic preoccupations of modern society—relationships and their effects, various types of protest, the problems of alienation and loss of moral purpose, the search for meaning, and so on—help to shape the mood of monks and their manner of involvement in the world. To give only one fairly marginal example; it would be interesting to know how many young monks today have read the novels of Hermann Hesse, which have come so much into fashion recently because they so vividly articulate the attitudes of the intelligent drop-out, with his distrust of convention and safe mediocrity, his search for simplicity and for direct experience, his instinct for mysticism and the bizarre. Hesse’s novel “Narziss and Goldmund” even has the added appeal of being set in and around a medieval monastery, and unpoints certain basic features of the monastic vocation in a disconcertingly apt, albeit very romantic, way. There is no way nowadays of escaping the challenge of this kind of imagery, and it would be a mistake to underestimate its importance.

This generalised picture of the modern novice is relevant to the problem of celibacy in two ways. Firstly, at an intellectual level, the present generation of students is, quite simply, open to radical questions and sympathetic to radical solutions of them. The special feature of monastic vows will not prevent the problematic character of celibacy from impinging on monastic thinking. Secondly, the new and more “open” attitudes which have come into monastic life, not only through recent novices but through the general movement of renewal following Vatican II, are making monastic life more vulnerable to outside pressures. The monk is already a good deal less secure than he used to be. The opening of the monastic “enclosure” to an increasingly wide variety of pastoral involvement, the greater informality which characterises everything from liturgy to dress, and the loosening of certain traditional restraints or inhibitions under the influence of the charismatic movement and shared prayer, represent a significantly new orientation, which is bound to be problematic. The monk’s “flight from the world” is increasingly felt to be, not a somewhat elitist rejection of society, but the search for a new way of relating to it, the monastery thus becoming a focus rather than a refuge. Monastic celibacy is likely to be one of the key pressure-points of this pretty historic shift of emphasis.

Given this general context, it is not surprising that celibacy should have tended to become increasingly self-conscious in the monastic world, just as sexuality in general has in the secular world. Neither may be altogether desirable developments, but they go together; we have no choice but to situate our doctrinal and ethical thinking within a developing humane and Christian ethic of marriage and sexuality. This is why it is important to understand as clearly and as fairly as possible why traditional attitudes are being questioned. The problem of celibacy is not an isolated problem of discipline; it is part of a wider problem of ethical philosophy, not in an academic sense but in the more practical and immediate sense of philosophy of life or general outlook: life-style is probably the word.

An apology in advance to those who do not like the terminology of modern philosophical debate. It is unavoidable, especially when referring to texts written in French—a very eloquent language, but one which has a peculiar genius for using emotive vocabulary in an incantatory way, and in general for making ordinary speech (including philosophy) masquerade as poetry. It is, however, sometimes honest.

One might expect at first sight that the most serious challenge to the traditional practice of celibacy would be the traditional argument, reinforced by post-Freudian psychology, that it is simply unnatural. But this argument comes mainly from outside the Church, and carries much less weight amongst actual or potential celibates than the far more elusive questions which hover these days around the nature of human commitment (whether to celibacy, marriage or anything else in the same order), the relationship between personal choice and legal obligation, individual and community, and so forth. What may appear to be uncertainty about the
value of celibacy is very often—and this lies deeper—a question about the nature of fidelity.

Now it is very easy for those who do not see the problem simply to dismiss the questions of those who do as escapist rationalisations, or at least to give the impression that there cannot really be, all of a sudden, a new problem about celibacy which nobody had thought of before. In this way defections from the celibate life can conveniently be lumped together under the general heading of the effects of permissiveness within the Church, along with broken families, lapsing and so on.

A close study of individual cases, however, is enough to suggest that such a generalisation is inadequate, partly because so many of the defectors have been, by any judgement, excellent and dedicated priests, and partly because their personal crises have been above all (as I suggested at the beginning) crises of the mind, linked to each other by a remarkably coherent series of recurrent questions, which make a good deal of sense to a growing number of people, believers and unbelievers alike. We are faced here with a very important "credibility gap": the questions that we are dealing with appear to be phoney ones to one group of people and real ones to another. It is important for us to treat them as real questions even if we suspect that some of them are phoney, as we may certainly take it for granted that most students of modern philosophy and theology will regard them as real, and we shall be of little help to them if we close the door.

The real questions about the nature of commitment to celibacy have come in the wake of the widespread shift of mood and of outlook which may broadly be termed the existentialist movement. Even as an academic philosophy, existentialism spanned the division between faith and atheism, but its main legacy has been a way of thinking and feeling about the world and about human behaviour, together with a specialised vocabulary, which has percolated both into academic writing on subjects not specifically concerned with philosophy or theology and—perhaps more importantly—into everyday discussion about the nature of human life. A philosophy is at its most influential when it has disappeared as inauthentic (or relative) and expressed through personal relationships. As increasing crises of the mind, linked to each other by a remarkably coherent series of recurrent questions, which make a good deal of sense to a growing number of people, believers and unbelievers alike. We are faced here with a very important "credibility gap": the questions that we are dealing with appear to be phoney ones to one group of people and real ones to another. It is important for us to treat them as real questions even if we suspect that some of them are phoney, as we may certainly take it for granted that most students of modern philosophy and theology will regard them as real, and we shall be of little help to them if we close the door.

The real questions about the nature of commitment to celibacy have come in the wake of the widespread shift of mood and of outlook which may broadly be termed the existentialist movement. Even as an academic philosophy, existentialism spanned the division between faith and atheism, but its main legacy has been a way of thinking and feeling about the world and about human behaviour, together with a specialised vocabulary, which has percolated both into academic writing on subjects not specifically concerned with philosophy or theology and—perhaps more importantly—into everyday discussion about the nature of human life. A philosophy is at its most influential when it has disappeared as inauthentic (or relative) and expressed through personal relationships. As increasing crises of the mind, linked to each other by a remarkably coherent series of recurrent questions, which make a good deal of sense to a growing number of people, believers and unbelievers alike. We are faced here with a very important "credibility gap": the questions that we are dealing with appear to be phoney ones to one group of people and real ones to another. It is important for us to treat them as real questions even if we suspect that some of them are phoney, as we may certainly take it for granted that most students of modern philosophy and theology will regard them as real, and we shall be of little help to them if we close the door.

At this point it is necessary to be very specific. In attempting to outline, firstly, a commonly accepted and more or less existentialist basis of Christian thinking, and, secondly, the questions relating to celibacy which arise from it, I shall refer to several representative texts.

What is most relevant in existentialism is well summarised in Ignace Lepp's "The Christian Philosophy of Existence" (Gill, 1965). The key to true human and Christian living is, he suggests, to be found in the choice of an authentic way of life. To be inauthentic is to live superficially and to shelter behind the trivialities, the routine, the morally undemanding patterns of everyday life, and thus to fail to perceive basic moral challenges. To be authentic is to recognise these challenges, to be open to the ambiguities and the underlying anguish and imperfection of life in the world, and to respond to them by committing oneself in a continually fresh way to the values one perceives.

To be authentic in this way involves risk: a worthwhile moral decision would not be a really free choice if all the factors were known in advance. The greater the authenticity, the greater the risk. To opt for safety is to opt for inauthenticity. In the same way, the decisive moment of life, i.e. the discovery of authenticity, may come from confrontation with a great and powerful passion, which breaks down the surface structure of safe routine and reveals the true moral dimensions of existence.

This somewhat hypnotic vocabulary may be taken, from one angle, simply as an interpretation of the psychology of what an earlier generation would have called "conversion", especially when it is marked, as it is in the case of all the great existentialist writers, whether Christian or not, by a very strong emphasis on the enduring wholeness of an authentic commitment. But its basically subjective character inevitably opens up one crucial problem, which is this: how do you judge authenticity? What happens when a way of life, a choice, that had previously seemed authentic turns out to be less authentic than some freshly discovered one? By what criteria, other than the presence or absence of anguish, risk and passion, do you judge the values of competing choices?

One thing is clear: it is not enough according to this analysis simply to refer to the authority of decisions made in the past, even though these carry weight. A past that has been exposed as inauthentic (or relative) has forfeited its authority.

This position is nowadays a very normal one, and indeed probably reflects fairly accurately the mood of a whole generation. The special importance of existentialist writings is not to have founded a movement but to have defined a mood.

The same is true, a fortiori, of the Personalist wing of existentialism. An article in the TLS (28th Dec., 73) recently suggested that Martin Buber's influence had declined in the sphere of the theology of faith, but the fact remains that, since the publication of "I and Thou", it has become increasingly difficult to justify, to most people, any human mode of existence not rooted in, and expressed through, personal relationships. As in the case of existentialism proper, the vocabulary of personalism has become common currency. "Encounter and Dialogue", like Authenticity and Commitment, may still strike some minds as being the products of a nasty jargon (and they certainly deserve careful scrutiny whenever they occur more than once in the same paragraph), but they cannot be dismissed lightly. The implications of personalism with regard to celibacy are too obvious to need elaboration.
Here, then, is the “crisis of the mind”. It is as well to see that celibacy is by no means the principal victim of this crisis. Indeed, the crisis of celibacy is not really a crisis of celibacy at all, any more than the crisis of marriage is a crisis of marriage. Both are aspects of a crisis of commitment.

There is a paradox here. Existentialism is above all a philosophy of absolute commitment, and it is for this reason that any commitment which seems to fall short of the ideal will forfeit its moral stature, its emotional appeal and its rational support. This is why the argument against a rigid view of celibacy, whether in individual cases or in general, seems to many people so real, even if they have not thought it out at all fully. They are prepared to give the benefit of the doubt to anyone who appears to be abandoning one level of commitment for a deeper one. The fact that they may on occasion be victims of a mere rationalisation does not alter the profundity of their instinctive sympathy.

It is not surprising that the most cogent attacks within the Church, on the tradition of celibacy as a binding vow should be expressed largely in classical existentialist terms.

One such is Pierre de Locht’s “Les Risques de la Fidelité” (Paris, 1972). This is an explicit plea for a reconsideration of the legal obligation to celibacy. Central to his case is the conviction that human society is undergoing an intense transition, and that it is essential to define new roles in a new way; otherwise, those whose lifestyle and whose way of perceiving moral values is modern, but who are tied to systems and obligations which are not, are going to be caught increasingly in an intolerable conflict, a trap from which there is no escape except by defection. A system of personal commitment imposed from without, demanded by law and required by contract, simply does not correspond any longer to what is most vital and real (i.e., authentic) in the human spirit of today. It has steadily lost its power of attraction. A new emphasis, a new modality, must be found, to restore both to marriage and to celibacy their indispensable link with genuine liberty.

The high value placed by modern man on personal liberty, and his sense that fulfilment and happiness depend on a freely given and continually renewed choice of what is best, are facts which the modern Church tends to recognise in theory but not in practice. Why should the devil have all the best tunes? What is happening as a result is that the Church, with its juridical and static sense of stability and its apparent maintenance of a moral attitude centered on prohibitions, allows no room for the reorientation of individual lives which a true sense of the demands of the modern world makes inevitable.

Obviously there are, as there have always been, defections which arise from simple infidelity. But this is not the characteristic pattern today. Most priests who abandon celibacy do so, he argues, because their way of living out their apostolic commitment has thrown in their way a host of new factors which their original contract did not visualise. The altered sense of Christian community, the new valuation set on marriage and sexuality, the awareness of the previous failures of the Church’s ministry to become truly involved at the heart of much that is happening in society and the determination to redress this—the discovery, in short, of a new and imperative modality of priesthood: all this amounts to a deep re-orientation, both human and pastoral, which renders much of their previous formation and their previous assessment of their role inauthentic.

What appears sometimes to be a total failure on the part of the “official” Church to recognise the problem, quite apart from whether it sanctions the solution, is bound to seem either cynical, negative or shortsighted.

The nub of de Locht’s proposal of an alternative to the traditional vow of celibacy by which an undertaking is given to be bound by a law, is to be found in his reference to what he considers to be the prophetic stance of the Little Brothers of Charles de Foucauld. They do not take a vow; they make a promise of fidelity of an open and provisional kind, a commitment by which they undertake to remain faithful to the interior demand (“exigence”) which has drawn them to this moment of promise. They do not, in other words, put themselves in the position of being tied in a juridical way by the past, and they thus avoid “blocking” their future, remaining open to any possible reorientation or fresh discovery whilst being deeply committed.

The trouble with the present system is that this openness to the future is not possible. The initial contract suppresses the possibility of what might be authentic demands in the future. An authentic response is one that is given here and now; ideally, it forms a continuous pattern with a network of previous responses and is part of a process of commitment that grows deeper and richer as it is constantly renewed; but if it is merely a continuation of the past, based on the fear of breaking a contract, it simply is not true fidelity. To tie by juridical contract is to limit liberty, to guard against risk, and thereby to inhibit permanently the possibility of authentic fidelity. Liberty, risk, choice, fidelity, commitment: these are the classic components of the existentialist definition of authenticity, and for that matter of morality. de Locht’s case for a reconsideration of a merely juridical view of celibacy is a consistent and attractive one, and does not deserve to be dismissed simply as a rationalisation (though it has, at moments, the flavour of one).

It would certainly not be enough to reject his whole case because his conclusions are unacceptable. Nor, on the other hand, is it by any means necessary to accept uncritically his particular version of the existentialist case as a sort of package deal. His definition of liberty is very one-sided, and far too much of his case rests on the assumption, which is never discussed, that contracts do quite simply diminish liberty. One need not be ashamed of arguing, on his own ground, that one of the main purposes of any contract is, in a complex way, to protect, not just one liberty, but several, or of defending the psychological truism that one can deliberately choose to limit liberty at one level in order to develop it at others.
My purpose, however, is simply to present de Locht's case, not to refute it. It seems to me that he defines very well the ground on which the real debate about celibacy ought to be taking place. If we are to succeed in constructing a doctrine of monastic celibacy which reconciles the classical tradition and the modern revolution, it must be presented in terms which at once convince and attract those who belong to our own age. Many "official" statements on celibacy fail very significantly to do this. They are on the "wrong" side of the culture-gap which the reception of Humanae Vitae threw so sharply into relief.

My purpose in devoting so much of this paper to a neutral presentation of various cases currently being made for changing the status quo on celibacy has been to clarify the issues; and also to suggest that our own developing doctrine of celibacy needs, at least in some respects, to grow in the same soil as the attitudes which appear to challenge it. It is not, in other words, a matter of making a last ditch stand against new and destructive attitudes, but of having a real and positive contribution to make to what de Locht calls "the building of the new hierarchy of values which we all need". Even if it is misleading to suggest that values change, there can certainly be little doubt that our ways of perceiving them do, even in the monastic life. Insofar as we believe that celibacy is a deeply important part of monastic life, we have a duty to make this clear, for our own benefit, for that of novices with radical questions to ask, and for that of an ever incredulous world.

I should therefore like to restore the balance by suggesting briefly some areas in which our doctrine of monastic celibacy might be made more positive.

Firstly, the theological significance of the celibacy of Christ, under three headings in particular:

a. Christ's virginity as a mode of relationship with others, in particular with women. Christian tradition has tended to fight shy of analysing what is in fact, to the modern attitude, one of the most attractive features of Christ: his vulnerability and his willingness to accept the erotic in order to transform it from within. (Cf. in particular Simon's supper and the post-Resurrection meeting with Mary Magdalene.)

b. Christ's virginity and his pastoral mission. What is often called "availability" is in Christ, the exemplar, a giving of himself to universal intimacy.

c. Christ's virginity and the Eucharist. The central act of Christ, and of his Church, is, and is presented as, a kind of carnal union. The sacramental types chosen are those of a shared meal and of a ritual sacrifice, but the union achieved is a personal and carnal indwelling. Christ gives his own body in so total and radical a way that it transcends and transforms the "possible particular sexual union". Thus the sexual expressions of love are out of place in Christ's self-giving not because they are carnal but because they are particular.

d. Christ's virginity as a mode of living towards death. To the theologian, an eschatological sign and an affirmation of the total demand made on Christ by the pull of his passage to the Father.

To the existentialist, a "radical insecurity" set over against the security of sexual love, which is the supreme affirmation of the reality of life-in-this-world.

Secondly, our own second vow, Conversio Morum or "conversion of life", has always been very open to what would be called now a radical or dynamic interpretation. More than a mere contract here and now, it implies a constantly renewed process and an inner openness to the future. As an aspect of it, celibacy has a special importance under such headings as:

a. the formation of community, both for the mutual benefit of the members and as a sign of the Church;

b. the role of particular personal relationships in the community;

c. the monastic community as the focus of a wider community;

d. the human formation of monks: the balance of work and leisure, humane culture and the needs of the affective life.

Thirdly, the relationship between liberty and law in monastic life. Both the purposes of law and the nature of liberty need to be spelled out with modern attitudes in mind, e.g. legalism, conformity, and formality come less naturally now. The concluding section of the Prologue to the Rule remains our locus classicus, but maybe there are special ways of getting modern monks to the desired state of running with unspeakable sweetness of love in the way of God's commandments.

Fourthly, the relation between chastity and personal prayer. It may be a truism to suggest that it is personal prayer that changes a bachelor into a celibate. It also seems increasingly clear that the "modern" celibate, i.e. one who chooses to be vulnerable and widely committed in the humane sphere, and who is drawn rather than deterred by situations of risk, needs a very special kind of personal prayer if he is to have a strong enough interior focus. The point is too important to be dealt with adequately in a short summary, but it is probably enough to suggest that the special feature of this prayer needs to be "personalist" in character, i.e. intimate, affective, informal, frequent and inwardly demanding. I am not for a moment suggesting that these are not traditional features of monastic prayer, but rather that the modern celibate probably cannot survive without them, as his predecessors, in a sort of way, probably could.

Finally, the monastic doctrine of celibacy, standing as it does over against a worldly doctrine of studious and liberated but often unhappy sexuality, needs to be articulated confidently, and in a visionary way, as a doctrine of freedom. The principal way in which this is done is, of course, through the lives of monks, but we need explicit doctrine too. The defence of celibacy is often too defensive; we need inspiration rather than polemics.
Doubt and self-questioning may be reassured by debate, but they are only
put to flight by the discovery of a vision big enough to make them
irrelevant. Thus, much of the fairly second-rate rationalisation taking
place on both sides of the celibacy debate pales to insignificance in the
presence, for instance, of Teilhard de Chardin's short but profoundly
visionary essay on The Evolution of Chastity. This was written forty
years ago and has never been published in full, presumably because some
of the contents appear dangerous or controversial. Teilhard's unconven-
tional but fresh and spacious attempt to question the purposes of
virginity and finally to vindicate it in fully human terms seems to provide
exactly the prophetic quality that we need. The details of his approach
are not to everyone's taste, but he offers what so many are looking for—
manifest spiritual and moral grandeur, and the sense of an inner liberty
dangerously won.

In 1917, during the course of the Great War in which he fought, Père Teilhard de
Chardin felt himself called to give some living expression to man's ultimate love in
God: "The true union that you ought to seek with creatures that attract you is to be
found not by going directly to them, but by converging with them on God, sought in
and through them. It is not by making themselves more material, relying solely on
physical contacts, but by making themselves more spiritual in the embrace of God,
that things draw closer to one another." His idea of such love was extended in 1934
and crystallised in a paper he wrote in Peking, dated February 1914, "L'Evolution de la
Chasteté". In those days both Church and society were strict in their view of friend-
ship across the sexes, seeking to prefer the advice that one should avoid risk even if in
doing so one is impoverished, than the advice that one should seek enrichment even
at risk of a few splashes of mud. Père Teilhard here confessed: "By nature, if I may
say so, I was committed to the second view, and I followed it as far as I was able.
Of course I had some difficult moments, but I never felt lost or diminished." He kept
his vow scrupulously, but did not allow it to make him the less a man; and he took
care not to associate forces in others to which he was unable to respond. He said of
himself that he was blessed with women that the one possible friend is she "who
finds elsewhere, deep within herself, a serious stability in a full life, or in some great
ideal".

"L'Evolution" has not yet appeared in English dress. It is about to be published in
a collection of Teilhardian writings entitled "Towards the Future" (Collins, 1975).
Lady Collins has graciously sent us the translated text, with permission to print it in
connected extracts. The essence of its argument is this: Père Teilhard is seeking a
definition of virginity in the light of the problems confronting him in his environment.
He takes out the inadequate — a Manichaeus contempt of matter command a cold
detachment. He asks whether the highest human love does not in fact burn up what
is more absolute in us. He concludes that man's love is becoming a collective transition
towards God sought as Creator, personal loves being subsumed in it. Throughout
this fine piece there is a keen personal note which confers poignancy and added
authority to what the Jesuit priest has to say, underwriting his essential integrity of
spirit and the wholeness of his philosophy.

(Ever since religions have existed, they have always tended to express
themselves, in the most sublime of their manifestations, in the form of
chastity; and this is as true of Buddhism as it is of Christianity. We
always find that for the complete initiates, the perfect victory over
sexual attraction is ultimately the supreme mark of the triumph of spirit.
I shall not try here to contest, but rather to justify the profound value of this reaction. In its spontaneity and its universality, the call to
chastity seems to me to be too intimately derived from life's infallible
The Empiricism of the Christian Approach to Chastity

Christianity being the most progressive form of religion, to it we should look for the most developed expression of the doctrine of chastity. The practice of it today (1934) is summed up in the two injunctions that the union of the sexes is good only for the purpose of reproduction; and so the "formal effect" of the "saintly virtue" examined, though an elaborate code of conduct is always offered, based on a very small number of gospel texts and the practice of the saints, and indeed on a psychological awareness. This empiricism is not necessarily bad: for the more widely a reality is seen to be based on an achievement that is experiential in nature, the better its chances of proving fruitful and definitive — provided we try to intellectualise it.

Pere Teilhard asks: "What then are the elements, emotional or rational, which we can recognise as the basis of Christianity's cult of chastity? A whole series of them," he believes, "can be distinguished, differing quite considerably, either according to the motives they bring into operation or according to the stage of moral evolution they represent." He proceeds to plot the elements —

1. **A physiological presupposition** completely colouring the Christian view of the Fall, sanctification and grace: that sexual relations are tainted by some degradation or disfigurement. By the material conditions of its act; by the physical transports it entails; by a sort of clouding of personality that accompanies it, "passion" (man instinctively feels) has about it something of animality, of shame, of superstition, of fear, of mystery. Here we meet in its most basic and most insistent form, and its most acute, the whole intellectual and moral problem of matter. Sexuality is sinful. It is a heritage of Judaism that passed into Christianity from the start.

2. A **social element** is present whereby society seeks to control man's power of reproduction by a form of policing that uses religious taboos — in Christianity the load of penalties and threats, the stigma attached to misdemeanours of the flesh, together with a wealth of praise lavished on chastity. "With fire lurking in the human edifice, it is safer to flood the whole premises."

3. **Individual tutiorism** (besides social tutiorism, above), is so preoccupied with guilt and damnation, that the one thing that matters for the soul is to save itself, and to do so by absence of sin. From this arises a whole system of restrictive asceticism in relation to sexuality. To avoid any risk of vertigo, one has to stay as far as possible on the safe side of the cliff — one has to run away. In order not to give way to the blandishments of pleasure, in order not to be carried away by enjoyment, one has to cut away the very roots of pleasure and inflict pain on oneself: privation and penance.

This practice is in itself largely defensible. It contains the elements of a valuable prophylactic. What is more disturbing is to see it gradually transformed into a practical system, in which an absolute sanctifying quality is implicitly accorded to suffering and sacrifice. This odd inversion of natural values to all intents and purposes endorses the value of chastity conceived as a moral castration — and it has opened the door to all the extravagances of penitentialism. However — and this is to the credit of the gospel — this asceticism is justified for Christians only if so far as it develops ultimately into a refined mysticism. If the real believer nurses so apprehensive a love for the restrictive practices of chastity, it is because he sees in them the necessary means of preserving the flower of his charity. And this comes about as follows.

For every religion worthy of the name, to worship means to lose oneself entirely in God. In Christianity, however, this union of the divine takes on a precisely defined meaning: it comes into effect as a supreme marriage. The saintly soul is in some way Christ's bride. As a consequence of this fundamental concept, Christianity's empirical approach to chastity — and herein lie both its strength and its weakness — develops as an extension to man-God relationships of the ideal code accepted between earthly lovers: hence physical virginity. But most of all, and even more clearly, hence a holding-back of the powers that love commands. It is the heart that dictates chastity. We have been moving...
hitherto in the half-dark of physiology, and now at last we find a fully human clarity. Christian chastity is ultimately a transposition into religion of the lover's fidelity.

The notion of fidelity will, then, be our chief concern when we come to discuss the question of the evolution of chastity. Here it is enough to note that the Christian expression of this fidelity has so far been primarily in terms of privations, so much so that the theory of Christian sanctification—rightly based on sublimation of love—tends to culminate in a separatist view of matter. True Christianity, far from condemning matter, has defended it against monists and Manichaeans, drawing nourishment from sacramental practice and living in the hope of a resurrection. Yet care for the body is combined with an odd mistrust of the earth's resources. Creation is good, yet it harbours a hidden perversion—so that again we confront the complexity of the still insufficiently intellectualised notion of the Fall. So the Christian's rule (as the Imitation says) will be to take less rather than more, to sublimate matter by attenuating it. Flesh is not an atmosphere round spiritual self, but a duplicate: “this satellite, mysteriously associated by the Creator with the spirit, is inconstant and dangerous. Above all, it is wilful. We must hold it in subjection, even when ministering to it. Logically the saint will attain the maximum self-perfection by a minimum use of matter—and, most particularly, of matter in its most virulent form: the feminine.”

A New Moral Conception of Matter

Though Christianity constitutes the surest defence of chastity and its richest storehouse, it by no means follows that the ideal of virtue which it propagates has retained for our modern minds the vigour and precision of its first magnetic charm. The moral value of chastity (or at least the discipline) was seriously challenged by the Reformation and remains in doubt for many today.

Underlying the modern mind's objection to the gospel code of purity, and running deeper than any pagan libertinarian thought, we can distinguish, I believe, a re-awakening of the religion of spirit. On the one hand, the whole physiological and social side of chastity is again being challenged: the importance of virginity or material integrity of the body has become as unintelligible to us as respect for a taboo. And on the other hand, for reasons which we shall try to analyse later, we are finding a successful venture into experience more attractive than preservation of innocence; we now estimate the moral value of actions by the spiritual impulse they provide.

In its extreme form, disregard for the material side of chastity is expressed in a radical, and ingenuous, solution. “In short,” we often hear, “sexuality has no significance at all from the moral and religious point of view; you might as well speak of running your digestion on moral principles. So far as his sexual side is concerned, man must no doubt have a care for health, and exercise temperance. A controlled use will give him balance and an added zest for action. But by no stretch of imagination can we agree that physical chastity has anything to do with spiritual virtue. There is no direct relationship between sanctity and sexuality.”

I cannot accept this idea that two independent variables, “spirit” and “matter”, operate in the domain of moral growth. It is not in conformity either with the deep instinct which has always made men suspect that something more valuable than a mere self-control underlies chastity—or, quite simply, with the all-embracing laws of biological development. Moreover, the idea itself is no more than an elementary form of impatience, a mere gesture, produced as part of the reaction which makes the modern mind question the pre-eminence of chastity. There is another idea which seems to me to be much more connected with the basic evolution of our thought. This (the most important basis of psychoanalysis) is the energy which fuels our interior life and determines its fabric, is in its primitive roots of a passionate nature. Like every other animal, man is essentially a tendency towards union that brings mutual completion; he is a capacity for loving, as Plato said long ago. It is from this primitordial impulse that the luxuriant complexity of intellectual and emotional life develops and becomes more intense and diverse. For all their height and the breadth of their span, our spiritual conceptions have their roots deep in the corporeal. It is from man's storehouse of passion that the warmth and light of his soul arise, transfigured. It is there, initially, that we hold concentrated, as in a seed, the finest essence, the most delicately adjusted spring, governing all spiritual development.

When we have finally weighed things up, it is apparent that only spirit is worth our pursuit; but deep within us there exists a system of linkages, both sensitive and profound, between spirit and matter. It is not only that the one, as the Christian moralists say, supports the other: it is born of the other, and so we should not simply say, “To lighten the burden of the body, be abstemious”, but, “To maintain the drive of spirit, fill up with fuel.” Underlying the religion (or moral science) of spirit, a new moral conception of matter is asserting itself.

The idea that there is a universal genesis of spirit through matter (the idea, in other words, of a spiritual power of matter) has origins which outflank the problem of chastity. It arises from that vast experience of mankind which, in the course of a century, has given a completely new picture of the world: the discovery of universal time and evolution. Until the eighteenth century, or thereabouts, the debate about the principles of moral science was confined to two very simply distinguished groups: the spiritual and the material. The latter claimed that the business of life was to enjoy nature as they found it. The former urged that we must, on the contrary, hasten to shake off the dust of material things. Both, however, agreed in admitting implicitly that the

---

8 The author, it will be observed, has transcended the opposition between matter and spirit which destroys human unity. (Ed.)
The world had never moved—or, at any rate, had come to a final halt. It was then that through all the channels of thought and experience there entered into us the consciousness that the "universe around us" was still functioning as a vast reservoir of vital potentialities. It used to be believed that matter was either stabilized or spent; and it was found to be inexhaustibly rich in new psychological energies. It used to be thought that nothing essential was left to be discovered; and now we realize that everything is still waiting to be found. The "perfect" came uncommonly close to rejecting the world like a squeezed lemon: we shudder at the idea of that wasteful gesture, which would have brought to a dead stop the conception, still being developed, of spirit.

Then we revised other judgments of value in the light of this discovery, and found that the transformation of our intellectual views on matter was gradually, both in fact and logically, invading the domain of our affective and emotional life. Woman is, for man, the symbol and personification of all the fulfilments we look for from the universe. The theoretical and practical problem of the attainment of knowledge has found its natural "climate" in the problem of the sublimation of love. At the term of the spiritual power of matter, lies the spiritual power of the flesh and of the feminine.

This, then, appears to be the source of divergence between the traditional cult of chastity and modern sympathies. The old Christian code rested on the presupposition that woman is for man essentially an instrument of generation. The moralists saw woman as existing for propagation of the race. But what of woman's spiritual fertility? She brings fullness of being, sensibility and self-revelation to the man who has loved her. When man had conquered the fight for life, then he could become aware of and develop such spiritual energies. The new "freedom" of morals is in fact a symptom of man's higher search for spiritual union.

The old doctrine of chastity assumed that such a drive or search could be diverted directly towards God, without need of support from the creature. This fails to take into account that such energy, still largely potential (as are all the other spiritual powers of matter), also required a long period of development in its natural plane. Even now, man has not yet been wholly revealed to himself by woman, nor is the reciprocal revelation complete. And while the evolutionary process continues, it is impossible to separate one from the other; not in isolation—whether married or unmarried—but in pair unities do the masculine and feminine of human nature rise up to God. It is said that there can be no sexes in spirit, but that saying arises from a radical misunderstanding of the duality found in the divided being. However "sublimated" man may become, he never becomes a eunuch. Spirituality does not come down upon a "monad" but upon the human "dyad".

The Christian theory of sanctity fails to solve or even express the general question of the feminine—it is for this reason that we find the old discipline of virtue repugnant. Whereas it was formerly urged that the natural manifestations of love should be reduced as much as possible, now we see that the real problem is how we may harness the energy they represent and transform them. Our new ideal is not to cut back but to go beyond.

The Spirit of Chastity

Once we grant the full meaning of the words: "spiritual power of matter", we must abandon the classic distinction between holiness of body and holiness of spirit. Creation is not a barrier between God and man, but a milieu in which man may find God. Things are not sacred or profane; they are directional, ascending to union, or descending to confining egotism. Holiness does not lie in self-deprivation, but in plunging into the flood of created energies, to uplift and to uplift. This is no less true of chastity: detachment by passing through, in perfect harmony with the incarnation, is sharing in things and then carrying them up. As St Paul said, "he who is ascended is he also who ascended... that he might fill all things", divinizing creation. More and more, this is granted today: man draws more upon terrestrial nourishments, using the joys of artistic creation, the conquests of thought, the emotional excitement of discovery. These broadening of personality are accepted as sanctifying or patient of sanctification. One tree, however, still in Eden carries the initial prohibition, the tree of the feminine. Either we can have woman only in marriage, or we must run away from the feminine.

Why is this the last prohibition to stand? Two answers; one comes from practical prudence, the other from an ideal.

In practice, the feminine is included among natural products that are forbidden, as being too dangerous; a disturbing scent, an intoxicating draught. Since the beginning of time, men have been astounded by the uncontrollable power of this element; and in the end, being unable to suppress its use entirely, our mentors have come to limit it to essential cases. There is no distrust (though logically there might well be, perhaps) of the passions for ideas or for numbers, or even of a keen interest in stars or nature. Because these realities are assumed (quite wrongly) to appeal only to the reason, they are regarded as harmless and easily spiritualized. Sexual attraction, on the contrary, is frightening because of the complex and obscure forces it may at any moment bring into operation. Love, it would seem, is a monster slumbering in the depths of our being, and, throughout our lives, we can be safe from it only if we are careful not to disturb its sleep.

I am far from denying the destructive and disintegrating forces of passion. I will go so far as to agree that apart from the reproductive function, men have hitherto used love, on the whole, as an instrument of self-corruption and intoxication. But what do these excesses prove? Because fire consumes and electricity can kill, are we to stop using them? The feminine is the most formidable of the forces of matter. True enough. "Very well, then," says the moralists, "we must keep out of its way." "Not at all," I reply, "we must master it." In every domain of the
The husband must keep and strengthen for the wife the privileged position we ourselves. When man centres his heart on a woman, he does not thereby lose the feminine star. It can shine, and with even greater brilliance along the same plane. Lovers, affectionately replete in relation to other human persons, may well be exalted by their duality to the higher attraction of God. A noble passion lends wings: the Apostle's reproach that loving "divides" a man is only true of woman when she is physically loved and made source of a family. There is another love which confers greater freedom of spirit: the more spiritual an affection is, the less it monopolizes—and the more it acts as a spur to action. The feminine, more powerful than other energies contained in matter, is more subject to the triumphant domination of spirit—and so much needed as a source of Christian vigour.

Chastity, then, is a virtue of participation and conquest, and not a schooling in restriction and avoidance. Purity is often pictured to us as a fragile crystal which will tarnish or be shattered if it is not protected from rough handling and the light. In fact, it is more like the flame which assimilates everything and brings it up to the standard of its own incandescence. Omnia munda mundis, "to the pure all things are pure": broadly speaking, that is perfectly true. In the relationship between spirit and body everything is, indeed, a matter of "potential", "Burn or be burned." Volatilize matter or be corrupted by it. Throughout the whole range of things, such is the law of life: a law which we cannot conceivably avoid if we are to develop the most sublime peak of our being.

Naturally enough, a price has to be paid for this achievement. In our approaches to woman, and when we come into contact with her, we are enveloped in a sort of indistinct glow of illumination—the instinctive feeling that now a new world awakens us and is about to develop in the depths of matter—it only now we fold the wings of spirit, and surrender ourselves to it. This, in an emotional form (which is much more insidious than the intellectual form), is the "materialist illusion". So: if we wish to make the mystery of the flesh fully our own, we must make a considered choice which will be an expression in our own consciousness of the very effort of creation, and so discredit the false evidence of the mirage which tends to drag us down. The truth is, indeed, that love is the threshold of another universe. Beyond the vibrations with which we are familiar, the rainbow-like range of its colours is still in full growth. But, for all that fascination that the lower shades have for us, it is only towards the "ultra" that the creation of light advances. It is in these invisible and, we might almost say, immaterial zones that we can look for true initiation into unity. The depths we attribute to matter are no more than the reflection of the peaks of spirit.

Both human experience and human thought would appear to guarantee this.

The whole problem now (in theory a secondary problem, but an extremely important one in practice) is to estimate to what degree, as

---

*Fundamentally, there is a confrontation between two opposing theories of chastity—two ideas of purity. One side says, "Above all, break no rule—even at the cost of some contamination." The other side says, "Above all, increase your righteousness, even at the cost of some contamination." I need hardly say that, to my mind, it is the latter who have held the truth and will be vindicated by the future.*
the “spectrum” turns towards colours of an ever higher quality; the lower radiations continue to shine—or whether they are extinguished. The centre of loving attraction and possession shifts progressively towards the spiritual; and if beings are to attain one another, they are obliged to seek one another at a progressively higher level. But, if they are to ensure the fullness of this sublimation—if they are not to cut the channels which convey to them the spiritual powers of matter—from what initial level are they to start taking possession of one another? How much of the body is needed for an optimum of spirit? And so our analysis of the creative function of chastity—spirit brings us back to the problem of determining the precise meaning and value of virginity.

The Value of Virginity

The material side of virginity, though important for primitive people, has completely ceased to have any significance for us. This, the physical aspect of the virtue has become meaningless to us. Now we must consider whether virginity has not some hidden spiritual value, deeper than physical integrity, for the sake of which we may have better reasons to foster and respect it.

On first consideration, the idea of a sanctity that attaches particularly to continence does not seem specially appropriate to the moral significance we have just attributed to chastity. If chastity is a spirit which requires nourishment, why cut it off from the most vigorous of its sources? Is not the gift of the body the complete and natural form in which the natural power of matter offers itself for sublimation? And is not spirit waiting to be produced, like a spark, from the shock of this encounter? And the great surges of energy released by physical love—is it not precisely these which it should be our first concern to stimulate, to master, and to transform?

Left to my own judgment (writes Père Teilhard), I am unclear about what is allowable. For obvious reasons, physical union has traditionally been associated exclusively with the idea of material generation. A kind of “theological biology” still teaches that this is in conformity with the natural law, and could not be otherwise—as though “the natural order” were ready-made rather than a balance which is trying to establish itself in course of evolution. Perhaps, as the Russian novelist wrote, “we shall in the end find another way of loving”, spiritual fecundity becoming the first and even sole justification of union: union for the sake of the work, or of the idea. Is not the spiritual use of the flesh precisely what many men of genius, men who have been true creators, have instinctively found and adopted, without asking moralists for their approval? Is it not from such allegedly impure sources that a life has been drawn which here and now sustains those of us to whom conservation is of prime importance?

Looking at the problem abstractly, such is the position I cannot but anticipate. And at the same time, were I to have to leave the field of theory and attempt, or even advise, this practice of spiritual—physical love, I feel that I would be stopped by an insurmountable obstacle—by some indefinable instinct in which I believe I can distinguish something more than the mechanical bent imposed on my soul by continual subjectio to the prohibition “Thou shalt not” repeated for generation after generation. And then I wonder whether it would be a release, or only a retrograde step to snap the links of moral duty and reverent admiration that have formed around the ideal of virginity in the course of centuries of human experience. May there not be some hidden reason which ensures that, however omnipotent spirit may be in the domain of chastity, some physical source of vigour shall not be subject to its transforming power—precisely because of the perfection of chastity?

Moralists (as we noted earlier) often seem to us to use an argument based on personal or collective safety to justify exclusion of the flesh from affective relationships—or at any rate a tendency to reduce its active part to a minimum. It is something we must deny ourselves, for fear lest we abuse it; that we must cut ourselves off from, so that we may not be absorbed by it. We must force ourselves over to the right, to make sure that we do not slip to the left; climb, to make sure that we do not fall. By themselves, let me repeat, these reasons are not sufficient. In the first place it is doubtful whether the method proposed would be effective. To force often means to distort; and you can even break a thing by forcing it. No force, and no idea, has ever been conquered by repression—to do so you have to harness it. And secondly, if there is one point on which all religions are in agreement, and on which Christianity in particular has staked its authority, it is that physical chastity brings with it a sort of absolute superiority. If, therefore, we wish to preserve the essence of traditional practice, it is indispensable to disclose some perfection that resides in virginity by nature.

This is possible. The most penetrating interpretation we can give of the world is to regard it as a movement of universal convergence within which the plurality of matter is consummated in spirit. It takes into account the creative role of erotic attraction. It provides a formula to disentangle the complex difficulties presented by the biological, intellectual and moral evolution of the world: progress infers unification. God is then seen as the supreme centre in which the multiplicity of lower forms of being becomes an organic whole—the focus at which matter is consummated in spirit.

At the point at which life, in the present world, has arrived, the spiritualizing unification of human monads is governed by two attractive forces, which are the same in nature but differ in value. These are the mutual love of man and woman, and divine love. As each element seeks to find fulfilment in unity, it is courted simultaneously by the forces of passion and by mystical forces, working in association. The element must, simultaneously, complete its human unity in the feminine, and its cosmic unity in God. In both, there is fundamentally the same energy of convergence, the same love. The two forces do not, however, pull together in harmony immediately. How, then, are we to combine them?
and so obtain a resultant force which will give the maximum spiritual “yield”? That, in fact, is the problem raised by chastity.

A first solution that comes to mind is the very one we suggested at the beginning. Initially, man will gravitate to woman. He will take possession of her in the fullest sense; and it is the flame which explodes from this first union which will leap up towards God. First, there is the contact of the two elements in human love; and then the dual ascent towards the greater divine centre. This process, we were saying, seems to have the advantage of most fully releasing, for God, the spiritual potentialities of passion. Without any doubt, it has been responsible for the appearance on earth of great truths and great beauties: but are there reasons why we should be wary of it?

I can see only one—but it is one that could have great weight. It is this: we have just assumed that man’s potentialities are magnificently released by physical love. What would appear to have been always dormant in our souls is awakened and leaps forward. Is this completely true? Another possibility suggests itself; that a sort of “short-circuit” is produced in the dazzling gift of the body—a flash which burns up and deadens a portion of the soul. Something is born, but it is for the most part used up on the spot. What constitutes the peculiar intoxication that comes with complete giving may very well be that in it we burn away a part of our “absolute”. And so a second solution to the problem of chastity comes to mind. Why should there be this distinction of two phases in union: first one gift, and then another? Is it really possible, without loss, to give oneself twice? The time has perhaps come when, in conformity with the inflexible laws of evolution, man and woman—on whom life has laid the charge of advancing to the highest possible degree the spiritualization of the earth—will have to abandon that way of possessing one another which has hitherto been the only rule for living beings. Retaining of their mutual attraction only that part of it which causes them to rise as they come closer, why should they not direct forwards the impulse in which they grasp one another? No immediate contact, but convergence at a higher level: the moment of complete giving would then coincide with their meeting with the divine. This retains our faith in the spiritual value of the flesh—but at the same time it finds room for virginity. Chastity becomes in essence a delayed gift.

So we have two roads, and each has much to commend it. Congenitally (Père Teilhard writes) I am committed to the second; ... ahead to infinity; and to possess one another more fully in spirit, the lovers are obliged to forsake the body and seek each other in God. Virginity rests on chastity as thought upon life: through a reversal of direction, or at one particular point of coincidence.

It needs time. So physical union will retain its necessity for the race; but its spiritual quality is henceforth defined by the higher union it comes to sustain. Love is undergoing a change of state; and all religion tells us that in this man’s collective passage to God is being charted. This is Père Teilhard’s view of the evolution of chastity.

In theory this transformation of love is possible. It merely needs the pull of the personal divine centre felt with such force as to dominate the natural attraction that tends to cause pairs of human monads to rush prematurely into one another’s arms. In practice, difficulties may be so great that I will be judged over-ingenious if not absurd. Surely experience tells us that spiritual love always ends in grossness, that man always has his feet on earth? Has anyone ever thought of giving man wings?

Yes, I shall answer: some madmen have had such a dream; and that is why we have today conquered the skies. What paralyses life is lack of faith and lack of audacity. The difficulty lies not in solving problems but in expressing them. And so we cannot avoid this conclusion: it is biologically evident that to gain control of passion and so make it serve spirit must be a condition of progress. Sooner or later, then, the world will brush aside our incredulity and take this step: because whatever is more true comes out into the open, and whatever is better is ultimately realized.

The day will come when, after harnessing the ether, the winds, the tides, gravitation, we shall harness for God the energies of love. And, on that day, for the second time in the history of the world, man will have discovered fire.

Alors, une deuxième fois, dans l’histoire du Monde, l’Homme aura trouvé le Feu.

(Translated by René Hague; extracted by A.J.S.)
CHRIST AFTER THE FLESH
2 Corinthians 5.16 in the Fathers and in the Middle Ages.1

REV PROFESSOR COLIN MORRIS

On the surface this is a rather technical issue; but the author's intention is wider, for it is to bring out the way in which the use of this text illustrates profoundly important devotional changes in and during the course of the life of the Church. It may be taken it is to bring out the way in which the use of this text illustrates profoundly important
devotional changes in and during the course of the life of the Church. It may be taken

The meaning could hardly be simpler. The first disciple knew Christ after the flesh when he lived and died among them, but that historical phase is now over: "now we do not know Christ crucified."2 As a statement of historical fact, that can hardly be denied, but any reader with a knowledge of later history will be surprised at the absence of any reference to our devotional participation in the crucifixion of Christ. This omission, however, seems to be quite deliberate. In another passage in his Commentary on St Luke, Ambrose stressed that to meditate upon the Cross was to look in the wrong place:3

Therefore we ought not to seek thee upon the earth, nor in the earth, nor after the flesh, if we would find thee; for now we do not know Christ after the flesh.

Stephen accordingly did not seek upon the earth, and saw thee standing at the right hand of God; but Mary, who sought in the earth, could not touch thee. Stephen touched, because he sought in heaven; Stephen saw his absent Lord, but Mary did not see him present among the angels.

The Christian message was that the suffering of the Cross had been overcome, and the believer's faith must be rooted in the divine power. As KurzLC said,

now that bodily infirmity has ceased in him all faith rests in the power of God.

At this point we encounter an overlap with the second meaning of the text. To know Christ after the flesh meant to know him in an elementary manner. The Church necessarily includes beginners, and as the popular influence of Christianity grew, so did the proportion of un instructed members within the Church. The passages just cited from

2 Corinthians 5.16

instructed members within the Church. The passages just cited from

1 X.160 (Sources Chrotiennes 52, p. 209).
2 De Fide 111.23 (Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum, CSEL 78, p. 116).
3 Ep. Eus. see, locum VII.121; Et quia Deus saporatem fudens, deduxit et lexam dicens: nunc enim crucifixum iam non nouimus Christum. Cf Ambrosiaster, Comm. in Ep. Paul, (CSEL 81) (3, p. 239); Verum est quia Christus resurgens a mortuis iam cessat in crassis mortalium, cessat in corpore, etcet et patro moris. See also Rufinus, de Pentecoste 5 (CSEL 45, pp. 146-7) and Priscillian-Peregrinus (XII, CSEL 18, pp. 114-7).
4 X.160 (Sources Chrotiennes 53, p. 209).
5 Ep. Ed. 111 (CSEL 31, p. 388) Similar comment by Gaudenzius, Tract xi.40 (CSEL 66, p. 175) Cf Augustine, Tract in Ib., 953, Corpus Christianorum Ser Lat., 50, p. 578. Cf: hos enim adhuc est mortales ... nihil semper petratis ac stillo, hanc autem donare: hac ergo Christum, id estalem Christum, cum transisset de loco mundo ad Patrem, non est am the usual way of the apostle, but they continued side by side throughout the whole ecclesiastical tradition, and almost no one attempted to relate the words to their situation in the life of St Paul. The verse was read as if it were being spoken by contemporary Christians.

The most direct use of the text is to be found in St Ambrose. To him it meant that the age of the crucifixion was over and the time of the resurrection had come:

The Son is in the flesh. When I say "in the flesh" or "on earth," I am speaking as of the times of the Gospel, for now we do not know Christ after the flesh.4

The meaning could hardly be simpler. The first disciple knew Christ after the flesh when he lived and died among them, but that historical phase is now over: "now we do not know Christ crucified." As a statement of historical fact, that can hardly be denied, but any reader with a knowledge of later history will be surprised at the absence of any reference to our devotional participation in the crucifixion of Christ. This omission, however, seems to be quite deliberate. In another passage in his Commentary on St Luke, Ambrose stressed that to meditate upon the Cross was to look in the wrong place:5

Therefore we ought not to seek thee upon the earth, nor in the earth, nor after the flesh, if we would find thee; for now we do not know Christ after the flesh.

Stephen accordingly did not seek upon the earth, and saw thee standing at the right hand of God; but Mary, who sought in the earth, could not touch thee. Stephen touched, because he sought in heaven; Stephen saw his absent Lord, but Mary did not see him present among the angels.

The Christian message was that the suffering of the Cross had been overcome, and the believer's faith must be rooted in the divine power. As KurzLC said,

now that bodily infirmity has ceased in him all faith rests in the power of God.

At this point we encounter an overlap with the second meaning of the text. To know Christ after the flesh meant to know him in an elementary manner. The Church necessarily includes beginners, and as the popular influence of Christianity grew, so did the proportion of un instructed members within the Church. The passages just cited from

2 Corinthians 5.16
Ambrose and Ruricius show a desire to lead people from the contemplation of the Cross to a more spiritual religion, and John Cassian clearly identified "beginners' religion" with meditation upon the crucified Christ. He wrote, "... when faith has already passed beyond the beginning of the journey and is no longer in need of that, from which nonetheless all who desire to arrive at the truth and to abide for ever in eternal life must begin and progress in the journey, starting from Him." 10

The scholars who participated in the revival of biblical learning after 1050 had access to both these traditions of patristic interpretation, but the view of Augustine was the more readily available because of the magnificent collection of his exegesis of St Paul, arranged in the form of a commentary by Faurius of Lyons in the ninth century. This provided a full discussion of the text which could easily be consulted, and as a result the new generation of commentators were inclined to read 2 Corinthians 5.16 in an Augustinian way. There were also changes in the whole life of the Church which led to new readings of the text. The problem of "beginner's religion", which was already a major one in the time of Augustine, was now even more pressing. The conversion of Europe meant that there was a whole continent full of un instructed Christians, and the presentation of the Gospel to these multitudes exercised many thinking churchmen. Moreover, the veneration of the cross of Christ and of the relics of the passion, the imitation of the Lord and a compassionate meditation on His sufferings were all becoming a dominant feature of popular religion. 10 In the age of Crusades and of pilgrimage to the Holy Sepulchre, there would not be much enthusiasm for asserting with Ambrose that "now we do not know Christ crucified".

The new age did not break away from the basis of patristic interpretation. The formula that to know Christ after the flesh = to know Christ on the Cross = to know Christ in an elementary way, which lay behind both the Ambrojan interpretation and the Orient-oriental approach, was also unchallenged. However, an uncomfortable idea to hold, in a world in which reverence for the crucified humanity was widespread and esteemed. Twelfth-century writers therefore seized upon Augustine's eschatological interpretation, added their own embellishments and took it even further; anything, in short, to avoid the damaging conclusion that the cult of the Cross was a primitive religion which the true believer would abandon. In the commentaries, the dominance of Augustine was almost complete. The principal commentators were content to quote, with only slight additions, his exegesis of 2 Corinthians 5.16, and notably the passage from Contra Faustum. This pattern was followed substantially by Lanfranc of Bec, the Laon school, Hervé of Bourg-lieu, and Peter Lombard. The extent to which scholars moved, in the new circumstances, to innovations beyond the ideas of Augustine may be seen first in the divergent approaches of Anselm of Laon and Peter Abelard; and then in the Cistercian writers.

10 Collations X.6 (Sources chretiennes 54, p. 29-80).
11 Augustine was not unique in finding an eschatological meaning in the text. Jerome had done so in In Epist. LV. 144 (Corp Christ Ser Lat 728, p. 225). This is however a much briefer reference.
12 Augustine was well aware that the view that Christ's infirmity had been superseeded did not logically support the Manicheans' contention that his flesh had been uncorrupted. However, some writers had undoubtedly moved towards such a view: Usque ad corrosionem supinis fuit infinitissimi in Christo... (Ambrosiaster, loc cit.).
13 Contra Faustum XI.7 (CSEL 28, p. 324).
14 de Doctrina Christiana 1.82 (CSEL 80, p. 20).
15 On these developments, see E. Werner, Poques Christi, Leipzig 1856 and R. W. Southern, "The Making of the Middle Ages", London 1955, chapter V, "Reverence for the crucifix was being attacked by new heretics of a Manichee kind in the Catharist or Albigensian movement, and some writers appreciated the help which Augustine's Contra Faustum gave them. Hervé of Bourg-lieu, adopting the passage from Contra Faustum, stated that "Christus secundum haereticos ideo non habuit carnem" (P.L. 181 c. 1049 A).
The twelfth century was characterised by an interest in individual psychology and personal experience; an interest which was rooted in Augustine, but which had developed beyond him. It is natural to find this interest reflected in the use of our text. The commentary produced by the school of Laon located the words in their setting in the biography of St Paul:

Christ was mortal as I am, and so I thought, when I was an unbeliever, that he was just a man.18

This was a striking imaginative leap, analogous to the way in which Ambrose's approach: to know Christ after the flesh was an elementary, indeed pre-Christian stage. We are told that Anselm of Laon disapproved of emotional lamentations before the crucifix on Good Friday.19 This may help to explain the brash attack on him by Abelard, who criticised him for what would nowadays be called "lack of relevance".20 Abelard certainly had a very different attitude, as he explained in his Easter Day sermon: 21

What is strange about it, then, if we spend those two days of the Lord's passion and burial primarily in compassionate grief, that after weeping we may laugh the more, nor do we now remember the Lord's torments since the glory of the resurrection has come? That is why the apostle says, though we have known Christ after the flesh, yet now henceforth know we him no more. As if he said openly: if we do not doubt that the body of Christ was once in the flesh, that is to say humble and passible or mortal, now we know that it has been made as it were spiritual, nor do we fix our attention so much on the infirmity which went before as on the glory of the resurrection which has followed.

The weight here is placed heavily on the individual's compassionate participation with the Lord, in the sorrow of the passion and the joy of the resurrection. Abelard's hymns for Holy Week, in the hymn-book which he prepared for Heloise's convent about 1135, expressed this intensely personal spirituality. Each of them ends with the same verse:

Christus fuit mortalis sicut ego, per quod cum putavi hominem esse tantum, dum cram infidelis (P.L.114 c. 559 A).

P. Dronke, "Poetic Individuality in the Middle Ages", Oxford 1970, p. 132: "One aspect of Samson had never been seen till Abelard saw it; Samson as a man who suffered, a tragic human being." I have tried to depict some of these aspects of twelfth-century sensibility in "The Discovery of the Individual 1050-1200", London 1972, chapter 4.


He had a marvellous flow of words, but his meaning was trivial and in reasoning empty. When he set his fire, he filled his house with smoke, but produced no light. Historia Calamitatum cap. 5 (P.L.173 c. 125).

Sermon XIII, P.L.178 c. 469 AB.

So make us have compassion on thee Lord, That we may sharers of the glory be: Heavy with weeping may the three days pass, To win the laughter of thine Easter Day.24

The same element of individual religion is found in a commentary on 2 Corinthians 5.16 which emanates from the school of Abelard:

Though we have known Christ after the flesh, that is after the infirmity of the flesh, yet now we know him no more. He now has an immortal and impassible body, just as those who live in him, that is to imitate his life, will achieve at length the same glory of impassibility.25

One would regard that as a thoroughly patristic passage (Ambrose with a touch of Augustine's eschatology), were it not for the significant phrase, "id est usum illius imitari", Participation in the sufferings and resurrection of Christ was seen as essentially a question of imitating his example. In the school of Abelard, we are united in compassion with the suffering Christ and by our actions we attain the hope of sharing in his risen life.

A still more striking use of the text is to be found in the great spiritual writers of the Cistercian order, St Bernard of Clairvaux and William of St Thierry. One would expect them to be content with the formulation of Cassian, quoted earlier, for they were very familiar with his Collations. Moreover, the Cistercian movement was devoted to world-rejection, to the salvation of those who would give themselves up to the attainment of spiritual maturity, and it would not be surprising to find them welcoming a sharp contrast between the religion of beginners and that of the elite. The outline of Cassian's teaching was certainly preserved.

The first stage in the life of prayer consisted of meditation upon the bodily images of the humanity, birth, passion and resurrection of the Lord; this was to know Christ after the flesh, and the aim was to advance beyond it to a spiritual union.26 Bernard could on occasion stress the temporary character of the first phase.27 Yet the final result is extremely unlike Cassian, whose views have been transformed by those of Augustine and by the spirit of twelfth-century humanism. The initial stage is spoken of warmly, and expressed as the necessary starting point, the point of contact created by God in His purpose of love:

I think this was the special reason why the invisible God wished to be seen in the flesh, and as a man to converse with men. It was to attract all the affections of fleshly men, who could love only in a fleshly way, first to the saving love of his flesh, and thus to lead them by stages to a spiritual love.28

14 A. Landgraf, Commentarius Cantabrigiensis in Epistolas Pauli, Notre Dame 1939, ii, p. 262.
15 William of St Thierry, Epistolæ ad fratres de Monte Doli XIV.43 (P.L.184 c. 336 AB).
16 In de Psalmis utriusque testamenti, cap. 92 (P.L.178 c. 380 A): carnale omnis necessitudo sit defutura, carnisque amor amore spiritus abscendorum. The spirituality of this work is significantly different, at least in its expression, from that of the Sermons on the Song of Songs.
17 Sermon 20 in Cant., 6 (P.L.183 c. 870 R).
18 Sermon XIII, P.L.178 c. 469 AB.
It is characteristic of the Cistercians that they spoke more frequently of fleshly love than of fleshly knowledge, and the term carnis amor, which had in the past had a pejorative connotation, could be used by William of St Thierry to refer to the natural love of family, which he saw as a proper first step in the ascent to God.

This use of the text caused some embarrassment to the Cistercians, for it was rather evident, on an ordinary reading, that Paul was not intending to recommend to believers the fleshly knowledge of Christ. Bernard courageously tackled this problem in a passage in which he began for it was rather evident, on an ordinary reading, that Paul was not thinking of the natural love of family, which he saw as a way to recommend to believers the fleshly knowledge of Christ. Over the centuries, the Church had in that sense become a "beginners' Church"; the elementary stage of Christian experience having turned the norm of spirituality. In that sense the medieval Church, in spite of its elitist inclinations, had adjusted itself more fully to a "comprehensive system" of religious education than is often supposed. This development was connected with the growth of veneration for the Passion of Christ, which by 1100 had become a major instrument in the instruction of the masses. The devotion for the crucified Jesus, which had existed only intermittently and in an undeveloped form in the earlier centuries, had come to inspire a new understanding of these words may thus be found some of the roots of western humanism.

While the field of eschatological expectation is however a particularly difficult one because patristic tradition had not defined at all clearly the limits of permissible belief. It would therefore be premature to take the statement above as a general description of twelfth century or even of Cistercian eschatology.
For everything that lives is holy, life delights in life.

William Blake (1757-1827) has been hymned before in these pages, notably by an eminent Blake scholar and poet, Kathleen Raine (Summer 1971, 70-84; Summer 1972, 48-63; Spring 1974, 37-56). He continues to gather prestige under the attentions of scholars, poets and painters alike. His paintings are coveted as never before. There is, for instance, a set of six paintings in the Stirling Maxwell Collection at Pollok House (Corporation of Glasgow) which are the envy of connoisseurs and would fetch very high prices on the open market; they were acquired from the sale of Thomas Rust's collection in London in 1853. They include a very beautiful pair of Adam naming the beasts, and Eve appropriately naming the birds, the pair at that time being bought for ten shillings.

What follows is a review article of two recent Blake studies, the first a festschrift series of essays of which the fourth, by Dr F. R. Leavis has been selected for particular comment; others include "Blake's early poetry", "Blake's Godliness imagination", "Blake's Songs of Spring", "Christ's Body", "Blake's Marriage of Heaven & Hell", "Blake's figures of despair", and interestingly "Blake in the Wilderness: a closer look at his reputation, 1827-1965". And secondly, the new study by Thomas R. Frosch, "The Awakening of Albion: the Renovation of the Body in the Poetry of William Blake", a study from Cornell University.

The reviewer is a poet, philosopher and writer in his own right, and an English master at Ampleforth. The illustration of Albion in adoration is taken from The Nonesuch Press edition (1925), edited by Geoffrey Keynes, of "The Writings of William Blake". Compare this with Blake's Dante Adoring Christ from the Paradise Illustrations (first book under review, Pl. 37, p. 153).

This sumptuously produced volume offers a broad conspectus of views on Blake's composite art, by way of presenting a Festschrift in honour of Sir Geoffrey Keynes, doyen of Blake editors and scholars. Its contributions are described as "ranging from Blake's earliest to his latest poems and designs, and including considerations of his iconography, his intellectual milieu, his poetic diction, his religious conceptions, and his critical reputation, as well as detailed interpretations of particular works". Given such largesse, there is perhaps some excuse for singling out one essay for particular consideration—that by Dr F. R. Leavis on "Justifying One's Evaluation of Blake". When set beside the kind of Blake essay that suffers from hyperbole of the footnote—a melody most insistent to monks—of the kind of reductive analysis that tells us precisely what the Serpent is doing in forcing entry into the Chapel of Gold, this essay has the weight and durability of an authoritative statement. At the same time, it provokes, even if it does not invite, an alternative evaluation; for Dr Leavis would rescue Blake from the mills of the mythologizers only to plunge him into the fires of an aesthetic which, shaped as it has been by the heat of controversy, has now hardened into a species of dogmatism—the dogmatism of an all-inclusive, though scrupulously qualified and anything but lubri cate, humanism.

Dr Leavis rightly dismisses the notion that "by a devout study of Blake's symbolism a key can be found that will open to us a supreme esoteric wisdom", and he is understandably suspicious of specialist scholars who offer to "guide us diagrammatically" through the bewildering complexities of Blake's Prophetic Books. One of the few guides to which he concedes "a certain credit balance of usefulness" is "Blake's Humanism" by John Beer (a fellow-contributor), and this because it emphasizes "that characteristic of Blake's thought expressed in his insistence that Man, concretely 'there' only in the individual human being and governed by his knowledge that he doesn't belong to himself, is responsible for determining what his responsibility is". And that, Dr Leavis adds, "is indistinguishable from determining what he himself is in relation to what he ought to be". In Blake's insistence that perception is not passive, that there is no discontinuity between perception and "the trained and conscious" creativity of the artist, Dr Leavis finds "a conception of human creativity that is at the same time a conception of human responsibility". That is a very important insight, and no one who has read Blake attentively will want to disagree with Dr Leavis when he goes on to say that "one aspect of Blake's living importance is that he compels us to realise fully and clearly what 'human responsibility' means". We come to realise that meaning by being enabled to experience imaginatively the difference between "Selfhood" on the one hand—"that which asserts itself and seeks to possess from within its self-enclosure"—and "Identity" on the other—"the individual human being as the disinterested and selfless". In the disinterested and selfless, the controlling idea that informs Blake's work throughout its whole extent is that of consciousness as the transformer of itself and its world, and by letting us see this happen, Blake speaks to us with that imperative which Rilke demanded of the greatest art: You must change your life. Yet for all his recognition of Blake's peculiar and disturbing power, Dr Leavis does not hesitate to describe the experience of reading Blake's Prophetic Books as "a plunge into wordy and boring unreality". Admittedly there is much in the Prophetic Books that is boring and repetitive; the place-names on Blake's mythological map sound like Australian railway-stations, and some of his detours lead to regions that remain impenetrably private. But if Blake's loose-limbed septenarians cover stretches of unrelieved cosmic gloom, they also climb to heights of sheer magnificence—summits from which we receive intimations of an immortality that is continuous with the physique behind them, the bodily effort that took them there, and if they fail to achieve finality, I do not think that they fail for the reasons that Dr Leavis gives, but for the much simpler reason that they are, after all, successive drafts of a gradually developing vision. Moreover, if Blake presents us with a coherent imaginative universe that runs from minute particulars to large-scale properties, we cannot have foreknowledge without a certain amount of background obscurity. Dr Leavis gives two reasons for his verdict on the Prophetic Books: the first alleges an inherent structural defect, whilst the second questions the compatibility of their theology with that conception of man which Blake's genius. As to the first, Dr Leavis notes that "the characters" of Blake's long poems are "separated aspects, or constituents, or potentialities, of complete human nature, which is thought of as the whole inclusive essential Man". He goes on to point out that "the difficulty besetting such an undertaking is that characters in dramatico-epic action and interaction must inevitably be imaginable as aspects—that is, as full human persons". Whilst I think it is true to say that "the fissions, coalescences, doublings, overlapping, and psychosymbolic subtleties of changing interaction wear down our powers of attention", when we read the Prophetic Books from cover to cover, I do not think that the characters of Urien, Los, Tharmas, and Luath, are by any means unimaginable as actors in their own right, for all that they are aspects of a more nobly characterized whole, namely Albion. Given that Blake's dramatico-epic action deals with the internal power-politics of Man—and that interior drama, or the drama of pure consciousness, is concerned with "states of being" rather than "beings in states", it is difficult to see how he could have proceeded otherwise. Shakespearean drama, it is true, gives us both the representative and the individual together: Lear is both Everyman and this man; and, as Auden has argued, this is because Shakespeare combines the subjective and objective views, the internal drama of consciousness and the external drama of situation, but if we do not blame the authors of "Prometheus Bound" or "Everyman" for having failed to give us an Othello or a Lear, no more should we blame Blake for having preferred a principle of substitutibility to a principle of substantiality in the matter of characterization. If we accept the principle, there is no difficulty in conceiving of each of the Zoas as embodying a particular power that has achieved dominance at the expense of other powers, so that we do have imaginable characters, in the sense of realisations of possibilities inherent in universal man, the dominance of each in turn representing an imbalance in the four elements that compose the whole. As to the second, and more serious, charge—Dr Leavis detects a contradiction between that view of man which finds its expression in the great prophetic figure of Los and Blake's superimposed theologcal schema—Creation/Fall: Redemption/Apocalypse. Dr Leavis argues that "in his insistence on a human creativity that means human responsibility", Blake was repudiating "all forms of determinism"; from which it follows that "to posit an ultimate end that gives significance to the creative effort, being its final cause, is to gainsay the repudiation". But if Blake were to maintain (with Berkeley) that what is ultimately significant (exclator) is predetermined as an effect of free will, the alleged contradiction vanishes. Dr Leavis lets the Tyger out of the bag when he states that Blake "can no more know, or imagine, what follows the reversal of the Fall than I can know what preceded it". But he can, and he does; for Blake's exegesis is realised, and imagine, what follows the reversal of the Fall than I can know what preceded it. And throughout all Eternity, I forgive you, you forgive me. As our dear Redeemer said, "This is the wine, and this the bread".
Forgiveness is to be understood as a transference of the Will from Selfhood to the Imagination, for to forgive is, in Blake's phrase, "to enter another's bosom", and the release of imaginative power that makes this possible reveals the human form as divine. Furthermore, for the imagination to have this capability, there must be an eternal precondition of this reversal, and the Resurrection is that precondition. The great paradox of Blake's myth, as Christian experience is, is that the power of the creative imagination is transacted in inverse ratio to the magnitude of the claims it is tempted to make on its own behalf, and it is for this reason that the divinity to which Los aspires (the false divinity, or deified humanity, of our fallen condition) is replaced by the saving recognition of God's humanity; for just as goodness, in Blake's teaching, is not the condition but the result of our entering into the Divine Body, so has the divinity is the result of our incorporation in the divine humanity, the result, that is, of the work of the Holy Spirit—the Divine Voice to which the creative imagination responds. Thus the humanism of Los, which Dr Leavis very properly reverses, is incomplete, and it is not until all aspects of Man have found their unity in Albion that the Human Form Divine can meet the Divine Form Human—in Albion's adoration of Jesus.

The central question that any reading of Blake has to decide is whether the source of human creativity is to be found in man's divinity or God's humanity. The humanist reading of Blake favours the former source and takes Los as Blake's appointed advocate, but such a reading conveniently forgets that Los is as responsible for man's fallen condition as any of the Zoas, and that Blake's vision of the Human Fourfold requires a relationship of reciprocity between the fragmented faculties, and not the sovereignty of any one of them. In his "Descriptive Catalogue", Blake describes the Zoas as "Visions of the eternal attributes, or divine names, which, when erected into gods, become destructive to humanity"; they are, he tells us, "Qualities which are Servants of Humanity, not Gods or Lords". The delification of any one faculty is destructive of the whole, and this process of delification leading to destruction is exemplified most clearly in the case of Urizen.

Urizenic (or deist) reasoning, finding evidence of rationality in the world, infers the creation of the objective world by a rational being, a finite abstraction identified with and derived from "the laws" of Nature. But what has happened, as Robert E. Simmons has pointed out, is that the reasoning mind, by "first projecting its conception of the world as an 'other', and then using the resulting projected world as evidence of the 'truth' of its conception", has become the captive of its own circularity. If systematizing reason leads to the delusion of abstractions, the fact that it works by externalization lays it open to destruction, for in Blake's myth the Fall begins when emotional energy (Orc/LAway) seizes the province of the reasoning mind, having suddenly realized that Urizen's province is external to its own, and therefore subject to seizure. In his book, "The Awakening of Albion", (a magnificent study of the Renovations of the Body in the Poetry of William Blake), Mr Frosch describes this recognition as "a sense of otherness born of the momentary cessation of Urizen's work, in the same way, for example, that any departure from normal functioning in the body will suddenly objectify the area of abnormality". So, "the disembemment of Albion", he continues, "proceeds by a series of attempts to annex what has been externalized", and what characterizes "fallen perception" is that, as a result, the ego is "forced to relate to the objects of its desire in an acquisitive mode". What we have here is an opposition between egocentric perception and creative perception, and the relation between these contrary modes of perception is put most succinctly by Northrop Frye when he writes: "In every creative act of perception, the act of perception is universal and the perceived object particular. The converse of this principle is that when the perception is egocentric the perceived object is general. The universal perception of the particular is 'the divine image' of the Songs of Innocence; the egocentric perception of the general is 'the human abstract' of the Songs of Experience."2

The position of Los reflects this duality, for, on the one hand, Los is Blake's exemplar of creative perception, whilst on the other he is responsible for the chaining of Orc as a sacrifice to Urizen, and by this act establishes Urizen's power and, in the words of Mr Frosch, "sets man's creative capacity at odds with the energy from which it ultimately springs". Thus Los does not escape the consequences of the Zoas' renunciation of their participation in Albion's unity, whereby "the capacity of each is reduced to his own Selfhood or Spectre" and the faculties of man are as a result "the controllers rather than the vehicle of his consciousness". When Mr Frosch tells us, however, that Blake's highest honorific is "Humanity", and such texts as—

Thine own humanity learn to adore—
Thine own humanity learn to adore—

are adduced in support, the claim needs to be qualified by the reminder that Blake rarely uses the Divine Singular except as a location for hypostatized egocentricity, and that for Blake the focus of its contrary is Jesus—the visibility, the humanity of God. Moreover, the God thus made visible is revealed, not as the Divine Singular, but as the Divine Family, which, in essence but infinitely varied in identity, and Jesus is the unifying principle which identifies all its aspects, forms, and images, with one another. As Northrop Frye has written: "Jesus is God and man; he is the breadth and the wine, the body and the blood, the tree, the water of life, the vine of which we are the branches, the cornerstone of the city, and his body is the temple. . . The world of total and realized metaphor is Heaven; its opposite is Hell. Heaven and Hell, Eden and Ulro, form a great antithesis of eternal life and eternal death, and the whole effort of

3 Thomas R. Frosch, "The Awakening of Albion" (Cornell, 1974; ed. pp. 211).
the imagination is directed towards separating them. For Blake this means that Generation is the battlefield of the imaginative and natural visions, and that there is a dialectic forming within natural life which will eventually separate Eden from Ulro and stop the cycle from turning."

"Whatever the promptings of religious or metaphysical thought may be", writes Dr Leavis, "the creative agents of human insight and wisdom must resist them when they incite to the presentation of the unimaginable." We cannot, of course, present the unimaginable, any more than we can draw a figure that contradicts the laws of space, but to say that we cannot exceed the bounds of possible experience is not to determine in advance what those bounds are. Blake held that there was a downward limit—a limit of contraction and opacity—but no upward limit, no limit of expansion and translucence: in other words, he regarded the human imagination as infinite in its operation (and hence capax divinitatis), though finite in its created/fallen condition. If "divinity" is simply the name given to the highest values embodied in the personal relations that compose our world, then the humanism of the fallen Los answers to that conception of divinity, but if God enters into personal relations as the focus of what is otherwise blurred and diffuse, and if God does so because personal relations are constitutive of the godhead, then the omission of that dimension can only lead to a misrepresentation of Blake on a point that is central to his creative vision: for Blake's "Divine Family" is none other than the interiority of the godhead made visible, and hence imaginable, in the Person of Jesus. If the original heresies of the Church was "Jesus is the Christ", arid this proclamation entailed "Jesus is God", Blake's emphasis is the other way about: "God is Jesus". Hence God can never be known in abstraction from Jesus, nor, indeed, in abstraction from our relations with each other; rather, is God known in our nearness to each other, and if this is humanism, it is the humanism of the Gospels.

What, then, are we to make of Blake's version of the Gospel Nativity narratives? Blake re-mythologizes the Gospel story. He follows Rabbinic tradition in supposing that the child Jesus was illegitimate, but departs from it in finding the paradigm of forgiveness in Joseph's forgiveness of Mary. There are several points to be noted here: (i) the moral law, in the severity of its dispensation, regards the child of an extra-marital union as an outlaw; (ii) it is necessary to Blake's myth that enforcement of the moral law should be seen as a reversal of the divine purpose; (iii) on Blake's premises, there is nothing to forgive (as far as Joseph's forgiveness is directed towards the sexual act), and (iv) it is not the forgiveness of Joseph that makes the child Jesus divine (or "determines his divinity", as Mr Frosch would have it), it is, rather, that Joseph's forgiveness of Mary enables him to see the child Jesus for what he already is—as divine. It is ironic that on Blake's view of sexual morality there should be nothing to forgive, for what is left is the injury done to Joseph's self-esteem by the rumours of illegitimacy mentioned in St Matthew's Gospel, but, granted that Blake's sexual ethics are antinomian, there is nothing in


Blake's version that is incompatible with the Christology of the New Testament. However offensive to Christian piety Blake's version may be, the shock it administers is only effective at the expense of a morality founded on sexual constraint, and its irony works by implication, inasmuch as it forces that morality to see the Divine Child where it least expects to.

For Blake, sexuality reposes in the sense of touch, and in proposing a reorganization of our senses as the condition of our renovation, he attaches the greatest importance to this sense. According to Blake, it is in the sense of touch—"the senses of sight and hearing (both senses of distance), but through the sense of contact that our liberation from "the caverns of our skulls" is to be achieved. The sense of touch is the vehicle of sexuality, not only in propagation, but in the expression of our desire for anything or anybody: we want to touch—him, her, it—and so complete the circuit of sympathy, but the objects of our desire remain "outside" us. Now the interior correlate of touch is taste, and what happens in Blake's "Apocalypse" is that the sense of touch and the sense of taste become one and the same: what is outside us is experienced as within us, and the great image and agent of this transformation is the Eucharist. There is a remarkable passage in Northrop Frye's "Fearful Symmetry" which clarifies the connection. "In this world", he writes, "the senses of distance, eyesight and hearing, produce the major arts. The chief imaginative use of the sense of contact is in sexual love... The two great divisions of human imagination, art and love, are thus broken halves of two powers which are one in God... This barrier between art and love does not disappear until the final apocalypse... the absorption of the material world into the body of man, which in the fallen world goes on chiefly, in neither art nor love, but in eating and drinking, the province of 'taste'. Eating the body and drinking the blood of a God-Man is therefore a very profound image of the final apocalypse, which in the teaching of Jesus is associated with a harvest and vintage and also with a wedding supper... When eating we touch is any longer outside us, touch and taste will have become the same sense." In short, the mutual externality which characterises the world we perceive will be replaced by the mutual internality of perceivers.

"What Blake shows us in Eden", writes Mr Frosch, "is a community of forms embracing through their activity. Now tongue and taste are unified, and are, together, re-integrated with the other senses, with the effect that the risen activity is a kind of speech, an utterance of the whole man." Perception of the divine humanity in others opens the way into Eden, and there "the reorganized senses retain every capacity they now have, but no one capacity is final, and there is a complete register of possibilities at the spontaneous service of desire". So, at the end of Jerusalem, when human friendship has replaced the principle of self-orientation, Albion arises to see Jesus appear as "Los, my friend". The forgiven sources of man's joy—his sexual energy, his spontaneous openness—have restored him to Eden, and

When in Eternity Man converses with Man, they enter into one another's bosoms (which are Universes of Delight) in mutual interchange...
When the experience of reading Blake's Prophetic Books can be described by our most eminent critic as "a plunge into wordy and boring unreality", the young are surely right to reject the verdict of their elders, for what Blake offers them is a myth that internalizes the drama of man's redemption, a myth of disembodiment, dismemberment, crucifixion, and resurrection, operating on four levels simultaneously—the physical, the psychological, the social, and the cosmic. It is not a rival Gospel, but an internalization of the Gospel already given, a psychodrama of redemption that does not displace the historical drama, but treats of an order of possibility that co-exists with and, indeed, within it.

As the young turn to Blake, they turn also to eastern religions, and for the same reason. For what is this consciousness that is capax divinitatis but the awareness that our Identity (or Atman), as opposed to our (Hussey Selfhood, is capable of "becoming" what it already "is"; and it is through the mediation of Jesus that this capability is realised—i.e., to the extent that egocentricity is replaced by Christocentricity. Thus it is in Albion's adoration of Jesus that the Human Form Divine finds in the Divine Form Human its perfect and plenary expression. The central affirmation of Blake's theology finds its most natural support in the metaphysics of Hinduism—in the Upanishads and the Gita (which we know Blake read in Williams' translation of 1785), and so far from being a deviant product of western dogmatism, Blake's work provides the matrix of a theology capable of reconciling East and West, a context within which eastern categories of thought may be applied to the task of expounding the same mystery from a contrary metaphysical standpoint.

We have said that Blake's controlling idea is that of consciousness as the transformer of itself and its world. This idea presupposes that human consciousness partakes of divinity through the mediation of God's Humanity, and that the Incarnation is therefore to be regarded, not only as a past historical event, but, in the words of Coventry Patmore, as "an event which is renewed in the body of every one who is on the way to the fulfilment of his original destiny". And because the Divine-Human Imagination effects what its deliverances signify, Blake's Gospel gives no support to those who would deny the inner form, or historicity, of what it expresses in terms of internalizing myth; nor can it speak imperatively to those who refuse to take seriously the great Athanasian saying with which Blake concluded his first public manifesto: "God became as we are, that we might become as He is". If we need any assurance, beyond the poetry itself, that there is no dispute between Blake's Gospel and the Gospel of the Four Evangelists, Blake's avowal to Thomas Burts (in the letter dated 22nd November, 1802) should provide it: "I still and shall to Eternity Embrace Christianity and Adore him who is the Express image of God".

There are gifts too large and too fearful to be handled freely . . . the boast of some Catholics and the reproach levelled against us by all Protestants (is) that the Catholic Church, if now become beyond mistake a despotic aggressive papacy, in which freedom of thought and action is utterly extinguished. But I do not allow that the alleged unanimous testimony exists.

John Henry Newman, "The Vatican Definition" (1874).

Newman's letters for the years 1870-1873 which have just been published by the Oxford University Press, cover a number of important subjects. They show Newman among his severest and suffering the loss of a number of his close friends who died at that time. But his mind was as active as ever. A Convärent of Atenats was published early in 1870 and received extensive treatment from reviewers. There were articles which repeated his views on Anglican orders, letters on liberalism in connection with the controversy about the Athanasian Creed in the Anglican Church, and letters, especially in 1873, about higher education for Catholics, a matter that was soon to become explosive. Over all, however, there was the controversy surrounding the decree of Vatican I on papal infallibility. Newman's position, stated in the article which follows, retains its significance, not least in the light of a recent interview given in Rome by Archbishop Jerome Hamer, O.P., Secretary of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith. According to a report in the Tablet (3 August 1974, p. 583), Archbishop Hamer stressed the importance of a teaching authority in the Church. Less reassuring was his apparent identification of that authority with his own Congregation. And later, with reference to Fr Hans Küng, he insisted that the Congregation would never interfere in questions involving freedom of theological discussion as long as these did not endanger doctrine. But such a standpoint begs the question. For some people, serious critical study always endangers doctrine, while for others such Newman it is the wisest protection. The Archbishop's attitude, however kindly intended, has enough of Manning about it to show that Newman's viewpoint has yet to have its full effect.

Since the centenary of the First Vatican Council, the Journal has turned often to the subject of papal infallibility. The Spring of 1970 began with an article by Fr George Pell on "The Roots of Church Power & Authority". The Summer issue of 1971 carried an Editorial "On Infallibility", and with it a review article of Dr Hans Küng's book, Infi älibilität? An Enquiry, entitled "Catholic Anti-Infallibilism" by Dr John Jay Hughes. The following summer, Fr R. F. Ippolito examined Archbishop Henry Manning's championship of papal infallibility, and that autumn Fr John Coventry discussed in "The Church's Authority to Teach Today", dealing with both ordinary and extraordinary magisterium. The background to the subject in the span of Church history was earlier sketched by the Editor in "Shifting the Emphasis of Papal & Episcopal Authority" (Summer 1968, p. 217-220) and articles on Humanae Vitae have raised the same issue again. It is of constant interest in these economical and liberalising times, and has therefore been constantly raised in our pages. This surely is one clear point of growth in recent theological thinking.
Newman for ten years. After completing his studies for the priesthood at the Gregorian University in Rome in 1970, he went up to Oriel College, Oxford, to work for a doctorate of philosophy. He has just completed his thesis, Newman's Understanding of Martyrs, Wallasey, or Merseyside.

It has become quite usual nowadays to refer to John Henry Newman as a prophet. Dr Michael Ramsey, the Archbishop of Canterbury, implied as much when he said that spiritual renewal in both the Anglican and the Roman Catholic Churches would mean recapturing something of his spirit, and when Concilium devoted an issue to prophecy it included an article on "Cardinal Newman considered as a Prophet". There emphasis was laid on his concern with persons, with history, with doctrinal development, with faith and conscience, and with other matters as well. These questions establish Newman's claim to be considered as a prophet through their obvious significance for the present day. This significance is the key, for a prophet is not primarily someone who foretells the future, but an interpreter of the ways of God for man. He is a guide. The volumes of Newman's letters which have been published recently supply ample evidence of his prophetic gift for, apart from other matters, such as Anglican Orders, higher education for Catholics and the danger of liberalism, they cover the vital months of the First Vatican Council and the equally important period which followed them. Thus they provide a day by day account of Newman's reactions to what was happening in Rome and put into a contemporary setting the imposition of a doctrine on the Church, which had become so familiar that, a century later, Catholics can scarcely imagine being without it. Familiarity, of course, often breeds contempt and, at least in the present case, has not diminished controversy.

In recent years the infallibility of the Pope has come to be recognised by almost everyone as a major obstacle to the reunion of Christians. Pope Paul VI himself has described it as such on various occasions and others repeat this view more or less as an axiom. Specifically, in 1970, Hans Kung celebrated the definition's centenary by publishing his book, Infallible?, and thereby stirred the debate into life once more. In these circumstances any suggestion that, for years past, they have disintegrated themselves as if no responsibility attached to wild words and overbearing deeds; who have uttered truths in the most paradoxical form, and stretched principles till they were close upon snapping; and who at length, having done their best to set the house on fire, leave to others the task of putting out the flame." These words, however, were not an isolated protest. During the Council, as he observed the way the majority party behaved, he grew more indignant. In a private letter to his bishop, Ullathorne, on 28 January 1870, which was leaked to the public, he denounced the "aggressive insolent faction" who "make the heart of the just to mourn, whom the Lord hath made sorrowful". On 21 August 1870, writing to Ambrose St John, he referred to "the tyrant majority", and advised a policy of perfect quiet, in case it "should do something more". But perhaps his most withering protest is to be found in his letter to a Mrs Margaret Wilson, a convert, who felt that she had been received into the Church without due preparation. Professor Kung's particular arguments are left on one side and an attempt is made to isolate his fundamental objection, attention may come to rest on these words: "such a display of infallibility is made in practice that five years after the Council the authority and credibility of the Catholic Church have rarely been exposed to such a test".

When Newman was finally given the opportunity to speak out publicly on the definition of Vatican I in his Letter to the Duke of Norfolk, he began by making a concession: "I own to a deep feeling, that Catholics may in good measure thank themselves, and no one else, for having alienated from them so religious a mind (i.e. Gladstone's). There are those among us, as it must be confessed, who for years past have conducted themselves, and no one else, for having alienated from them so religious a mind (i.e. Gladstone's). There are those among us, as it must be confessed, who for years past have conducted themselves as if no responsibility attached to wild words and overbearing deeds; who have uttered truths in the most paradoxical form, and stretched principles till they were close upon snapping; and who at length, having done their best to set the house on fire, leave to others the task of putting out the flame." These words, however, were not an isolated protest. During the Council, as he observed the way the majority party behaved, he grew more indignant. In a private letter to his bishop, Ullathorne, on 28 January 1870, which was leaked to the public, he denounced the "aggressive insolent faction" who "make the heart of the just to mourn, whom the Lord hath made sorrowful". On 21 August 1870, writing to Ambrose St John, he referred to "the tyrant majority", and advised a policy of perfect quiet, in case it "should do something more". But perhaps his most withering protest is to be found in his letter to a Mrs Margaret Wilson, a convert, who felt that she had been received into the Church without due preparation. Professor Kung's particular arguments are left on one side and an attempt is made to isolate his fundamental objection, attention may come to rest on these words: "such a display of infallibility is made in practice that five years after the Council the authority and credibility of the Catholic Church have rarely been exposed to such a test". Or again, his complaint against the papal Grado of 1868 goes deep, that Pope Paul "completely ignored the hierarchy of truths established by Vatican II and put questionable theologema of the Roman tradition on a par with the central statements of the Christian faith". Clearly, there is no space here to settle the controversy which Kung has raised, but his remarks are noteworthy, for what he has protested against, a hundred years ago Archbishop Manning proclaimed unabashedly. Introducing the definition of papal infallibility to his clergy in a lengthy pastoral letter, he swept on from what has been revealed to include within the infallible authority of the Pope as part of "the whole revealed order of salvation", such matters as "Things which pertain to faith", "Things pertaining to piety", "Things of religion", "Things of faith speculative and practical", "Controversies of religion", and so forth. Here obviously in its very looseness of expression may be discovered the seed of the creeping infallibility that has provoked Kung to protest. But Kung may now be left on one side; it provoked Newman as well.
too soon and was worried by the definition. Newman wrote to her on 20 October: "I think there are some Bishops and Priests, who act as if they did not care at all whether souls were lost or not—and only wish to save souls on their own measure." Such an indictment of certain members of the clergy as careless and selfishly callous in the way they exercise their pastoral responsibilities could scarcely be more devastating. And he pleaded continually with those who wrote to him in distress, not to confuse the doctrine which had been defined with the manner in which it was passed. His letter to Catherine Froude early in 1871 is typical of his approach: "As little as possible was passed at the Council—nothing about the Pope which I have not myself always held—but it is impossible to deny that it was done with an impertinence and overbearing wilfulness, which has been a great scandal—" Such remarks were a common feature of his letters at that time. And he counselled those who were troubled further by reminding them of the lesson of history: "If you look into history, you find Popes continually completing the acts of their predecessors, and Councils too—sometimes only half the truth is brought out at one time—I doubt not a coming Pope, or a coming Council, will so explain and guard what has been now passed by the late Council, as to clear up all that troubles us now." And to Alfred Plummer: "Let us be patient, let us have faith, and a new Pope, and a re-assembled Council may trim the boat." He began by considering the sense in which the Pope is infallible. He insisted that this infallibility was not some sort of inherent quality of the Pope's mind with inevitable bearing on every judgment he made: "Infallibility is not a habit in the Pope, or a state of mind—" It was, he stressed, an external, not an internal, aid. He repeated that the Pope "has no habit of infallibility in his intellect, such that his acts cannot but proceed from it, must be infallible because he is infallible, imply, involve, an infallible judgment. He is infallible pro re nata, when he speaks ex cathedra—not except at particular times and on grave questions". Newman held this understanding of the papal prerogative because he recognised that the Pope's infallibility did not belong to him as a private person, but was "that infallibility which the Church has". The Pope is not infallible habitually, but as the Church is infallible; he exercises his infallible judgment. He is infallible pro re natâ, when he speaks ex cathedra—not except at particular times and on grave questions. Newman taught in Manning's Church", in M. D. Goulder (ed.), Infallibility in the Church, (London, 1985), pp. 28-80.


caused from the many letters he received from people who asked for his advice. It was what he had feared as well as always anticipated; unfortunately his anticipation was "abundantly fulfilled". And even before the Council had assembled, he summed up in a memorandum for his own use his opposition to the proposed definition. He put the question to himself why, if he believed in the Pope's infallibility, he did not want it defined. He wrote: "I answer, because it can't be so defined as not to raise more questions than it solves." Newman's reaction to the definition is, therefore, quite plain: while he had no difficulty in accepting it and as a Catholic at least had always held it, he was scandalised by the behaviour of "the tyrant majority"; and considered the definition itself both unnecessary and pastorally disadvantageous. There remains the deeper question of what he understood infallibility to mean.

18 See L.D. XXV p. 334 n. 2.
20 Letter to R. F. Littledale (?), 17 September 1872, L.D. XXVI p. 171. In 1877, W. J. Copeland, Newman's curate from Anglican days, mooted the idea of publishing a selection of Newman's Parochial and Plain Sermons in a single volume, arranged for the principal year. This was done in 1878. In the meantime he and Newman corresponded about the sermons to be included. At one stage there was doubt about whether to use P.S. V. 20, "Endurance, The Christian's Portion", or V. 21, "Affliction, a School of Comfort". Although he thought V. 21 the better sermon, Newman decided in favour of V. 20, because the former contained, the phrase, "This Church has erred". (See Parochial and Plain Sermons V, (London, 1868), p. 310.) Copeland, whom he told Copeland, "grates so upon me". Then he added in brackets, "I should not mind 'the Pope has erred'." An Oxford man rarely smiles when he makes a joke. (See the Newman-Copeland Correspondence, Birmingham Oratory Archives, typed and bound, (34 A), pp. 232-233.)
Here mention should be made of what Newman told Lady Simeon on 1 November 1870. First, as so often, he comforted her by pointing out how limited the definition had been. Then he continued: "The whole body of theologians, Gallæus included, have always held, that what the Pope said ex cathedra, was true, when the Bishops had received it—what has been passed, is to the effect that what he determines ex cathedra is true independently of the reception by the Bishops—" and he went on: "but nothing has been passed as to what is meant by 'ex cathedra'—and the Pope said ex cathedra, was true, when the Bishops had received it—what has been passed, is to the effect that what he determines ex cathedra is true independently of the reception by the Bishops." And he went on: "but nothing has been passed as to what is meant by 'ex cathedra'—and the Pope said ex cathedra, was true, when the Bishops had received it—what has been passed, is to the effect that what he determines ex cathedra is true independently of the reception by the Bishops." Already, at this early stage, therefore, he saw clearly that the gift of infallibility possessed by the Pope, even when exercised by him alone, was still the infallibility of the Church, for that was what ex cathedra implied; consequently it could never truly be exercised in isolation. When the Pope acts infallibly, he necessarily acts in relation to the Church as a whole. Quite recently, Bishop Christopher Butler has explained this view when showing how an alleged infallible definition can be known as infallible in fact. He declared that "the subsequent consent of the Church is necessary (and Vatican II assures us that it will not be lacking)". At once he made the vital distinction: "The consent of the Church does not make the definition infallible: it recognizes that infallibility already inheres in the definition." And he drew the conclusion: "If the alleged definition failed to win the Church's subsequent consent, this would prove that the definition had not in fact fulfilled the requirement for an infallible definition—the Pope had not really been speaking ex cathedra." The qualification, ex cathedra, roots the definition in the life and understanding of the Church.

To return to the letter of 17 September 1872. There Newman also brought out the limits of infallibility. It is, he said, concerned only with "grave questions". The expression as it stands is vague, but in a letter to Catherine Froude he had been specific: "certainly the Pope is not infallible beyond the Deposit of faith originally given"—which amounts to the teaching of Vatican II that the infallibility with which the Church is endowed and which the Pope enjoys by virtue of his office, "extends as far as the deposit of divine revelation". Moreover Newman insisted to Catherine Froude he had been specific: "certainly the Pope is not infallible beyond the Deposit of faith originally given"—which amounts to the teaching of Vatican II that the infallibility with which the Church is endowed and which the Pope enjoys by virtue of his office, "extends as far as the deposit of divine revelation". Moreover Newman insisted to Catherine Froude, 5 March 1871, L.D. XXV p. 297.

"The consent of the Church does not make the definition infallible: it recognizes that infallibility already inheres in the definition." And he drew the conclusion: "If the alleged definition failed to win the Church's subsequent consent, this would prove that the definition had not in fact fulfilled the requirement for an infallible definition—the Pope had not really been speaking ex cathedra." The qualification, ex cathedra, roots the definition in the life and understanding of the Church.

To return to the letter of 17 September 1872. There Newman also brought out the limits of infallibility. It is, he said, concerned only with "grave questions". The expression as it stands is vague, but in a letter to Catherine Froude he had been specific: "certainly the Pope is not infallible beyond the Deposit of faith originally given"—which amounts to the teaching of Vatican II that the infallibility with which the Church is endowed and which the Pope enjoys by virtue of his office, "extends as far as the deposit of divine revelation". Moreover Newman insisted to Catherine Froude, 5 March 1871, L.D. XXV p. 297.

Littledale, to Catherine Froude and most fully to Alfred Plummer that the Church's infallibility means "she can never be permitted to go wrong in the truths of revelation—This is a negative proposition—the very idea of infallibility is a negative... properly speaking, inspiration is positive, and infallibility is negative". Here revealed truth was the subject-matter in view and the scope of infallibility was repeatedly stressed as something negative.

Associated closely with his awareness that infallibility was not an infused or an inspired gift was the prominence Newman gave to "true interpretation, research, consulting theologians etc etc." Once again, the same approach was adopted by the last Council with its brief and formal declaration that the Pope and bishops have to "stirre painstakingly and by appropriate means to inquire properly into revelation." The magisterium not to consult in the necessary responsible way would be a grave fault, for it would be to presume on the assistance of the Spirit.

The significance Newman attached to the consultation of the Church in doctrinal matters has come to be recognised as one of the most distinctive features of his theology. In 1859, in the article which caused his definition to Rome, he considered the role of the laity and showed how the witness of the faithful may preserve the true Gospel teaching in times of trial. In 1865, in a letter to Henry Oxenham, too little known, but preserved in draft at the Birmingham Oratory and marked "Sent in substance", he explained the role of the schola theologorum. After describing the way the different schools of Alexandria, Antioch, and Rome had worked on one another in the past, and lamenting the effective demise of all but the Roman school, Newman continued:

The Schola answers many purposes. It defends the dogma, and articulates it. Further than this, since its teaching is far wider and fuller than the Apostolic dogma which is de fide, it protects it, as forming a large body of doctrine which must be got through before an attack can be made on the dogma. And it studies the opinion of the Church, embodying tradition and hindering frequent changes. And it is the arena on which questions of development and change are argued out. And again, if changes of opinion are to come, and false interpretations of Scripture, or false views of the dogma to be set right, it prepares the way, acclimatizing the mind of Catholics to the idea of the change, and preventing surprise and scandal.
In January 1874, when he was re-publishing his Lectures on Justification, he made use of these ideas. He quoted in the New Advertiser various different theological opinions on what constitutes the one formal cause of justification to illustrate the freedom of view that was available, and then went on to propose his own opinion that the form of justification might be understood as the personal presence of Christ in the believer. And later the same year, in his Letter to the Duke of Norfolk, he stated: "None but the Schola Theologorum is competent to determine the force of Papal and Synodal utterances, and the exact interpretation of them is a work of time."

"The strength of these statements is such that it is hardly surprising to learn that Ivy Froude, Catherine's daughter, was led to wonder whether, "If the Schola Theologorum decides the meaning of a Pope or a Council's words, the Schola is infallible, not they or he". Newman's answer called attention to the need for interpretation of words, however clear they might appear to be. "God is love" cannot be extended to imply "therefore there is no future punishment for bad men". "Some power then is needed," he told her, "to determine the general sense of authoritative words—to determine their direction, drifts, limits, and comprehension, to hinder gross per-versions." He described this power as "virtually the passive infallibility of the whole body of the Catholic people" in contrast to the "active infallibility of the Pope and bishops."

It is evident that Newman did not regard this passive infallibility as something merely receptive, which would put it only a short step away from blind obedience. Robert Murray has noticed the danger which occurs when it is considered in this way, and indeed has quoted Newman on the results to be expected from a radical disjunction of the Ecclesia docens from the Ecclesia discens: the educated classes will become indifferent and the poorer superstitious. Moreover, in August, 1870, Newman told Frederick Rymer, the President of St. Edmund's, Ware, that he regarded "the general acceptance, judgment of Christendom" as "the ultimate or revealed truth", and in the letter to Ivy Froude he stated explicitly that what is infallible passively none the less acts. He was referring in particular to the schola. It acts, he affirmed, "with great force both in correcting popular misapprehensions and narrow views of the teaching of the active infallibilitas, and, by the intellectual investigations and disputes which are its very life, it keeps the distinction clear between theological truth and theological opinion, and is the antagonist of dogmatism. And while the differences of the School maintain the liberty of thought, the unanimity of its members is the safeguard of the infallible decisions of the Church and the champion of faith."

Newman's teaching on the rôle of the laity and theologians in determining the understanding of revealed truth was a further anticipation of Vatican II. There it was stated: "The body of the faithful as a whole, anaunted as they are by the Holy One, cannot err in matters of belief. Thanks to a supernatural sense of the faith which characterizes the People as a whole, it manifests this unerring quality when, 'from the bishops down to the last member of the laity,' it shows universal agreement in matters of faith and morals." And Alois Grillmeier has commented: "The people of Christ as a whole, including the holders of office, is infallible in credendo, which, however, is not to be taken in a passive sense. It is something active, by which faith is vigorously preserved and attested, penetrating even more profoundly and making the formative element in life."

To express this matter briefly, the gift of infallibility according to Newman is an external, not an internal, aid, negative in character, and employed only in judgments which, while they deal with revealed truth, are none the less established by human means. To some this view may appear so restricted as to deny the Church's teaching on infallibility of all meaning whatsoever. But there is a positive side, as Newman explained to Alfred Plummer on 3 April 1871. After pointing out that the Church teaches by human means, although assisted by grace, like any other inquirer, he continued: "She has in kind no promise of invincible grace which a Father or a divine, or an inquirer has not—but she has this security, that, in order to fulfil her office, her output is always true in the matter of revelation."

"This security is no mean thing, as Newman made plain in A Grammar of Assent which was published early in 1870." He distinguished between infallibility and certitude. Certitude was "at most nothing more than infallibility pro hac vice", whereas "An infallible authority is certain in every particular case that they assert". For the Church, the particular cases will always be limited by the revealed deposit and the negative character of infallibility itself, but in those circumstances and according to those conditions her judgments have the assurance of a divine promise which guarantees that she will not be in error. Such a guarantee should never be underestimated. It means that the infallible Church, when teaching revealed matters, can never so mistake her message


37 See Robert Murray, Who or What is Infallible? in Gadsby, (ed.), Infallibility in the Church, p. 32; see also Newman, On Consulting the Faithful, p. 106.

38 See Letter to Frederick Rymer, 3 August 1870, L.D. XXV p. 172. Newman also pointed out to Rymer that his essay on consulting the laity should be quoted with consideration, folio-they were accepted as a witness, not as an authority or a judge. (Ibid) However, Newman had observed, in the necessarily restrained manner the terms required, that "each constituent portion of the Church has its own reflection or echo of the clergy in matters of faith, yet there is something in the 'pastorum et fidelium consensus', which is not in the pastors alone." (Newman, On Consulting the Faithful, p. 103.)

39 Letter to Ivy Froude, 28 July 1875; quoted in Ward, op cit, p. 554.

40 Lumen Gentium 12; see Abbott (ed.), op cit, p. 23.


that what she teaches would lead man directly away from God. It does not prevent her being in error on less essential issues, but that is only to say that the prerogative of infallibility is confined to revealed truth; no, it does not mean that her teaching is always as full and as accurate as it might be, but that is only to say that the Church is human and a pilgrim and that her gift of infallibility is negative. A merely indefectible Church, on the other hand, could presumably teach something destructive of revealed truth and detrimental to man's salvation for many generations, and would only be assured of returning to what is true in the end. That is not enough. Unless the Church of Christ can guarantee that what she teaches on essential matters is at the very least not false, she is nothing. Clearly such a claim is slight and not the self-aggrandising force that non-Catholics often fear. At the same time, such a guarantee is momentous, for it safeguards the essential purity of what the Church teaches as to be believed of necessity. This minimal claim and bed-rock guarantee make up the heart of Newman's understanding of infallibility.

In conclusion, if Newman's account of infallibility can be described as prophetic, it merits that description not principally because it can be seen to anticipate the teaching of the Second Vatican Council, although at times it does so remarkably, but for a deeper reason. A prophet, it has been said, is not so much a man who predicts the future, as an interpreter. The suggestion here is that Newman's interpretation of infallibility, if adopted, might have been, and could still be, of vital importance for the health and well-being of the Church. It is hard not to regret that the last hundred years have been spent too often following Manning's course instead of Newman's. Triumphalist behaviour has been preferred to the "wise and gentle minimism" he advised; the laity has been more often neglected than consulted; and theologians have sometimes been condemned, not just for their conclusions, but even for their questions. Further, it is hard not to believe that had Newman's view been taken up, there would have been neither cause nor occasion for the kind of protest against the doctrine which Hans Kung has felt bound to make. In these circumstances, Newman no doubt would speak of divine Providence and encourage everyone to learn from the mistakes of the past. To suggest that it is too late to overcome these mistakes would be a counsel of despair. But there is not a moment to lose.

See for example, Austin Farrer, "Infallibility and Historical Revelation", in Goulder, Infallibility in the Church, pp. 9-25, and also id., "On being an Anglican", The End of Man, (London, 1973), p. 51. However, Dr Farrer apparently misconceived the meaning of infallibility. His argument that when a Church pronounces infallibly on its historical revelation, it becomes a "fact-factory", oversimplified the relationship between revealed truths and the historical events which underpin them. To teach infallibility that the Mother of God, by virtue of her privileged role in the economy of salvation and her sinless life, enjoys the state of perfect blessedness with God, can no more settle what happened at her death or disappearance than the Church's faith that God raised Jesus from the dead can decide the question of the empty tomb.

PART 1: THE MAKING OF A SCHOLAR, 1896-1929

Just as Newman's life began with a course in the Classics and can legitimately be analysed as having focused about the essay he wrote as a man of 44 ("The Essay on Development"), so it has been with Dom David Knowles. Both of them moved from a Classical training to history; and this is not so uncommon, as is borne out by Dr Arnold Toynbee and Sir Kenneth (now Lord) Clark with his perceptive accounts of art history. Like Newman, Knowles was all his life moving up to and away from the world surveys, Dr E. F. Jacob the All Souls College librarian or Sir Edmund Bishop of Downside, one of the last great English autodidacts, his essay on "The Need for Catholic Historical Scholarships". He called himself, for he wrote upon the matter in 1958 in a fin de siècle mood (alone its peer) argue other authors' cases better; no, it merely gathered up many straws into a single massive barn, wonderfully organised, sensitively judged and graciously presented. It was, as Dr Beryl Smalley called it (in "Dominican Studies"), one of the great oaks of the forest, one that fired with interest the learned and unlearned alike. Eileen Power (The New Statesman) referred to it as "a book of really outstanding importance, based upon wide and profound research, reinforced by an acute critical sense . . . gains enormously from the fact that the author knows monasticism from the inside and brings to his work a depth and delicacy of understanding that only such knowledge can give." R. A. L. Smith saw it as reminiscent of the best of Maurist scholarship, characterised by sober realism couched in prose of matchless beauty. Appearing at the moment that it did, it was at once accepted as a work of massive proportions firstly because of its intrinsic worth as historical literature; secondly because its subject is a period of monastic life before which administrative records were almost wholly lacking and after which biographical evidence is swamped by administrative, and during which there blossomed a rich crop of chronicles, biographies, studies, meditations, treatises and the rest which made up a real spiritual-literary renaissance in an era of strict observance tempered by mellow humanism; thirdly because, by a method of sweeping historical narrative necessarily abandoned conferences was motivated by his strict monastic ethic and by his realisation that he was a brilliant amateur in the most creative sense, where such seminars are gatherings of professionals in the most institutional sense. His is the world of the English essay, of the character study, of the evocation of former pulsations, the illumination of lost ideas and climates of thought; not the world of form criticism and Festschriften: his coinage is not technical but life once lived. This being so, his is the expertise of the poet in prose, with an economy of words and a turn of phrase which altogether eclipses training.

"The Monastic Order in England from the Times of St Dunstan to the Fourth Lateran Council, 940-1216", to give it its full title (a title whose significance, appearing as it did exactly a millennium after its terminus a quo, was appreciated only in the second edition after the discovery of a vital charter) is a huge book. It emerged as the fruit of "the loudest years" in the solemn hours of the fall of France, a magisterial work of unhurried stability reflecting an era of assurance and growth. It was in every sense one ocuvre bénédictine, measured, capacious, exhaustive, yielding its message steadily, leaving the reader satisfied and even awed. Such had never before been seen over this ground, for it resumed a task long known to be there, a synthesis of the Rolls volumes of primary sources on the English monastic houses. It did not, like the Tudor volume (alone its peer) argue other authors' cases better; no, it merely gathered up many straws into a single massive barn, wonderfully organised, sensitively judged and graciously presented. It was, as Dr Beryl Smalley called it (in "Dominican Studies"), one of the great oaks of the forest, one that fired with interest the learned and unlearned alike. Eileen Power (The New Statesman) referred to it as "a book of really outstanding importance, based upon wide and profound research, reinforced by an acute critical sense . . . gains enormously from the fact that the author knows monasticism from the inside and brings to his work a depth and delicacy of understanding that only such knowledge can give." R. A. L. Smith saw it as reminiscent of the best of Maurist scholarship, characterised by sober realism couched in prose of matchless beauty. Appearing at the moment that it did, it was at once accepted as a work of massive proportions firstly because of its intrinsic worth as historical literature; secondly because its subject is a period of monastic life before which administrative records were almost wholly lacking and after which biographical evidence is swamped by administrative, and during which there blossomed a rich crop of chronicles, biographies, studies, meditations, treatises and the rest which made up a real spiritual-literary renaissance in an era of strict observance tempered by mellow humanism; thirdly because, by a method of sweeping historical narrative necessarily abandoned
in later volumes, the author was able to capture and communicate the vigorous dynamism of Benedictine growth, coalescence, recovery of past, revival, expansion, modification and experimentation (the spirit of fertile extraordinarily comforting and inspiring in a broad sweep of monastic history, showing a great religious and cultural institution going on and on, relentlessly, through every possible phase of under civilization or over civilization, of barbarism or decadence. It was for instance precisely the anarchy of Stephen's reign which saw some of the most exquisite manifestations of English monastic life*. That need for sight of the relentless on-going is still with us now, for it is our fate to see racing flywheels but never the massive engines of society turning: we live in the midst of frightening change, forgetful of what it must have been to count the seasons.

What then was the taproot of this great oak? This is one of the most mysterious questions of modern historiography; for it fills us with wonder to hear that a monk trained in several other disciplines at a sub-professional level, occupied to the hilt by the duties and turmoils of his own religious house, living in libraries whose comprehensiveness and index/cross-reference systems left much wanting, and living in an intellectual ethos that had nothing of the critical abrasiveness of a university which alone can cut and polish judgment, should by himself (and that I emphasise because it indicates unfathomable reserves of moral courage) produce so ambitious a work with—by the standards of the time—so little flaw. It takes one's breath away. Moreover it gives some impression of the moving spirit behind it, a spirit that must have burned in the decades—frightening change, forgetful of what it must have been to count the seasons.

The writer of this book must have known the loneliness of the long-distance scholar as few others do. Let us look at the taproots.

Michael Clive Knowles was born significantly on Michaelmas Day (29th September), the beginning of the academic year of 1896: each year begins for him with an exactitude which harmonises with his ethos that had nothing of the critical abrasiveness of a university which alone can cut and polish judgment, should by himself

9 Only the great abbeys of St Albans and Bury, with their huge resources and their monastic extent, received, received the same or more attention. He wrote in "The Benedictine” (1925, 121): “Nowhere are the past glories of monasticism more impressive than in England, and nowhere in England more than in the western Midlands, where the Stratford Avon flows into the Severn. The view from the summit of Bredon hill is one of the loveliest in England, but it must stand alone in the wealth of historical memories that it recalls. The town that gave birth to Shakespeare, the battlefields of Evesham, Tewkesbury and of Worcester, the homes of the first movers of the Gunpowder Plot are all within sight. But the mind goes back more readily to the England of the great abbeys. At the foot of Bredon to the north lies Evesham and Penherits, only a few miles apart; to the west are Worcester and Malvern, distant from each other less than a dozen miles; to the south-west is Tewkesbury, and beyond Tewkesbury, Gloucester; to the south-east Winchcombe, and two or three miles from Winchcombe the ruins of the Cistercian abbey of Hales, where on 29th day of dedication thirteen altars were consecrated by thirteen prelates. And beyond this circle of great houses lies the historic names of England—Glastonbury, Ely, Croyland, Bury St Edmund’s, Canterbury, Westminster—and beyond from again Bex and Chertsey, Monmouth, St Gall and Einsiedeln, Monte Oliveto, Monte Cassino.” Here he expresses his centre of gravity!

of Evesham and Gloucester Hall, Oxford, came to such prominence in the Tudor book, or Marian Westminster refounded from Evesham monks. As a historian, so to say, Fr David is a monk of Evesham.*

But the first forays of the young scholar were not in history at all. They were in literature; and this is important, because it shows that he clearly furnished his mind with intellectual beauty before he disciplined it with the techniques of study (and it can only ever be done that way round). He made himself a poet in prose, opening the boxes of his sensibility to the seasons, to sound and sight and the power of corroding time to evoke, if not eternity, at least permanence. His eye for colour and ear for the swift deft phrase are a constant surprise, which the years have not tarnished. We can see this by taking soundings over the decades:

1923 from Montecassino: ‘Seen under a blue sky and bright sun, Italian mountains don’t look at all like ours; there is no vegetation on their sides, neither forest nor heather, and no crags or screes; only grey rock sloping up at a gentle angle. Above the 4,000 ft line there was snow, in streaks at first and then a covering. The whole view of mountains on every side was “perfectly beautiful, let it be granted them”, but like so much of Italian scenery, me judice, resembling Maud’s face still further “faultily faultless, splendidly null”—somehow lacking the peculiar detailed beauty of an English countryside or the romantic wildness of Scotch mountains... You could see at once what it is that makes our mountains of England so lovely—our clouds, our rain and our atmosphere.

1930 from Downside: Today was the loveliest of the year— the fresh green of the beeches and elms—that unbelievable green that grows
These passages—and they can be matched by others more sustained in his past. Rarely, when he is the historian, is he himself dazzled by the historian must separate the external and social from the inward, spiritual and individual, judging one by the exigencies ... well how by her magic of word and brush to scatter the golden mist of the unreal over the generations of the big books—show his power to perceive and then to move others; and such a power carries its dangers. Dom David warns us himself that the "hilly brakes around." Down here there are solitary patches of them, without the thought that they were losing any hope they might have had of riding the flood across the bar and out to sea.

1959 in the proposed end to RO III: How many generations of monks or canons ... in the cool morning of life, when the beauty of the external world strikes so suddenly and deeply into the mind as a revelation and an anguish, must have paused in the cloister to regard the silence and glory of the December stars, or have met there the breeze of a spring morning, laden with the scent of may blossom or bean flower. These emotions and experiences are indeed common to all, they are not for monks alone and have nothing to do with the deeper life of the spirit; but we are men, and it is in a building where a succession of men have passed from youth to age among the same towers and trees that we seem for a moment to cross the abyss of time and to be upon the point of seeing with their eyes these lichenated walls, once harbouring such a busy world of life and reverberating to the sound of footsteps and the music of bells, and now standing in silent fragments in the mown lawn or framing the byres of a farmyard.

1968 from Hampshire on the graces of Easter: The simple, central, altogether divine truths of the Incarnation and Redemption seem somehow all the more adorable in the midst of the noise and catastrophe and political aridity of the moment. Daffodils, enshrined in so many lines of pure poetry, are associated for me in a special way with Easter, and the music of bells, and now standing in silent fragments in the mown lawn or framing the byres of a farmyard. These passages—and they can be matched by others more sustained in his big books—show his power to perceive and then to move others; and such a power carries its dangers. Dom David warns us himself that the historian must separate the external and social from the inward, spiritual and individual, judging one by the exigencies of given moments and the other by standards of Christian perfection abiding and unaltering through the centuries: he must above all, "if he be an Englishman, resist with all his power the alien voice of romanticism ... escap(ling) the spells of that old enchantress, who has known so well how by her magic of word and brush to scatter the golden mist of the unreal over the generations of the past." Randly, when he is the historian, is he himself dazzled by the golden mist; but where he is involved himself (as in the tale of Glastonbury Tor and the death of Abbot Whiting, or some current controversies in the Church) the warmth of his own brilliant rhetorical powers do something to mollify his proverbially dispassionate judgment. And there are other moments, more personal, which bring us to confront an enigma; and we wonder how the last lines of his two great books were ever written by him.

As a boy he was called Mike, quite naturally. He was the sole son of devoted parents, who were there as a background to his manhood, his mother dying in 1930 and his father in 1944. He attracted a brilliant circle of friends during his Downside schooldays (1910-14), the dying days of the old order. He was a principal figure in the Abingdon Debating Society during his last two years, a society of a few dozen, men doomed to die young of whom one in three was killed in the trenches—and here one glimpses a more callow version of Knox's Balliol set. Amongst them Dick Stokes survived with a Military Cross and a majority, and later a rugger blue, to become with Bishop Bell of Chichester Westminster's watchdog against indiscriminate bombing; and afterwards Defence Minister. Among them too, wounded at Gallipoli in 1915, was Ivone Kirkpatrick, ultimately Permanent Head of the Foreign Office; and Patrick Barry, who became a judge; and Hilary Saunders, author-librarian of the House of Commons; and a little behind them Douglas Woodruff, President of the Oxford Union, Lothian prize-winner and Editor of The Tablet; and but enough: sufficient to say that all that Knox had been to the Balliol set, Knowles was to the Downside group. Both stayed in their cloisters as others went to war, "in token that the house was always watchful to God".

The career of the boy Mike was gilded. He wrote to one of his friends at Cambridge in 1923: "it was my fortune to fail in everything for the first five years of my religious life and most of my school life—fail to get everything I wanted." A curious remark, it tells us a good deal, and it begins also to uncover that enigma which is essentially the inner David Knowles, whom none ever entirely knew. It bears out the adage that the richer a person's potential, the longer will be his development and the later his maturity to a coherence worthy of his powers: to succeed young is to have relatively little to offer. Yet as a boy, he could hardly be described as having failed. He came to Downside as a scholar, founded The Raven in 1912 and 1913, gained Higher Certificate with a distinction in English in 1912, 1913, 1914 and a distinction also in Roman
admitted that English came naturally to him "and—humanum dico—must notice his gifts, literary first and classical—historical second. Asked history in his last year, won the Essay prize and in his turn the Gregorian consciousness as an analyst of men's motives. Thucydides was to occupy him why it was that he had pursued the harder of the two disciplines, he would willingly have been a Shakesperian scholar. But as a monk I felt it was not a starter. I badly needed the discipline of Latin and Greek grammar and composition to make me accurate." For him the Classics were supreme, and apart from Greek and Latin he read all that he could find of English poetry: his Roman history meant no more to him than an exercise in memory, though the Greek Thucydides touched his consciousness as an analyst of men's motives. Thucydides was to occupy him again per longum at Cambridge, but as literature not history, as Macaulay's "Cluny under St Hugh, 1049-1109". All these I read simply as literature.

His war was spent at Downside moving through the novicatite to ordination on 18th October, 1918. In these years the pecunia influence upon the future historian, if it was not Macaulay himself (whose centenary honour he sang in 1950), must have been Edmund Butler, who died on 22nd February 1917 and was buried at Downside among the monks—ipse animo monachus. Bishop had been a Butler man, backing his election from outside the community, but he had become embittered with the Abbot's apparent deflection of the policy of the house away from learning and studies (a necessary deflection of resources in view of the vast school that was growing up): so while the Abbot spoke principally for schoolmastering, Bishop, who had died embittered with him, he all unknowingly sowed two portentous seeds. One night at Chapter he told his monks that for the good of their own souls, if not of mankind, they should always have "a pot on the boil". For Benedictines, he suggested, benedictine history made the best pot; and if any of his monks felt moved to take this up, he would provide them with a fitting subject. Two monks knocked at his door and to the first he gave the task of studying the tenth century monastic reform movement (St Dunstan, etc.): Dom Thomas Syans wrote his first DR article on the subject in 1922 and his last in 1962, crowning his work with an edition of the Regularis Concordia for the Nelson Medieval Texts series in 1968. To the second he gave the task of Cluny, and Dom David settled down to read the last two volumes of E. Sackur's Die Cluniacenser in German: he did not bite at the time, but many times afterwards has he returned to that well. Inter alia, he was later to give valuable direction to Dr Noreen Hunt in her 1958 doctoral thesis on "Cluny under St Hugh, 1040-1108".

Before Sackur, Knowles had already (like the young Churchill) wound through Gibbon in ten weeks, a half dozen volumes of Grote, Clarendon's "History of the Great Rebellion", Robertson's "Charles V", Prescott and Hallam, Creighton and Pastor, Acton's "Lectures", Holland Rose's "Life of Napoleon" and Thier's account of the Moscow campaign. "All these I read simply as literature."

We should note another influence from his own cloister on the budding scholar, besides that of Abbot Butler (whose book, "Western Mysticism" was being researched about this time and was beginning to cast its benignant light over many of the Community, if only through the material it afforded for abbatial chapters). This was Dom Leander Ramsay, soon to succeed Butler as third Abbot of Downside. Ramsay had been a high Anglican who came as a convert to the postulancy aged 35 in 1896. In the last weeks before his novicatite began, he occupied himself in writing a long and severely critical article appraising Archbishop Benson's book on St Cyril for the Dublin Review; and that began a permanent interest in the subject. During 1922 Ramsay was sent to the Abbey of St Boniface, Munich, to collate the manuscripts of St Cyril there, working in the Royal Library during weekdays. Interrupted by his Headmastership of the School in 1903, which lasted till he collapsed in 1918,
be returned during what promised to be a permanent convalescence to his
Cyprian papers. Thinking, not without cause, that Ramsay was a dying
man, Abbot Butler assigned Dom David and a couple of other young
monks to hasten his task of assembling the manuscript material for the
long contemplated edition. Dom David, in conversation down the years,
had always marked this as a moment of academic growth in himself, when
his eyes were further opened to the exactitude of high scholarship. Indeed
this briefly tempted him as a classicist to find his ultimate pasture in the
patristic field of study. (DR 1929, 94-104, 1934, 413.)

When in October 1919 Dom David went up to Christ's College,
Cambridge—living, of course, at Benet House under the "unique and
legendary" Dom Bede Camm—he left behind him in the July DR his
first printed writing outside The Raven. It was (and one wonders whether
Bishop put him up to it) a translation of Dom Jean Mabillon's preface to
Annales O.S.B. III (1706), written in the monk-scholar's last year of life.
This one, significantly in Downside in the early 1930s. Contemplative prayer and monastic scholar-
ship, and it is illuminating to hear him reflect upon his summer 1927 visit to
Greece as "one of my real infidelities." He took with him a pair of
oaks, cypresses and pines. The sky was entirely clear, and the low after-
noon sunlight, coming through branches over the grass, gave the im-
npression of a late summer evening in England, for all the trees were a
dark but fresh green and the Campagna, which like the sea is not in itself
beautiful but takes its beauty from light and atmosphere and has a
hundred differing moods, was this evening a deep mauve". In such a
night...

Cambridge, on the surface of it, must have been very sunny—with a
Classical scholarship (£50) at Christ's in June 1920, and with the
College prize for being placed first among his Classic contemporaries: the
Skeat prize for English literature that October; and at home in his Abbey,
the subdiacurate before Chrismissus. The Classical Tripos Part I in June 1921 brought him first class honours; and at home he was ordained in
September to the diaconate. The Classical Tripos Part II in June 1922 again brought him first class honours, this time with a distinction in
Philosophy (i.e. Pre-Socrates, Plato, Aristotle's Ethics and part of the
Metaphysics); and at home he was ordained to the priesthood on 9th July
a little before he was twenty-five.

Somewhere interlarded between his monastic formation and his
classical athleticism, Dom David had already fitted in two years of
Philosophy (perhaps the early grounding for his book "The Evolution of
Medieval Thought") and two years of Theology and Scripture. Mirabile
diciu, he fitted into his long vacation, another notional year of Theology
before ordination, and that left him a final fourth year to complete, a year
of Dogma and Morals spent at Sant' Anselmo's, the Benedictine house
of studies in Rome. It was from there that he wrote home to Downside
his descriptions of Italian scenery which were collected into a DR article
the following year. He was there with Dom Anselm Stols, whose sub-
sequent work on Anthias, written in German, filled much of Studia
Anselmiana I (1933), and it is interesting to find Dom David reviewing
it in DR.* He was clearly enchanted by Rome, its environs and the people
he met there, though without allowing the golden mist to cloud his eyes:
one of his letters tells us of the view from his window—"Right away to the
left I can see the cypresses of the Protestant cemetery, where Keats lies
and Shelley's heart is buried. Shelley wrote of it that it might make one
love with death to think one should be buried in so sweet a place", but
nowadays the main line of railway to Genoa skirts one side and a tram
route another". But this is not to say that on high days and holidays,
when he went out with friends to the Alban and Sabine hills or the villas
of Frascati, he did not let the siren voice of romanticism whisper in the
trees about his ears: "we drove round to three of the most magnificent
(villas)—large mansions on the scale of Longleat, with terraces and stairs
and avenues and fountains, all among the lowliest woods of evergreen
oaks, cypresses and pines. The sky was entirely clear, and the low after-
noon sunlight, coming through branches over the grass, gave the im-
novation of a late summer evening in England, for all the trees were a
dark but fresh green and the Campagna, which like the sea is not in itself
beautiful but takes its beauty from light and atmosphere and has a
hundred differing moods, was this evening a deep mauve". In such a
night...

The next years were full of expectation for the scholar-monk returned
in his cloister richly trained as a Christian humanist. He had proved
himself at every level that he was later to work on (and here the
Appendix table should be studied), every level that is except mystical
theology. It was natural to surmise that he should be drawn into the
distinguished school and the scholarly tradition of Downside's life, to
live an extroverted, useful, institutionalised life as an indispensable—and
so relatively unnoticed—part of a great living machine. And so it was,
until the spring of 1928, not for long. He was put onto the Classical
Sixth, and the running of the underfifteen XVIs and XIs in the three
games of rugby, hockey and cricket (in his time, he had played cricket
and hockey for Cavendish). During this time his cloister life was deepening,
and it is illuminating to hear him reflect upon his summer 1927 visit to
Greece as "one of my real infidelities". He took with him a pair of
unusual boys from the School, John, son of Sir Edward Herzy, who died
aged 22 in March 1930; and Denys, a fellow Classicist, younger brother

* He also noted in the pages of DR an article of the same year by Stols, "Zur
Theologie Anselms in Proslogion". Stols became a professor of dogma at Sant
Anselmo, dying young soon after the War. Papers found afterwards in his cell
showed that he had spied for Germany. But he should rather be remembered for his 1935 study, "Theologie der Mystik", translated by Dom
Aidan Williams of Belmont as "The Doctrine of Spiritual Perfection" (Herder 1938).
of Professor Jack Hamson, who suffered three years of Dom David's teaching before becoming a Trinity scholar at Cambridge and a Classics double first. These three journeyed from Milan to Brindisi and on to Greece, and their tale is told in a charming few pages entitled "A Greek August", written chiefly for the amusement of John Henry. This month of Grecian sun throws light on two aspects of Knowles' character, his belief that the pursuit of culture without religion was unacceptable for a monk seeking perfection, who must wean himself of it; and his tendency to elitism (to use a strong word). Wherever he went from an early age, he surrounded himself with excellence, excellence in people as in principles; and this necessarily affected the climate of his thought, both monastic and historical, in a certain sense over-refining his judgment so that he became disposed to place too much below the line of acceptability. There is a trace of elitism in all of his historical judgments, a lack of tolerance, which has its own high virtue provided that it is married to sympathy.

An example of this is afforded by the custom known to Oxonians as the Chalet. F. F. ("Sligger") Urquhart of Balliol believed that people are more normal out of term in the eves than under the pressures of termtime. He began the tradition of taking reading parties, hand-picked from the two oldest universities, in the late summer to the Chalet des Melezes, built by David Urquhart in 1864 on the western side of the Prarion, where a pine belt opens out onto the uppermost Alps. Its joys are well described by Cyril Bailey in his memoir of Urquhart. The Chalet Book opens with the year 1891 (seven names listed) and continues to this day; and among its pages are photos which tell us who paired with whom. It seems that Dom David was initially invited because of Urquhart's connection with Downside; his family home at Chewton was only six miles away from the Abbey and the family often went over to Sunday Mass there, especially when Urquhart's nephew was in the family. For Cyril Bailey, "Slig's practice of his religion was simple and most dignified. He was always ready to serve my Mass at Downside and at the Chalet, and at the Chapel of St. John the Baptist, Northleach, where he was accustomed to listening to only one radio programme per year, apart from the news, viz. the Christmas Eve carols from King's College, Cambridge; and that he had watched television only for two spells of ten minutes in his life, a Test Match and Ian Smith being interviewed. A lover of drama, music and literature as he was, he had been in a theatre since 1914 only to see two Greek plays, had hardly ever gone to a concert, and had read no novel since 1930. His time went steadily to his studies and to his spiritual duties.

It was about this time that the first sparks of history were kindled in him, as he brought a long love to fruition in "The American Civil War: a Brief Survey", his first work, published by the Clarendon Press in 1926. It has been called by Powicke probably the best written account of the subject in its time, but what Knowles himself says about it is rather different: "I did not approach the subject primarily in order to discover the truth, but to share with others what the story had meant for me. Some
reviews of that book were justifiably severe on the lack of depth and technical knowledge, and I realised for the first time that history was a totalitarian business—that one could not produce work of any historical value without exhausting or eliminating all the sources available." The book came out in 1926, when the author was thirty.

A new dimension of Dom David's life fully opened in 1927, which has never closed since until the hour of his death. He published "The English Mystics", a book remarkable for its time, before Hope Allen, Phyllis Hodgson, Helen Gardner, Joy Russell-Smith, Sister Anna Maria Reynolds (to select just the women scholars) had yet made their definitive contributions. Its bibliography showed careful research, reaching well beyond Dean Inge or Evelyn Underhill. It was a work largely historical in orientation, and we see in it the young historian forming his mental attitudes and especially his critical sympathies, that habit of searching for the gold while rejecting the mist. "Close and repeated examination of any subject of study", he wrote self-critically, "is apt to make one over-rate its comparative importance; geese are very readily seen as swans; the natural love of what one is pledged to recommend to others—the amor negotii suscepti—is too often deceptive; but I cannot help feeling that the medieval mystics, too long ignored, should be as familiar to English readers as St Teresa or St Francis of Sales. Here lay his heart.

In the spring of 1928, when he was barely thirty, Dom David's school career was grounded though it had scarcely taken off. Abbot Raynolds decided to send him to Michelmas to Benet House, Cambridge, to replace the aging Dom Bele Camm (himself a religious historian in his day). Almost immediately the novicemaster, Dom Richard Davey, fell ill;

...Dom David Knowles, First Classics, Cambridge; Professor, Cambridge.

...Dom Wilfrid Passmore, First History, Cambridge; Abbot of Downside.

...Dom Theodore James, a classicist.

...Dom Damian Jowett, from Cheltenham; Army chaplain, 1939-45.

...Dom Aelred Sillem, First History, Oxford; Abbot of Quarr.

...Dom Theodore James, a classicist.

...Dom Wilfrid Passmore, First History, Cambridge; Abbot of Downside.

...Dom Theodore James, a classicist.

...Dom Damian Jowett, from Cheltenham; Army chaplain, 1939-45.

...Dom Aelred Sillem, First History, Oxford; Abbot of Quarr.

...Dom Theodore James, a classicist.
and off-stage catastrophes that obscure the story of medieval or modern institutions and nations. It is for this reason that Roman history is a textbook without rival for an historian in training, showing as it does the inexorable march of time and the sequence of wisdom and error and their consequences, in which every problem has been isolated and debated by some of the acutest minds of Europe for five centuries.” This view he has repeated to students in letters down the years. I have, for instance, a recent letter from him where he says, “I have always felt that every would-be historian ought to have a course in Roman history 753 BC-15 AD. Besides “placing” history, it (a) is a stern discipline, e.g. source for struggles of the Orders, history of Comitia &c; (b) being self-contained and almost self-sufficient it allows you to isolate cause and effect &c in a way that no modern history does.” From an age before 1928 Knowles had felt the psychological power within him, the appetite to grapple with synthetic complexities by sustained research till they were shaken out and their secret laid bare in lucid, spare and beautiful prose. He had that appetite; and it must be there for a long career, which can never be sustained by duty devoid of natural urge. He wrote later: “I can well remember the purely mental satisfaction of unravelling a complicated story, such as a disputed episcopal election, and finding that in some details at least the documents had yielded something new, and that the truth had been to that extent attained. I remember also the intellectual satisfaction of discovering, for oneself, the movements of institutions and ideas.”

On 1st July 1928 Fr David was being driven to Midsomer Norton (a local chapel of ease) to say Mass, when he was involved in a motor accident which caused him severe injuries to the head and very nearly killed him. He made a complete recovery however in time to take up his duties as novice master in September and to act as Downside’s professor of dogmatic theology. Something should be said of this accident, as some of those close to Dom David have persisted over the years in giving it significance as a sort of “crossing of the Rubicon.” All who then knew him remember it well: some saw it simply as an experience which reminded him that he carried a precious intellect in a vessel of clay and that the time had come for him to go deeper both in his work and in his prayer; others saw it more simply as an upsetting of his whole sunny psyche. Until that moment he had been brilliant, pliable and uncomplicatedly obedient. In the years 1928-29 Knowles laid the foundations for his subsequent career as a medivalist. His previous expertise in the classics would have taken him into the fields of Patriotics and early Church history (as it had taken Newman); but he rightly judged after a serious reconnaissance that these were both near saturation, and that he would more fruitfully follow Gasquet as a west country monk able to read Latin with ease and negotiate thomistic philosophy with some delight. There before him on his own monastic shelves stood the volumes of the Rolls Series, completed a quarter of a century earlier and mostly unexplored—at Downside in particular because the pages remained uncut. There under his hand were primary sources printed but unvisited, patient to patient monks, crying for synthesis as raw material cries for the orderer or marble for the sculptor. The Series perfectly fitted Knowles’ exact needs at that moment, and the needs of English history, as prophet to a mission. In a later letter (MDK to JHCA, 14th April 64) he showed how clear his call was to examine the Rolls series: “When I began, microfilms were unavailable and photostats were only possible (at considerable expense) in very limited numbers. So I ruled out any subject that would imply travel, and I never visited even the British Museum until I lived in London. Actually that was one—though not the chief—reason for my choice of subject. It was quite clear that up to 1216 at least the printed sources were sufficient for a history of English monasticism. When I lived in London [at Ealing Abbey] (and later Cambridge) I took considerable soundings in unpublished manuscripts and came to the conclusion that manuscript research was desirable and necessary for the history of individual monasteries and for full economic treatment, for a general history the value of manuscript research would bear no proportion to
the time spent. It was ‘either-or’, and I judged that what activities I had could be used more profitably as they have been.” Reckoning that scholars were inclined to make a fetish of manuscript work, Knowles declared that his considerable acquaintance with twelfth century manuscripts had not stood him in good stead; and that, conversely, he had often had to cut pages from printed sources in the British Museum and University Library.

So the decision was made and the great enterprise began. Dom David was not altogether on his own, for he often turned to Dom Adrian Morey, nine years his junior, and destined to be in his turn a medievalist of distinction.24 He wrote most revealingly to him, for instance, in October of 1930, saying: “I’m still reading Coulton [G. G. Coulton, the Cambridge medievalist and slayer of Gaunt after he had become a Cardinal] and he has made me very interested. I’m sure there is room for a general history of English monasticism 1066-1539. He (and other books and chronicles) make me feel more and more that life at a big Black abbey from 1200 on must have been even more hard than life here—hard to reconcile, I mean. Still, weren’t a good many of the vocations to the Reformation 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the writing or study anything except English religious history. This time I mean it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the Reforma- tion 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the Reforma- tion 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the Reforma- tion 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings the time spent. It was ‘either-or’, and I judged that what activities I had could be used more profitably as they have been.” Reckoning that scholars were inclined to make a fetish of manuscript work, Knowles declared that his considerable acquaintance with twelfth century manuscripts had not stood him in good stead; and that, conversely, he had often had to cut pages from printed sources in the British Museum and University Library.

So the decision was made and the great enterprise began. Dom David was not altogether on his own, for he often turned to Dom Adrian Morey, nine years his junior, and destined to be in his turn a medievalist of distinction.24 He wrote most revealingly to him, for instance, in October of 1930, saying: “I’m still reading Coulton [G. G. Coulton, the Cambridge medievalist and slayer of Gaunt after he had become a Cardinal] and he has made me very interested. I’m sure there is room for a general history of English monasticism 1066-1539. He (and other books and chronicles) make me feel more and more that life at a big Black abbey from 1200 on must have been even more hard than life here—hard to reconcile, I mean. Still, weren’t a good many of the vocations to the Reformation 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the writing or study anything except English religious history. This time I mean it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the Reforma- tion 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the Reforma- tion 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the Reforma- tion 1500-1640 in England. I now wonder whether that brings it. Can’t we ultimately combine? Two periods? My old dream was the Reforma-
(RO III,129-37) that he finally gave it his full attention some thirty years after taking it out of Bishop’s library. There he lifted it from what it seems to be, an archaic complaint for the customs of the past in an age of iconoclasm; and he brought it to the full light as an epitome of English high monasticism, developed far beyond the Rule, on the eve of its destruction. It is, as he said, an incomplete and disorderly account of the ritual, ceremonial and furnishings of a monastic cathedral church (unique as that institution was to England alone), together with an account of the duties of the obedientiaries and officials. Under his hand it becomes a hymn to so much beauty of procedure and dignity of ceremony that had been a presumed part of the ancient author’s daily experience in the morning and noon of his life. Knowles rises at the end to what Professor D. C. Douglas, reviewing RO III in EHR, judged to be his most lyrical piece of writing on his own life theme. For sheer religious evocation, it is superlative.

That same summer Dom David wrote a small companion to Archbishop Goodier’s little book, “The Jesuits”, entitled “The Benedictines”—it being followed by uniform volumes for the Dominicans and Franciscans. It is fair to say that only this one of the four has lasted, being reprinted by American Benedictines in 1962. With the difficult years of the 1930s in view, passages of the book make interesting hindsight reading. He stresses “the spirit of toleration” as of the essence of the coenobitical life, a mark of charity that is a monastic mainstay, a charity which accepts men as they are and not only when they have measured up to some arbitrary standard never required by Christ. He draws for the most part on the work of two of his abbots, Cadlebut Butler and John Chapman, and on Newman’s famous essay, “The Mission of the Benedictine Order” where he speaks of a monk’s life as poetical, affording matter for true poetry. Containing a historical survey of sorts, it reminded Knowles of the range of Benedictine life in time and kind, and of a lesson he would have need of in his future work: “A monk cannot throw himself utterly into anything. The lines of his life, the interruptions of the day and loss of energy caused by the Office and spiritual duties must always keep him in check. It is part of his obedience and of his poverty that he cannot call his life or his time his own.” (p. 90).

All seemed set fair for Cambridge for Michaelmas 1929. Then in March Abbot Ramsay died and his successor, Abbot John Chapman, changed the plan. Fr Richard Davy, now at again, was restored to being novice master after a year’s sftp leave in South Africa (staying with the parents of Dom Oswald Sumner and Dame Elizabeth Sumner, the present Lady Abbess of Stanbrook). Fr David remained on at Downside as junior master, partially to understudy Fr Richard in case his health should again give way. Dom Mark Pontifex, a year younger than Dom David, went instead to the Cambridge house of studies and remained there on and off until 1970, through the years when Knowles was a Fellow of Peterhouse not so far away. Now free of the work of the school, Dom David took up the editorship of the Downside Review (which has never been so bright as in his years) and became an Abbot’s Councillor. “So I was left with time to get on with my monastic history.” He was left with time also to become a powerful force for good in leading and moulding the juniors in his care, so much so that he began to look like the young man’s choice to succeed Dom John Chapman as Abbot of Downside when the time should come; and it was said of him that, had he not developed very strong monastic ideals contrary to the evident tradition and future course of Downside, he would so have succeeded. It is not a tale to tell here; but it is to be recorded that he was in his person a deep inspiration to those who were following him in the Community. One of the 1929 group of novices wrote of him many years later from outside the monastic life: “Most of us tend as the years go on imperceptibly to lower our ideals or at least to accommodate them to the practical difficulties of life. It is very encouraging when once or twice in a lifetime one meets and knows someone who if anything does the opposite, raising his sights, holding to intellectual integrity, shot through with grace; and is willing to see and accept all the consequences of his ideals.” (Fr Geoffrey Crawfurd to AJS, 25 June 69).

(to be concluded)
BOOK REVIEWS

In this issue, reviews have been arranged under headings in the following order: Jewish biblical studies, Priesthood, theory and practice; Barth's confrontations; Post-formation order: African history; English Church history; General.

First let us comment upon books that should not have been written. Lord Longford has done what all wise biblical scholars and spiritual writers, apart from Bishop Fulton Sheen, have resisted doing because it cannot be done, by the nature of the evidence: he has written "The Life of Jesus Christ" (published by his own company, Sidgwick & Jackson). He has not solved any of the problems of conflicting evidence, nor forborne to read through the Pilgrims and Restoration narratives as though they were "too difficult to harmonise". He has included such medieval legends as the Stations of the Cross... but enough. Then his wife, Elizabeth Longford, has written for her publisher (that is, her husband's company), rather than for the saturated public, a quite unnecessary life of Churchill. Enough it is to recall a remark made by Mark Benevento: "Cromwell, or Napoleon, or Churchill" (or words to that effect). Martin Gilbert has masterfully sloughed through the papers of Churchill, now onto vol. IV, 1917-22; Henry Pulham has written a generous one-volume life; endless military writers have made assessments of him as a war lord and naval person; and a stream of authoritative biographies have dealt with him, not least one by Violet Bosham-Carter—so why Lady Longford's offering?

I. JEWISH BIBLICAL STUDIES


Ten years ago, the Council recommended biblical and theological studies so that Christians could become more familiar with the Jews and collaborate towards development of mutual respect and understanding (Nistra Aosta 4). Several introductory works on Judaism are available in English. The books of Rabbi Jacobs are rather for clerics who seek a deeper insight into the approaches taken by Jewish scholars to relate their faith to the challenges of modern life. "A Jewish Theology" is written simply, without Hebrew quotations, but is extremely dense. The breadth it "not too difficult to harmonise". He has included such medieval legends as the Stations of the Cross... but enough. Then his wife, Elizabeth Longford, has written for her publisher (that is, her husband's company), rather than for the saturated public, a quite unnecessary life of Churchill. Enough it is to recall a remark made by Mark Benevento: "Cromwell, or Napoleon, or Churchill" (or words to that effect). Martin Gilbert has masterfully sloughed through the papers of Churchill, now onto vol. IV, 1917-22; Henry Pulham has written a generous one-volume life; endless military writers have made assessments of him as a war lord and naval person; and a stream of authoritative biographies have dealt with him, not least one by Violet Bosham-Carter—so why Lady Longford's offering?

The preface acknowledges the limitations of the sections on ethics and the role of the Jewish people with reference to the State of Israel, "The details of how a Jew should conduct himself and his attitude to the State of Israel are to all probability the most important. Both of these themes demand specific works to be treated comprehensively. Here only those aspects of them which touch directly on theology are examined" (p. ix).

Does the author give his views on Christian doctrine? Only in passing, except for a few pages on "Judaism and other religions". After alluding to the doctrine of the Trinity in the chapter on divine unity, Rabbi Jacobs notes that Jews and Christians "can fruitfully cooperate to their mutual advantage... but there are real differences between the two faiths which both acknowledge and no good can come from any attempt to conceal these" (p. 26). A book on contemporary Christian "systematic" theology would deal with basic questions concerning the Sacred Scriptures but then might merely quote pertinent passages without examining their context and history. In a similar way, this book uses the Hebrew Bible frequently but only as a basis for discussion. No synthesis of the biblical message is presented. Rabbi Jacobs rejects "fundamentalism" in the use of the Bible, so when he discusses individual precepts of the Torah (Law of Moses) and their development, he declares that "certain spiritual goods or values have become enshrined in Halakhic (legal) institutions, irrespective of their origins and it is these which give the Halakhah its validity today" (p. 225). Here he tackles on a fundamental problem regarding the Jewish way of life.

The reviewer is struck by the absence of a chapter on the Covenant and its signs, circumcision and the Sabbath. They as well as the feasts of the liturgical year are mentioned only in passing. These realities are aspects of worship which place the person of the Jew firmly within the context of time and history. Truly they are so much a part of Judaism that they may be taken for granted. But if they are neglected the sense and reality of community will be lost.

The world owes Israel the idea of the One God of righteousness and holiness. This is how God became known to mankind and clearly God used Jews as the means of this great purpose. When Judaism declares that the covenant is still in force, it reaffirms that Israel still has a special role to play (p. 274). The Jewish people have learned to understand the spiritual potentialities of the human body, and have adhered fast and faithfully to their understanding of God's will while developing a rich spiritual heritage. This is a fact which prompts the Christian to listen and learn more about the roots of his own faith and his share in the mystery of divine encounter. "The Lord shall become king over the whole earth; on that day the Lord shall be the only one... and his Name the only one" (Zech 14:9). The Christian belief in the Trinity is rooted in a faith that the One God is Life and Love. This and the great commandment derive from the person of Jesus as interpreted and developed by Jesus. Each in his own way, Jew and Christian live this faith in the One God and await the coming of his kingdom.

LAWRENCE FREISSEZ

Institute of Judeo-Christian Studies

Seton Hall University,
South Orange, New Jersey 07079.


As its title implies, the purpose of this book, by the Reader in Jewish Studies at Oxford, one of the distinguished international team working on the Dead Sea Scrolls, is to situate Jesus in his Jewish context. In major and very thrilling sections of the book, Jesus stands in a line of Galilean charismatic teachers. Galilee, "Galilee of the Gentiles", was forcibly converted to Judaism only in 104 B.C. and always sat looser to the Law than orthodox Judaism could stomach. With the help of such tendentious arguments of the synopsis peripeteia about clean and unclean foods Vermes maintains that Jesus' attitude towards the Law does not go further than that of other respected Galilean teachers of the period, for the most honoured Galilean rabbis would have their Jerusalem colleagues by such elementary breaches of religious etiquette as walking alone at night or speaking to a woman in the street.
Much of his teaching stands in the line of other charismatic teachers of the time, and his miracles are far from unique among the rabbinic records of claims for contemporaneous Galileans.

After this positive part Vermes embarks on an examination of the titles given to Jesus in the synoptic gospels (the evidence of John is considered next). The prophet, 'Messiah', son of man and son of God. Most interesting is Vermes's work on the title son of man. He admits that this is in fact a title, and Jesus's resurrection. In English the impersonal “one” is often used in this sense, particularly by certain speakers, and Vermes regards it as a personal idiosyncracy of Jesus' speech. Traditionally, of course, the expression has been regarded as an allusion to Daniel's vision of a son of man coming on the clouds of heaven to the ancient of days and receiving from him all power. But Vermes has evidence for Jesus' consciousness of the uniqueness of his position: even apart from Iron, it is too cavalier with some of the evidence ("... one knows ... not even ... the Father" cannot be disposed of so easily), in a field where one piece of evidence can dramatically alter the whole picture. The challenge is important and refreshing, but the enduring contributions of the book are the replacement of Jesus in his Galilean context, and the thorough work on the contemporary use of the formula son of man.

Henry Wansbrough, O.S.B.

II. PRIESTHOOD, THEORY & PRACTICE


In 1969 the Irish theologian David N. Power, a priest of the Oblates of Mary Immaculate, published a distillation of the doctoral dissertation he had prepared at the Liturgical Institute of Saint Anselm in Rome under the title "Ministers of Christ and his Church: the Theology of the Priesthood". This excellent study of the evolving theology of ministerial priesthood from the NT to Vatican II has now found a more popular and far less scholarly sequel, shrunk to 32 pages and scholarly apparatus. This seeming simplicity conceals a mass of footnotes and scholarly apparatus.

Fr Power resists here, with his own lucid and trenchant analysis and comments and the important contemporary work on the theology of the Church's ministry, including an important section of the reader's own "Stewards of the Lord" (1970).

Fr Power stands foursquare within the tradition which he so ably expounds and interprets, in equal loyalty to the evidence of the NT, the Fathers, and the Councils of Trent and Vatican II. His presentation of the Tridentine doctrine of a ministerial priesthood is especially good. He shows how different Trent's teaching was (notably on the point, alas) from the account commonly given of it in the manuals of theology in use in Catholic seminaries until the eve of Vatican II. Any reader who doubts this statement need only read and ponder the excellent chapter on "The Sacrifewing Priesthood". With clarity and devastating understatement (a hallmark of the book, for Power is neither a radical nor a rabble-rouser) he shows how, for polemical reasons and through insufficient knowledge of his own doctrinal tradition, we ended up in a theological blind alley and ended up trying to define a ministerial priesthood within the NT evidence and hence with the Church's authority. When one realizes that the condemnation of Anglican orders is largely based upon this false understanding of the Church's ordained ministry, the ecclesiastical significance of this fateful development is at once obvious.

No less valuable is Power's emphasis on the primacy of the ministry of the word, which in a fine chapter entitled "The priest and the secular: a prophetic ministry", and throughout the book. But he is always balanced. Nowhere does he succumb to the temptation of exalting the functions of apostolic witness, prophecy, and teaching (which on p. 27 be carefully distinguished from each other) at the expense of the priest's cultic ministry, especially as president of the worshipping community. Currently controversial questions are not side-stepped, the extensive treatise of sacramental character being especially fine.

Fr Power concludes that in this time of crisis for the Christian faith "our main concern can ill afford to be a recruitment of priestly vocations whose aim is to provide the Church with ministers of the sacraments in the old style (and he has already shown that this means "the style of the last few centuries only") or with administrators of established organisations. He believes that the process of selecting and training candidates for ordination must change radically and that in this happens "many who are now deploring the present situation find that the Church is adapting itself to the needs of our time". This volume deserves the widest dissemination amongst the clergy. Indeed it is tempting to apply to the reading of this book the suggestion recently made, with regard to clerical marriage, by a critic far more critical than Fr Power: that it be made optional for priests, but compulsory for bishops.

"The Priesthood of Man" is as different a book as could conceivably be written on the same subject. In the best sense this new book is an attempt to provide a new vision of the priesthood in all its aspects, spiritual and communal, as well as to present a new vision of the Church. Anthony Duncan appears to be the Church of England's answer to Alan Watts and Dom Bede Griffiths: an Anglican priest equally comfortable with Catholic theology and traditions as it is with his own tradition of contemplation and the Eastern Rite. Power is more "alternative" and more "spiritual", as he is more personal, than Duncan. But in his own way, he is just as convincing, especially in his discussion of the Eucharist. Power is not afraid of controversy and his book contains some affirmations that are not shared by all readers. For example, he includes a chapter on the nature of the Eucharist, focusing on the idea of Christ's presence in the Eucharist as a real, not merely spiritual, presence. This chapter is challenging and thought-provoking, and it is likely to provoke discussion among readers. Overall, this book is a valuable contribution to the ongoing discussion about the nature of the priesthood and the nature of the Church.
Peter Hinchliff, CYPRIAN OF CARThAGE and the UNiTY of the CHURCH: GeoRGe Chapman 1974 p. 154 £3.75.

Canon Hinchliff tells us in his introduction that he wrote this book "largely for fun", but certainly the result is a scholarly and arresting reappraisal of a great subject. The book is readable and vivid, taking us through the story of Cyprian, and on to his fascinating discussion of Unity. The chapters unfortunately they are fourteen pages of bibliographical and critical notes. A very odd misprint on p. 51 makes "place" appear as "placeecee".

The book is well produced, with an attractive jacket picturing an early Christian funerary mosaic from Carthage. There are fourteen pages of bibliographical and critical notes. A very odd misprint on p. 51 makes "place" appear as "placeecee".

Chapter 2 surveys Carthage historically and topographically, and would make good reading for a prospective visitor to North Africa. The national cult of Saturn and Caelestis is described. The author in all this leans apparently on books such as Charles-Perard, "Daily Life in Carthage", and Dr Fried, "The Donatist Church". In chapter 3 we are introduced in earnest to Cyprian, concerning whose early life little is known, but who was converted from paganism in middle age and became bishop of the Carthaginian Christian community in 248. There are valuable glimpses such as that of a third-century Eucharist (rather like the Anglican "series 3"), and the unseemly rush of Christians at Carthage to get their sacrifice certificates in the persecution of Decius. Hinchliff does not try to gloss over Cyprian's own disreputable withdrawal from the scene of danger in 250 (pp. 64-7), and it is perhaps right in suggesting that this is a case of a slightly pompous cleric being conscientiously convinced of the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.

The problem of what was to be done with the lapse of the eating of consecrated bread greatly worried Cyprian, and is discussed in chapters 5 and 6 (Cyprian's De Lapsis is summarised on pp. 42-5). The bitter acrimony which arose in the Church over the necessity of his continued existence for the Church. It did not help Cyprian's reputation in Rome that at the very moment when news of his flight reached the city Pope Calhban had just suffered a heroic martyr's fate.
This essay, so helpful when first presented in Germany and immediately translated into other languages, is already dated largely through Rahner’s own reflections on magisterial utterances provoked by the ongoing non-reception of the encyclical and by the precarious “working agreement” reached with Hans Küng.

These pages, so rich in theological method, are recommended with the above reservation. For every Christian, as Augustine, Aquinas and now Rahner insist, is a theologian at least to the extent that he seeks to make his faith more intelligible to himself and others. Rahner’s own transcendent method, within the limitations which restrict every theological person in a pluralist context, is a framework which every Christian uses whether he explicitly realizes it or not. And theology for everyone, daily life is determined by one’s daily problems. All Christians like Rahner, are simultaneously both systematic and non-systematic in their reflections on their commitment to Christ in the power of the Spirit. “My existence as a theologian is my reflection on the Christian commitment, especially in the last twenty years, has been with systematic theology. Yet this has been characterized by the fact that I have had to treat almost exclusively of individual schemes in an unsystematic manner and as dictated by the needs of the moment.” (p. 69). So in a sense have we all. These investigations by a master investigator of individual schemes are worth the time and stretching it takes to confront them.

EDWARD P. ECHLIN

Karl Rahner Theological Investigations, Volume Twelve, Confrontations

In “Confrontations II” Rahner addresses himself to many of the most pressing ecclesiological questions of the late sixties and, therefore, of the eighties. He divides it into two parts, recalling the famous intervention of Cardinal Siemens early in Vatican II, the Church ad intra and ad extra. Significantly, the first part, which Rahner simply calls “Ecclesiology”, is much longer than “Church and Society”, reflecting Fr Rahner’s own interest in the internal structure of the Church and his visible discomfort with the political theology which engendered theologians of the late sixties and the revolution theology which succeeded it. The latter Rahner somewhat truculently dismisses (in a footnote) as “dissections of old principles with a race change of emphasis in the direction of a revolutionary pathos”. (p. 264, n. 23). One wonders how familiar Rahner really is in the best Latin American theology of revolution; and one anticipates his response to Gutierrez, Segundo et al in Volumes XIII and XIV of the series under review.

Once again and as always Rahner does not evade the most difficult questions of the moment. A brief description of the chapters will illustrate this and provide a glance at the contents. Rahner confronts the crises of authority and the teaching office; the theology of the priesthood; the renewed diocesan; the charismatic movement and hierarchy; anonymity; Christianity; Pius vii; and the Church as a group of friends. The works of many of Rahner’s favourite insights are brought to bear on modern ecclesiology. He grounds Church structures within the Church; authority and the ministry come from Christ because they derive from the Church. One key insight that surfaces repeatedly is Rahner’s view that grace is incarnational, while all reality is sacred, grace is fully operative only when it becomes visible. Hence the sacraments, especially Orders and the restructuring of the diocesan; and the word for mission to anonymous Christians. Another theme is Rahner’s insistence that the priest, even in the diaspora situation, must be the primary preacher in the community and his preaching must be informal. The result of this position was that in the pluralistic Church of the future few if any new doctrinal developments will be defined by the hierarchy of truths, within the hierarchy of truths.

Rahner also provides good pastoral insights for the conflicts within the Church today. He realizes that schisms are usually intertwined with heresy at least to the extent of implicitly denying authority or unity. But he recommends that in cases of conflict where persons “hang loose” from certain disciplines the discernment of spirits should be applied to discover where the Spirit moves. He adds that many ordinary believers live the hierarchy of truths when they neither deny nor explicitly appropriate some secondary truths. He repeats his thesis that it is “good today to distinguish doctrine and theological interpretation because every dogma contains interpretation which is not identical with it and from which it cannot be separated. He recognizes, without solving the problem, that the necessary adherence to one Creed involves a trans-cultural leap and that even the Creed includes theological interpretation. He reaffirms the pastoral benefit of a celibate priesthood but acknowledges that only by the necessary priesthood may be forthcoming in a pluralist and non-territorial ministry. He is open to the possibility of persons gifted with charismatic sharing in teaching and prophetic roles but without eliminating the historic episcopate and the preaching priesthood.

There are places where one might wish Rahner had said more—or less. Rahner argues that the discontinue was restored not as a reprivilegation (return to a more perfect past) but because of the incarncational dynamism of grace. He might have added that the discontinue fulfills the need for leadership in the Church in its unprecedented period of service to the world and that the docent is an intermediary between the eucharist and this service. Not all would agree with Rahner in his acceptance of the thesis of Gogarten and Cox that secularization is in the main a Christian legacy. The ethos of the Church in the East seems to contradict this thesis.

This volume is well worth reading. Rahner is not at full strength when dealing with the Church and society but his thematic confrontation with ecclesiological issues rich and rewarding.

EDWARD P. ECHLIN

IV. POST REFORMATION ORDERS


Fr Osuna does not write as an historian. His study of the origins of the Society of Jesus, though grounded in a thorough knowledge of the main Jesuit documents, is not intended to illuminate our understanding of the sixteenth century but to inspire us in the present. Prompted by the popularity of the ideals of community life, he has produced a detailed account of the development of the small group of students in Paris led by Ignatius into the company of the Jesuits. Here he hopes to find a model for reform. The insights he has gained in this work into the primitive community of service to the world and that the deacon is an intermediary between the eucharist and this service. Not all would agree with Rahner in his acceptance of the thesis of Gogarten and Cox that secularization is in the main a Christian legacy. The ethos of the Church in the East seems to contradict this thesis.

Cautious and ponderous, his account never quite answers the central problems of how the students in Paris conceived of such an association as the Society of Jesus, and became sufficiently united to form it. The group is not put into an historical context, and Fr Osuna shows little imagination in explaining its motivation. His practical and theological conclusions are not especially remarkable. The work suffers from an opaque style which the translation has done little to redeem.

In a pity that Fr Osuna turned this thesis into a book; it could have been a successful article. However, the next volume can be awaited with interest. How did a group of friends produce Constitutions which were the most sophisticated expansion of the doctrine of obedience and disciplined structure hitherto devised?

EDWARD GIBBEN
The Oratory, working under the most diverse conditions. Canon lawyers prefer tidy solutions; Raleigh Addington Faber, Poet and Priest. D. Brown and Sons Ltd., Cowbridge and Bridgend, Glamorgan 1974 351 p £2.95.

Frederick Faber is usually remembered for his religious sentimentality and the Bowery rhetoric of his spiritual books and hymns. They are not to the modern taste. As a result he has been largely overlooked in the many studies of nineteenth century literature and English Church history which have been published in recent years. Because of this neglect, Fr Raleigh Addington's selection from his letters is particularly welcome and an introduction to Faber as a man, poet and priest.

In the first place, at a cost so low that it is astonishing these days, the volume has been produced lavishly, in a way its subject would surely have approved. The paper is of good quality, the volume opens easily. The headings in the book and the dates under which the letters for each year are grouped, have been decorated. There is a copy of the Faber family tree from 1671 to the present day, a list of correspondents included in the selection, a list of Faber's chief writings and a full index of persons referred to. Further, the coloured frontispiece of Faber in his mid-thirties, handsome and elegantly groomed, makes it possible to understand how he could attract people to him so vividly—a fact that the more familiar portraits of the older, hallowed man have made seem unlikely. To the letters Fr Addington has supplied a concise commentary which alerts the reader to their salient points and explains whatever may be obscure. He has also written an admirable introduction and dated it in Faber's old way: "Feast of Blessed Juvenal Ancilla."

The letters themselves are valuable for the information they give about Faber's part in the Oxford Movement and the establishing of the Oratory in London, and also as evidence of his ultramontanism, which was perhaps less clear-cut than is commonly supposed. Principally, however, they are a revelation of the writer. According to John Bowden, his first biographer, the purpose of Faber's life from first to last was religious. Certainly that is the impression these letters make, and that religiousness was religious. Nevertheless, that "true faith is not shown here below in peace, but rather in conflict" ("Parochial and Plain Sermons" V. p. 210). Moreover, by a strange coincidence, while reading the letters, I was given the typescript of a sermon and found these words in the first paragraph: "There are perhaps three main areas of conflict in our lives. We are firstly divided in ourselves, secondly we are in conflict with others throughout our lives; thirdly we are in conflict with God." These words seem the key to Faber as he is revealed in these letters: a man of faith, whose faith was expressed through a lifelong struggle with himself, with others and with God. He was in conflict with God, at least early in his life, through the immediacy with which he perceived the beauty of nature, something which in the event deepened his grasp on the sacramental principle.

It is hard to be both brief and just. Although he was often ill and could become depressed, Faber's conflicts were not ridden with anxiety. He remained joyful, humorous and ebullient, always capable of lapsing into the lyrical bad taste for which he is remembered too exclusively. His reputation does him too little justice. Ronald Chapman observed that he is "more attractive as a letter writer from as a writer on spiritual matters," this book confirms that judgment.

Oriel College, Oxford.

R. C. G. Glover. The Juridical Nature of the Oratory and Oratorians Today. T. C. G. Glover is Fr. Glover's doctoral thesis with which he took a summa cum laude at the Angelicum. A member of the Oratory founded by St Philip Neri himself, Fr Glover draws skillfully on original documents to illustrate the title theme over the years from Neri to today. Especially interesting is his analysis of the relationship between Oratorians and local ordinaries; and the extent to which Oratorians are bound by their Constitutions to follow the evangelical counsels. Are Oratorians quasi-religious or are they secular priests living in community, seeking perfection without vows? Such questions are here answered with a legal precision unknown to previous works; whereas some Oratorians reckon that more harm than good would be done by a radical revision of the new Constitutions before they have had a real chance of forming a new generation. Ambiguities pointed out by Fr Glover will surely be tackled by the General Congress of 1975; and, though the emphasis will be pastoral rather than legal, all who attend it would profit from a careful reading of this thesis.

T. C. G. Glover, Cong. O.Carm.

V. African History


Before the Second World War historical writing about Africa was done by a coterie of specialists; in the last twenty years the increase in information and of histories concerning this country or that has been so considerable that an over-all view was becoming impossible. Fr. Freeman-Grenville, for the benefit of all students and lovers of Africa, has set his hand to the herculean task; it is a very notable achievement.

The author is admirably qualified to compile such a work, as he has specialist knowledge of East African history, particularly with regard to the ancient trading posts on that coast, and most of West Africa where he lectured on African History. He is a Kiswahili expert, and the newly unearthed documents in that language, dating back as far as the sixteenth century, are important for the elucidation of that world of Arab, Indian, perhaps Chinese and of course African traders.

Wisely he is extremely cautious in giving precise dates, as so much depends in African history on oral tradition and on radio carbon analysis—whose margin of error can be a hundred years or so. It must be remembered that much of the Sahara writing came only with the Arabs, and that slowly. Occasionally a flood of light has cast on the scene as with the "Periplus of the Erythraean Sea", written by an anonymous official in Alexandria, describing the trade of the Red Sea, eastern Africa, and South Arabia with India and China (cf. c. 106 AD., p. 20). By and large, the data in the early centuries has to depend on oral traditions, coins and beads, iron, wood, and pottery.

The layout—so important in a chronology of this kind—has been skillfully done. From 1000 BC to 395 AD we have four columns to a page: Egypt, the Sudan, and East Africa; then North Africa and West Africa together; followed by Western Asia, and finally Europe. One of the merits of the book is that Africa is thus not treated in isolation but always set in world history. After 600 AD, of course, Africa South of the Sahara begins to demand attention. Before the Second World War, Dr Freeman-Grenville, for the benefit of all students and lovers of Africa, has set his hand to the herculean task; it is a very notable achievement.

The author is admirably qualified to compile such a work, as he has specialist knowledge of East African history, particularly with regard to the ancient trading posts on that coast, and most of West Africa where he lectured on African History. He is a Kiswahili expert, and the newly unearthed documents in that language, dating back as far as the sixteenth century, are important for the elucidation of that world of Arab, Indian, perhaps Chinese and of course African traders.

Wisely he is extremely cautious in giving precise dates, as so much depends in African history on oral tradition and on radio carbon analysis—whose margin of error can be a hundred years or so. It must be remembered that much of the Sahara writing came only with the Arabs, and that slowly. Occasionally a flood of light has cast on the scene as with the "Periplus of the Erythraean Sea", written by an anonymous official in Alexandria, describing the trade of the Red Sea, eastern Africa, and South Arabia with India and China (cf. c. 106 AD., p. 20). By and large, the data in the early centuries has to depend on oral traditions, coins and beads, iron, wood, and pottery.

The layout—so important in a chronology of this kind—has been skillfully done. From 1000 BC to 395 AD we have four columns to a page: Egypt, the Sudan, and East Africa; then North Africa and West Africa together; followed by Western Asia, and finally Europe. One of the merits of the book is that Africa is thus not treated in isolation but always set in world history. After 600 AD, of course, Africa South of the Sahara begins to demand attention. Before the Second World War, Dr Freeman-Grenville, for the benefit of all students and lovers of Africa, has set his hand to the herculean task; it is a very notable achievement.

The author is admirably qualified to compile such a work, as he has specialist knowledge of East African history, particularly with regard to the ancient trading posts on that coast, and most of West Africa where he lectured on African History. He is a Kiswahili expert, and the newly unearthed documents in that language, dating back as far as the sixteenth century, are important for the elucidation of that world of Arab, Indian, perhaps Chinese and of course African traders.

Wisely he is extremely cautious in giving precise dates, as so much depends in African history on oral tradition and on radio carbon analysis—whose margin of error can be a hundred years or so. It must be remembered that much of the Sahara writing came only with the Arabs, and that slowly. Occasionally a flood of light has cast on the scene as with the "Periplus of the Erythraean Sea", written by an anonymous official in Alexandria, describing the trade of the Red Sea, eastern Africa, and South Arabia with India and China (cf. c. 106 AD., p. 20). By and large, the data in the early centuries has to depend on oral traditions, coins and beads, iron, wood, and pottery.

The layout—so important in a chronology of this kind—has been skillfully done. From 1000 BC to 395 AD we have four columns to a page: Egypt, the Sudan, and East Africa; then North Africa and West Africa together; followed by Western Asia, and finally Europe. One of the merits of the book is that Africa is thus not treated in isolation but always set in world history. After 600 AD, of course, Africa South of the Sahara begins to demand attention. Before the Second World War, Dr Freeman-Grenville, for the benefit of all students and lovers of Africa, has set his hand to the herculean task; it is a very notable achievement.

The author is admirably qualified to compile such a work, as he has specialist knowledge of East African history, particularly with regard to the ancient trading posts on that coast, and most of West Africa where he lectured on African History. He is a Kiswahili expert, and the newly unearthed documents in that language, dating back as far as the sixteenth century, are important for the elucidation of that world of Arab, Indian, perhaps Chinese and of course African traders.

Wisely he is extremely cautious in giving precise dates, as so much depends in African history on oral tradition and on radio carbon analysis—whose margin of error can be a hundred years or so. It must be remembered that much of the Sahara writing came only with the Arabs, and that slowly. Occasionally a flood of light has cast on the scene as with the "Periplus of the Erythraean Sea", written by an anonymous official in Alexandria, describing the trade of the Red Sea, eastern Africa, and South Arabia with India and China (cf. c. 106 AD., p. 20). By and large, the data in the early centuries has to depend on oral traditions, coins and beads, iron, wood, and pottery.
with six columns in all. Now South Africa and Central Africa also begin to emerge from almost complete obscurity. After 1900 the centre of the stage is no longer Northern Africa, West Africa, Central Africa, Eastern Africa and Southern Africa each has a column to itself. The total number of entries is about 12,000. But this is not all; the Index of 39 pages with four columns each—a major work in itself—increases the value of the book enormously.

Last century a chronology of this kind might have continued itself to political dates. Naturally here we have the rise of kingdoms, e.g. of Meroe with a life of a thousand years, of Egypt. But there is much besides; the movements of tribes—e.g. the Maasai on the line, the Bantu peoples. We can follow the evangelization of Africa from the early Church in North Africa and Fumetditus in Ethiopia to the heretics and little known Portuguese missionaries in the fifteenth century (e.g. Congo), culminating in the penetration from East and West by the White Fathers, the Holy Ghost Fathers, the Mill Hill Fathers and others, to say nothing of the vast numbers of Protestant Churches and sects. But parallel with these we can see the slow but persistent thrust of Islam from the East, almost from the time of Mahomet. The confrontation of these two world religions is right across the centre of Africa from East to West, and the end of the story is yet to come.

For many the main interest will be the very recent emergence of the African States and the development of Apartheid in South Africa and Rhodesia. These events are given month by month, with every shift of the wind.

If the reviewer may be allowed to give his own preferences (after the missionary information), one is the surprisingly frequent contacts for centuries between East Africa and the Far East—India and China—beginning with the sending of two African women to the Chinese court in a Javanese embassy in 614, going on to the huge Chinese fleet that appeared off Malindi in 1417-19 and again in 1421-2 under Cheng Ho. And then, as a salutary lesson in humility, there is the trail of honor from the early Church in North Africa and Frumentius in Ethiopia to the heroic and little known Portuguese missionaries in the fifteenth century (e.g. Congo), culminating in the penetration from East and West by the White Fathers, the Holy Ghost Fathers, the Mill Hill Fathers and others, to say nothing of the vast numbers of Protestant Churches and sects. But parallel with these we can see the slow but persistent thrust of Islam from the East, almost from the time of Mahomet. The confrontation of these two world religions is right across the centre of Africa from East to West, and the end of the story is yet to come.

For many the main interest will be the very recent emergence of the African States and the development of Apartheid in South Africa and Rhodesia. These events are given month by month, with every shift of the wind.

If the reviewer may be allowed to give his own preferences (after the missionary information), one is the surprisingly frequent contacts for centuries between East Africa and the Far East—India and China—beginning with the sending of two African women to the Chinese court in a Javanese embassy in 614, going on to the huge Chinese fleet that appeared off Malindi in 1417-19 and again in 1421-2 under Cheng Ho. And then, as a salutary lesson in humility, there is the trail of honor from the early Church in North Africa and Frumentius in Ethiopia to the heroic and little known Portuguese missionaries in the fifteenth century (e.g. Congo), culminating in the penetration from East and West by the White Fathers, the Holy Ghost Fathers, the Mill Hill Fathers and others, to say nothing of the vast numbers of Protestant Churches and sects. But parallel with these we can see the slow but persistent thrust of Islam from the East, almost from the time of Mahomet. The confrontation of these two world religions is right across the centre of Africa from East to West, and the end of the story is yet to come.

For many the main interest will be the very recent emergence of the African States and the development of Apartheid in South Africa and Rhodesia. These events are given month by month, with every shift of the wind.

If the reviewer may be allowed to give his own preferences (after the missionary information), one is the surprisingly frequent contacts for centuries between East Africa and the Far East—India and China—beginning with the sending of two African women to the Chinese court in a Javanese embassy in 614, going on to the huge Chinese fleet that appeared off Malindi in 1417-19 and again in 1421-2 under Cheng Ho. And then, as a salutary lesson in humility, there is the trail of honor from the early Church in North Africa and Frumentius in Ethiopia to the heroic and little known Portuguese missionaries in the fifteenth century (e.g. Congo), culminating in the penetration from East and West by the White Fathers, the Holy Ghost Fathers, the Mill Hill Fathers and others, to say nothing of the vast numbers of Protestant Churches and sects. But parallel with these we can see the slow but persistent thrust of Islam from the East, almost from the time of Mahomet. The confrontation of these two world religions is right across the centre of Africa from East to West, and the end of the story is yet to come.

For many the main interest will be the very recent emergence of the African States and the development of Apartheid in South Africa and Rhodesia. These events are given month by month, with every shift of the wind.

If the reviewer may be allowed to give his own preferences (after the missionary information), one is the surprisingly frequent contacts for centuries between East Africa and the Far East—India and China—beginning with the sending of two African women to the Chinese court in a Javanese embassy in 614, going on to the huge Chinese fleet that appeared off Malindi in 1417-19 and again in 1421-2 under Cheng Ho. And then, as a salutary lesson in humility, there is the trail of honor from the early Church in North Africa and Frumentius in Ethiopia to the heroic and little known Portuguese missionaries in the fifteenth century (e.g. Congo), culminating in the penetration from East and West by the White Fathers, the Holy Ghost Fathers, the Mill Hill Fathers and others, to say nothing of the vast numbers of Protestant Churches and sects. But parallel with these we can see the slow but persistent thrust of Islam from the East, almost from the time of Mahomet. The confrontation of these two world religions is right across the centre of Africa from East to West, and the end of the story is yet to come.

For many the main interest will be the very recent emergence of the African States and the development of Apartheid in South Africa and Rhodesia. These events are given month by month, with every shift of the wind.

If the reviewer may be allowed to give his own preferences (after the missionary information), one is the surprisingly frequent contacts for centuries between East Africa and the Far East—India and China—beginning with the sending of two African women to the Chinese court in a Javanese embassy in 614, going on to the huge Chinese fleet that appeared off Malindi in 1417-19 and again in 1421-2 under Cheng Ho. And then, as a salutary lesson in humility, there is the trail of honor from the early Church in North Africa and Frumentius in Ethiopia to the heroic and little known Portuguese missionaries in the fifteenth century (e.g. Congo), culminating in the penetration from East and West by the White Fathers, the Holy Ghost Fathers, the Mill Hill Fathers and others, to say nothing of the vast numbers of Protestant Churches and sects. But parallel with these we can see the slow but persistent thrust of Islam from the East, almost from the time of Mahomet. The confrontation of these two world religions is right across the centre of Africa from East to West, and the end of the story is yet to come.

For many the main interest will be the very recent emergence of the African States and the development of Apartheid in South Africa and Rhodesia. These events are given month by month, with every shift of the wind.

If the reviewer may be allowed to give his own preferences (after the missionary information), one is the surprisingly frequent contacts for centuries between East Africa and the Far East—India and China—beginning with the sending of two African women to the Chinese court in a Javanese embassy in 614, going on to the huge Chinese fleet that appeared off Malindi in 1417-19 and again in 1421-2 under Cheng Ho. And then, as a salutary lesson in humility, there is the trail of honor from the early Church in North Africa and Frumentius in Ethiopia to the heroic and little known Portuguese missionaries in the fifteenth century (e.g. Congo), culminating in the penetration from East and West by the White Fathers, the Holy Ghost Fathers, the Mill Hill Fathers and others, to say nothing of the vast numbers of Protestant Churches and sects. But parallel with these we can see the slow but persistent thrust of Islam from the East, almost from the time of Mahomet. The confrontation of these two world religions is right across the centre of Africa from East to West, and the end of the story is yet to come.
Concerning the Reformation, one is left with the impression, according to Mr. Reynolds' treatment of the question, that the psychological break between the nation and Rome did not occur under Henry VIII but under Mary Tudor indeed there were less martyrs under the father than under the daughter. The reforms of the King and Cranmer are presented besides as having been relatively mild; whereas the reactions of the unfortunate wife of Philip of Spain are shown as having horrified her subjects. So we are led to believe that had things remained as they were at the death of Edward VI, bridges might in time have been mended; but after Mary and Pole anything Popish became taboo to the British people—and so till today.

To understand all this story needs a chapter, that does not exist in this book, about the relations of the Court of St James and of Canterbury with Rome, from the moment when after the death of Mary Tudor or after the fall of the Stuarts Roman Catholics became in this country no more than a small sect, which was less and less of a surviving token of the past, and more and more of an alien sample of Irish, Italian or French Christianity.

JOHN CHARLES-ROUX
St Etheldreda's,
14 Ely Place, E.C.1.

C. W. Field THE PROVINCE OF CANTERBURY AND THE ELIZABETHAN SETTLEMENT OF RELIGION (available from the author at 26 High St., Robertsbridge, Sussex, £4).

When Mary Tudor and Cardinal Pole died within hours of each other in November 1558 the Catholic restoration came to an abrupt end. The Elizabethan "settlement" involved a break with the hierarchy of the preceding reign, and nearly all the Marian bishops died either in exile, in prison or at least under house arrest. The attitude of the lower clergy has been the subject of some debate. Recusant writers like Sander and Bridgewater listed some of the causes of the change and explain why it was not as violent as is often supposed—although it is true that Archbishop Whitgift, when he died, was buried in the choir of Canterbury Cathedral.

This book has already been published by Hutchinson in the Theological Resources series at £5; and it was then reviewed by Fr Peter Fennessy S.J. (Spring 1973, 89). That review ended: "Its value is high but so is its price—it is a pity the publishers could not make it available more cheaply." Well, now they have. A listing of the chapter subjects may usefully stand in place of a second review: the existentialist style of philosophising, existentialism and the history of philosophy, the idea of existence, existence and world, existence and others, knowledge and understanding, thought and language, feeling, action, finitude and guilt, in quest of authentic existence, history and society, existentialist metaphysics, existentialist influence in the arts and sciences, an evaluation of existentialism.

Ronald R. Preston
Department of Social & Pastoral Theology, Manchester University.


This book has already been published by Hutchinson in the Theological Resources series at £5; and it was then reviewed by Fr Peter Fennessy S.J. (Spring 1973, 89). This important symposium of twenty essays—half of them specially written for it—was first published in 1966 at the price of £2.50. Its re-issue in a cheaper format is an occasion to draw attention to its continued importance. It begins with a short section on God and Morality and then reprint R. B. Braithwaite's well-known Eddington Lecture "An Empiricist's view of the nature of Religious Belief" and a subsequent discussion of it. The third section has six articles on the general theme of "Duty and God's Will" started off by P. H. Nowell-Smith's attack on Christian Ethics. The fourth section has eight articles on "Moral Decisions", concerned with moral principles, situations and dilemmas. The book ends with the editor writing on: "Towards a rehabilitation of Natural Law". The whole is in no way dated and includes a galaxy of talent from atheists, agnostics and Christians. It is work of this kind which has led to an ongoing dialogue between Christians and humanists on the nature and content of a "human" morality, and to a renewal so drastic that it can only be called a reformation of the dominant Christian moral tradition. This volume will bear fruit for a long time yet.

Ronald R. Preston
Department of Social & Pastoral Theology, Manchester University.

Desmond Seward THE MONKS OF WAR Paladin (Granada Publ) 1974 351 p £1.

In its hardback edition, this book has already been noticed in the Journal, Autumn 1972, 79f. It was well reviewed by the literary press at large. The Economist said of it: "Mr Seward's scholarship is great, his theme both interesting and largely unexplored and his judgment sound". The Scotsman said of it: "Mr Seward makes intelligible the kind of world in which valour and cruelty could co-exist in the same sincere person." The book brings together for the first time the histories of the Knights Templar, the Hospitallers, the Teutonic Knights and other knight orders. There are maps and 24 pages of excellent illustrations.

Ronald R. Preston
Department of Social & Pastoral Theology, Manchester University.
CHAIRMAN OF THE HEADMASTERS' CONFERENCE

Our Headmaster, Fr Patrick Barry, has been elected by the committee to be Chairman of the Headmasters' Conference for 1975. It might be well to explain here what this involves and how the HMC operates.

There are 215 schools in the HMC, of which 68 are direct grant (and, should direct grant status be abolished in the near future, most of these will regretfully become independent). These schools educate 113,028 pupils; of these, 8,380 have places paid for them in independent schools, and a further 15,790 in direct grant schools by the Local Education Authorities. In England and Wales 43,332 pupils are given some form of fee remission (through schools bursaries, LEA grants etc.); and in Scotland 2,918—a total of 46,240 or around 40 per cent. In the last year, out of £23 million spent by all independent schools on capital investment (buildings), £14.3 millions have been spent by the 215 HMC schools—which gives some idea of their scale of operation.

The HMC is divided into seven geographical areas: London, East, South-East, Midlands, North-West, North-East and Scotland. Five of these elect two divisional representatives to the central committee, and two (including ours, the North-East) elect only one each because there are few schools involved from that area. There are five further co-opted members and ex officio a Chairman, Vice-Chairman and Treasurer. This makes a total committee of 20 members. There are nine sub-committees: concerning direct grant, membership, academic policy, public relations, politics, overseas membership, the Services (i.e. Armed Forces), community service and finally the joint standing committee with the Incorporated Association of Preparatory Schools. Besides its work under those heads, the HMC committee is in close liaison with the following bodies: the Governing Body Association (GBA), which includes all HMC schools and some others; the Incorporated Association of Preparatory Schools (IAPS); and the Headmasters' Association (HMA). It also co-operates with the Society of Headmasters of Independent Schools (SHMIS, those schools not a member of HMC); the Governing Body of the Girls' Schools Association (GBGSA); the Association of Headmasters of Preparatory Schools (AHMPS); and the Independent Schools Joint Committee (ISJC, founded in 1974, composed of representatives of the six above bodies to watch the interests of independent schools); and the Independent Schools Information Service (ISIS). As Chairman of the HMC, Fr Patrick will represent the HMC on the last two bodies: he is already Chairman of the northern branch of ISIS.

Fr Patrick has long been involved in the working of the HMC, which—one should say—is an association of headmasters, not of schools. He was Chairman of the North-East area during 1968-69. He was an elected representative on the central committee during 1970-71; and a co-opted member during a maximal three years of 1972-73-74. Chairman for 1975, he then becomes Vice-Chairman for 1976. So since 1968 he has been as involved as it was possible for him to be at all levels (except secretary of the North-East area, which usually precedes becoming Chairman), holding every logical appointment in turn up to his present Chairmanship. He has also served on three sub-committees, the joint standing committee with IAPS, the public relations sub-committee, and in 1973 the political sub-committee.

What will Fr Patrick's work involve? It might be well to list the main foreseeable meetings to indicate how full it inevitably is to be. There is an Annual General Meeting in September rotating between Oxford, Cambridge and another university—this coming year, Manchester University. The central committee meets twice a year at Gordon Square (near Euston Station), where it has a permanent secretariat serving both the HMC and the Headmasters' Association (HMA, the very much larger number of maintained schools' association composed of 1,890 ordinary members, 23 overseas' and 793 associates, i.e. ex-headmasters). The members of the HMC have automatic membership of the HMA, and as Chairman of the HMC Fr Patrick will attend the termly council meetings of the HMA, and any HMC sub-committee meetings that seem required as frequently as need dictates. He will be present at the North-East area meetings, which take place termly, often here at Ampleforth (involving the headmasters of 22 schools). And moreover, as Chairman of the HMC he will attempt to attend one of the three termly meetings of the other six areas during the course of the year. Not taking into account sub-committee meetings, that amounts to 10 meetings throughout the year—but, of course, all concentrated in term-time. He will also be required to be present at ISJC meetings and other ad hoc meetings during the year. As the political and economic temperature demands. He may also have to go overseas to represent HMC abroad. He remains, of course, Headmaster of Ampleforth with all that this entails from day to day.

To complete this account of Fr Patrick's extra-mural activities as Headmaster, he is Chairman of the Conference of Catholic Schools, which met last at Ampleforth in April (being addressed by Bishop Butler, a headmaster of a Catholic high school, and a university professor). It comprises 100 schools for boys, which all have sixth forms: independent, direct grant, and voluntary aided are all eligible. Fr Patrick's Chairmanship runs from Easter 1972 to Easter 1975. He is also Chairman of the governing body of the Bar Convent (IBVM), York, composed of a diocesan representative, two York citizen parents and three LEA representatives. On the ecumenical front, he has been for four years a member of the Farmington Trust which exists to promote Christian and moral values. He has been called on to give talks at educational meetings from time to time; and has other such consultative calls made upon his time.
CHAIRMAN OF HMC: PRESS REACTIONS

On the day that it was announced that our Headmaster, Fr Patrick, had become Chairman-elect of the HMC, a headline appeared in the Times sports column: "Chance for Barry to make up some lost ground". It was, of course, Ron Barry the champion jockey, but soon afterwards the Times Educational Supplement took up the motif with its headline: "Champion in a black habit". The champion turns out to be headmaster of a rural school set on a bleak Yorkshire hillside, grey stone under a grey sky. Here he has spent nearly all the days of his life. Conscious of the school's isolation, he is prepared to travel to talk to groups of parents anywhere in the country. He believes in dialogue; and apparently also in discipline and austerity. "Certainly you cannot be that austere if you enjoy a good joke, a glass of sherry, rich fruit cake for tea and tell as many good stories as Fr Patrick does" (so the TES).

"When old boys think of him they tend to remember that his lights were always on till three or four in the morning. Some suspected insomnia. The more likely explanation is that he uses these hours to think, read and pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from the assault on belief of psychological and sociological inquiry. As a teacher he takes the world fully into account. Schools reflect society, they do not educate them. You must make boys aware of what society is like and of how much depends on their deciding what they are like. Independence of character is of the greatest possible importance . . . there is the need to prepare boys for a society which is both pluralist and secular. You cannot pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from a hothouse.' It is generally agreed by old boys and colleagues alike that Fr Patrick adjusted skillfully to the social winds in his own territory. This augurs well for the future chairman of the HMC."

Fr Patrick's approach to religious education was described as reasonable and open-minded. He was quoted as saying "When old boys think of him they tend to remember that his lights were always on till three or four in the morning. Some suspected insomnia. The more likely explanation is that he uses these hours to think, read and pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from the assault on belief of psychological and sociological inquiry. As a teacher he takes the world fully into account. Schools reflect society, they do not educate them. You must make boys aware of what society is like and of how much depends on their deciding what they are like. Independence of character is of the greatest possible importance . . . there is the need to prepare boys for a society which is both pluralist and secular. You cannot pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from a hothouse.' It is generally agreed by old boys and colleagues alike that Fr Patrick adjusted skillfully to the social winds in his own territory. This augurs well for the future chairman of the HMC."

Fr Patrick's approach to religious education was described as reasonable and open-minded. He was quoted as saying "When old boys think of him they tend to remember that his lights were always on till three or four in the morning. Some suspected insomnia. The more likely explanation is that he uses these hours to think, read and pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from the assault on belief of psychological and sociological inquiry. As a teacher he takes the world fully into account. Schools reflect society, they do not educate them. You must make boys aware of what society is like and of how much depends on their deciding what they are like. Independence of character is of the greatest possible importance . . . there is the need to prepare boys for a society which is both pluralist and secular. You cannot pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from a hothouse.' It is generally agreed by old boys and colleagues alike that Fr Patrick adjusted skillfully to the social winds in his own territory. This augurs well for the future chairman of the HMC."

Fr Patrick's approach to religious education was described as reasonable and open-minded. He was quoted as saying "When old boys think of him they tend to remember that his lights were always on till three or four in the morning. Some suspected insomnia. The more likely explanation is that he uses these hours to think, read and pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from the assault on belief of psychological and sociological inquiry. As a teacher he takes the world fully into account. Schools reflect society, they do not educate them. You must make boys aware of what society is like and of how much depends on their deciding what they are like. Independence of character is of the greatest possible importance . . . there is the need to prepare boys for a society which is both pluralist and secular. You cannot pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from a hothouse.' It is generally agreed by old boys and colleagues alike that Fr Patrick adjusted skillfully to the social winds in his own territory. This augurs well for the future chairman of the HMC."

Fr Patrick's approach to religious education was described as reasonable and open-minded. He was quoted as saying "When old boys think of him they tend to remember that his lights were always on till three or four in the morning. Some suspected insomnia. The more likely explanation is that he uses these hours to think, read and pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from the assault on belief of psychological and sociological inquiry. As a teacher he takes the world fully into account. Schools reflect society, they do not educate them. You must make boys aware of what society is like and of how much depends on their deciding what they are like. Independence of character is of the greatest possible importance . . . there is the need to prepare boys for a society which is both pluralist and secular. You cannot pray. He keeps in touch with new developments and does not flinch from a hothouse.' It is generally agreed by old boys and colleagues alike that Fr Patrick adjusted skillfully to the social winds in his own territory. This augurs well for the future chairman of the HMC."

"Champion in a black habit". The champion turns out to be headmaster of a rural school set on a bleak Yorkshire hillside, grey stone under a grey sky. Here he has spent nearly all the days of his life. Conscious of the school's isolation, he is prepared to travel to talk to groups of parents anywhere in the country. He believes in dialogue; and apparently also in discipline and austerity. "Certainly you cannot be that austere if you enjoy a good joke, a glass of sherry, rich fruit cake for tea and tell as many good stories as Fr Patrick does" (so the TES).

Fr Patrick, during his chairmanship, intends keeping a close eye on the Times Educational Supplement took up the motif with its headline: "Champion in a black habit". The champion turns out to be headmaster of a rural school set on a bleak Yorkshire hillside, grey stone under a grey sky. Here he has spent nearly all the days of his life. Conscious of the school's isolation, he is prepared to travel to talk to groups of parents anywhere in the country. He believes in dialogue; and apparently also in discipline and austerity. "Certainly you cannot be that austere if you enjoy a good joke, a glass of sherry, rich fruit cake for tea and tell as many good stories as Fr Patrick does" (so the TES).

Fr Patrick, during his chairmanship, intends keeping a close eye on the Times Educational Supplement took up the motif with its headline: "Champion in a black habit". The champion turns out to be headmaster of a rural school set on a bleak Yorkshire hillside, grey stone under a grey sky. Here he has spent nearly all the days of his life. Conscious of the school's isolation, he is prepared to travel to talk to groups of parents anywhere in the country. He believes in dialogue; and apparently also in discipline and austerity. "Certainly you cannot be that austere if you enjoy a good joke, a glass of sherry, rich fruit cake for tea and tell as many good stories as Fr Patrick does" (so the TES).

Fr Patrick, during his chairmanship, intends keeping a close eye on the Times Educational Supplement took up the motif with its headline: "Champion in a black habit". The champion turns out to be headmaster of a rural school set on a bleak Yorkshire hillside, grey stone under a grey sky. Here he has spent nearly all the days of his life. Conscious of the school's isolation, he is prepared to travel to talk to groups of parents anywhere in the country. He believes in dialogue; and apparently also in discipline and austerity. "Certainly you cannot be that austere if you enjoy a good joke, a glass of sherry, rich fruit cake for tea and tell as many good stories as Fr Patrick does" (so the TES).

Fr Patrick, during his chairmanship, intends keeping a close eye on the Times Educational Supplement took up the motif with its headline: "Champion in a black habit". The champion turns out to be headmaster of a rural school set on a bleak Yorkshire hillside, grey stone under a grey sky. Here he has spent nearly all the days of his life. Conscious of the school's isolation, he is prepared to travel to talk to groups of parents anywhere in the country. He believes in dialogue; and apparently also in discipline and austerity. "Certainly you cannot be that austere if you enjoy a good joke, a glass of sherry, rich fruit cake for tea and tell as many good stories as Fr Patrick does" (so the TES).
alone with our thoughts and memories. The beauty of the countryside and the wintry day were their own commentary on what had occurred. So they were; and Fr David now knows what St John of the Cross began to know on earth.

The small graveyard is set between the west end of the church and a main road running below the bank beyond; there seemed room only for two lines of graves. In that hallowed stretch of ground beneath the pine trees now rest the bodies of a handful of very ordinary Sussex folk, and among them one of the great Church historians of England. The burial in the chill of a cold November, lit by a dim and reluctant sun through feathery cloud, was very moving to those who knew and cared. One of them wrote afterwards: "It seemed fitting that we should all depart quietly, along with our thoughts and memories. The beauty of the countryside and the wintriness of the day were their own commentary on what had occurred." So they were; and Fr David now knows what St John of the Cross began to know on earth.

FR RICHARD MORE SUTHERLAND (B 46)
1st April 1928 - 10th November 1974

We regret to report the death at an early age (only 46) of Fr Dick Sutherland, a younger son of Dr Edward Halliday Sutherland, the author ("Control of Life", "Laws of Life" etc). He had left his mother and an elder brother only the year before, the latter with the same lung cancer which caused his own death. Another brother had been killed in the War, buried in the Black Forest. A brother remains with two boys at present in St Aidans House.

At Ampleforth Dick will be remembered for being Head of his House (St Bede's under Fr Paulinus), an Under Officer in the Corps, and an Athletics School Colour—he then being tall and trim and nothing of the broad figure he later became despite his asthenousness. In those days he was described as essentially an individualist, with plenty of power of leadership and a little intolerance. All that changed with his years in the priesthood—that is, the intolerance; for none gathered more friends around him nor better filled the part of episcopal secretary among other duties that called upon his tact and sympathy.

Rather than provide a formal obituary notice we prefer to quote in full the letter he sent to close friends (including some in the Abbey) a month before he died, for it gives the measure of the man; and with it the panegyric preached by Dick's own bishop, Dom Christopher Butler, at the funeral on 15 November at the FCJ Convent of Poles where he is buried.
mainstay of my joy and sanity. *O passi graviora dabit Deus his quoque finem.*

In conclusion, may I ask for your prayers for me to have the grace and humility to accept the future as and when it may express itself. I am very grateful and comforted by the certain knowledge of your kindly concern for me and I am only sorry that I should have had to write to you like this and assure you that this letter requires no answer, but just a little prayer please.

Love and God bless, Yours, Dick.

**EPISCOPAL ADDRESS AT THE FUNERAL OF FR RICHARD SUTHERLAND**

I think that most of us here could imagine for ourselves what Dick's reaction would be to the suggestion of a panegyric, and yet I feel that something must be said this morning for the sake of all those who have gathered here, and so many who would wish to be here, drawn by the bonds of that friendship which he gave so lavishly and which he inspired so widely.

So I am in a bit of a dilemma and can only hope that, if asked, he would, in the end, have left it to my judgement. He used to say, sometimes, with the touch of irony that became him so well, that his middle name was "docility"—I think he spelled it with a small "d". But he would certainly have been delighted that we have celebrated this Holy Mass as a Festival rather than as a Lamentation. He held steadily and firmly that a Requiem should be, as indeed of course it is, a joyful occasion. I am sure that he would have rejoiced particularly that his own Requiem should take place in the Chapel of this Convent and this school which he loved so much and served so well during the past seven years. It was during that period that I got to know him and to enjoy his friendship with a very special intimacy, something that I couldn't have deserved, but from which I trust I have profited.

Before that, of course, he had worked in various parishes in the diocese with his well-known energy and compassion and unselfish concern. He had, as is obvious from this gathering today, and from more evidence than can be contained in this chapel, a very wide circle of friends—sets of circles of friends, so many, especially priest friends, and it was really inspiring and humbling for a rather average Christian looking on, to see his practical friendship and his unflagging patience and help that went out to every individual who needed it, but especially, once again, to anyone who shared with him in the priesthood.

He was a very loyal man, Dick, and that bound him to the English College, Rome, and to St Edmund's, Ware, where he had studied for the priesthood. "To go back still earlier in his life, he was always most devoted to his old school and grateful for it, and grateful to the monastic community at Ampleforth, to which he looked for spiritual refreshment (and other kinds of refreshment sometimes I think) and a renewal of strength.

Behind and through all these various linkages were so many others that could be mentioned. There were the particular and the profound ties that united him with his family, especially with his mother, by whose remains we shall shortly be laying his body to rest.

During the later years of his life he dedicated his concern and his efforts and that astonishing organisational capacity that he had, more and more to the quest for unity in Christ. We are particularly conscious of that here in this country. It was a quest which, for him, was entirely compatible with the Catholic loyalty that he had grown up with and made more fully his own. That particular point, I would like to say, is not generally known; on the day of his death, a fellow priest was saying the Church's Morning Prayer with him, and afterwards, Dick gratefully received Holy Communion, less than an hour before Our Lord called him. I know that he would be very happy indeed that our Bishop of St Albans and other friends of his not yet, externally at least, fully united with us in complete communion, have been able to be with us today, and I know that he would be grateful for their prayers which I am sure he has received.

Now I want to say a word or two about these last five months. From about the middle of June he knew that he was seriously, in fact very seriously, ill. He shared the secret with only three or possibly four persons, and I still don't know how much of that reticence was due to shyness and how much to a desire to spare his friends unnecessary sadness and anxiety. He was growing spiritually, as was said in a letter which I received this morning; a new dimension seemed, in this last period, to be coming into his life as though he had found God in a new way and found himself in a new way, too. He met the prospect of early death, as all of us who were close to him during these months know, with gallantry, of course with gaiety, and with something that I think I can only call heroism, though he would have laughed at that word.

When it was suggested to him that he should go to Lourdes, he had an objection. He said he didn't want to pray for a miracle. The fact is that he had learnt very thoroughly indeed the doctrine of complete self-surrender to his heavenly Father in the precise and particular circumstances of the working out of a daily life which was an adventure in a growing love for God. Towards the end, his attitude to Lourdes perhaps changed, so that he would have gone if his health by now had not really precluded it. I think this change was brought about to some extent through it being pointed out to him that he wouldn't go to Lourdes to ask for a miracle, but he would go to put himself fully into God's hands and give Our Lady her opportunity. Well, it was not to be.

We are here today because he loved us and because he taught us to love him. We are all united—and this is the profound secret of our holy religion—we are all united in one love of Christ, his Lord and his Master, but we are united again in a special way within that binding unity, in our common friendship with him, which brings us together, ever those of us who perhaps otherwise do not know one another.
He was the son of a Mother with an Irish name and of a Scottish Father. He was devoted to Scotland but he was also, as we well know, devoted to the great English Martyr, Thomas More. He was attracted by the humanness and the no-nonsense holiness of that Saint who is said to have reserved his last jest for the scaffold. Like Thomas More, Dick would undoubtedly have asked for our prayers for the forgiveness of his sins, and we, of course, have given him and do give him that request with a full heart. But if he had been able to send us a last message, it would probably have been in the words of Thomas More, that we placed on his memorial card: "Pray for me and I shall pray for you and all your friends," (he wouldn't have forgotten our friends) "that we may merrily meet in Heaven."

PERSONALIA

The Abbot Primate, with Fr Abbot's concurrence, has appointed Fr Dominic Milroy to be the Prior of the Benedictine International College of St Anselm in Rome. Fr Dominic left for Rome in January after ten years as Housemaster of St Wilfrid's House. Fr Andrew Beck has been appointed to St Wilfrid's in his place. Fr Dominic's address in Rome is as follows: Very Rev Dominic Milroy OSA, Collegio S. Anselmo, Piazza Cavallieri di Malta 5, I-00153 Roma, Italy. An appreciation of his contribution to Ampleforth will be made in the next issue.

THE APPEAL

Progress of the Appeal has, since the last issue of the Journal, been slowed by the worsening economic situation and this comes as no surprise. There has still been progress, however, and the gross total has now reached £571,000, an increase of £36,500 since the report given in the last Journal. This is highly satisfactory in view of the financial situation generally and it is most encouraging that our many friends should still be supporting the work of the Community and School in this tangible way in spite of their many problems, of which school fees will not be the least.

Work began on the Sports Complex in the first week of November. The site has been cleared and the pool excavated. Foundations and drains are going in and the pool walls are under construction. A large amount of material is on site and the work is up to schedule.

* * *

A remarkable offer has been made by a well-known artist to execute a set of three intaglio etchings with aquatint printed in sepia to be sold in support of the Appeal.

Each print is in a limited edition of up to 150. This and its authenticity are guaranteed by the personal signature and embossed stamp of the artist. Prints are priced at £50 each and will show:

1. A general view of Ampleforth seen from the playing fields. (Plate size 25" x 19")
2. A view of the Abbey and Monastery from the Grange. (Plate size 19" x 19")
3. A view of the West (18th C) front of Gilling Castle. (Plate size 27 1/2" x 17")

Proofs of these prints will be on show at the Exhibition.

Printing will be by the London Studio of Hugh Stoneman, currently printing plates for the Tate Gallery. Mr Stoneman was Chief Assistant in the late 1960's to Bill Hayter at his famous Atelier 17 in Paris where many artists, including Picasso, learned the techniques of etching.

The artist, Juliet de Gaye, studied painting and etching at The Slade during the 1950's. She has had work exhibited in Britain, France and America including the Royal Academy and the Paris Salon. Private collections in Britain, France, Denmark, America and South Africa contain examples of her works.

NEVILL HOUSE WARMING PARTY

The double house begun in July 1972 and christened Nevill House as its character appeared during the building, reached completion last September as the boys returned for the new academic year—it was a near-run thing. To mark its completion—31,000 square feet in all, three storeys high, housing over 60 boys each side, a matron's staff and a medical inspection suite—a luncheon party was held on 5 October in the new building. Guests assembled in one side for a pre-prandial glass and some significant words from Abbot and Headmaster, repairing to the other side for an elaborate fork lunch served by the boys of the two Houses, and returning for coffee to where they began. Afterwards the guests were given a choice between a conducted tour round Ampleforth or a film in the new East Wing geography room of shots taken during the course of the two years of building (it was rather like watching plants grow before your eyes).

The guests were drawn from those who had been responsible both for the design and the construction of Nevill House, some 20 from Arup Associates with their wives and the same number with their wives from John Laing Construction Ltd (from directors to local labourers). Representatives came also from Rosser & Russell, who had done the interior heating and ventilation system, and from several other firms concerned with the furnishing of the new building. Those who came from far away were invited to stay the night in the Grange. Among those present from Arups we should mention two partners, Philip Dowson and Derek Sugden (the latter of whom was detained by illness), Robert Myers who led the design team, Richard Frewer who was the architect, and several other men concerned with the feasibility study onwards, Tim Sturgis who co-operated in the original design, and...
Rod Johnson the site engineer throughout. Among those present from Laing we should mention P. E. K. Horrell the Area Manager, Harry Bowles the project administrator, and the two site agents in turn, Norman Marshal and Joe Cant (who began as site foreman).

The Abbot at the outset insisted that there was going to be only one speech, but that one had to be shared between two monks if only because it was a double house we were celebrating, built essentially by two firms. He began this one speech by saying how nice the people involved were and Fr Patrick ended this one speech by saying what a nice thing they had done.

SPORTS CENTRE

Construction of the new Sports Centre began on 18th November (see photograph) and is expected to take one year. The new plan has been proposed by Swainston, Wilson and Shields of Middlesbrough and the contract was won by Simons of York. We have been fortunate in obtaining a fixed-price tender in the sum of £295,000.

The building is situated on Aumit Hill in the orchard which used to lie to the North of Aumit House and immediately to the East of Romanes Cottage. The building is 53m long by 45m wide and contains a swimming pool 25m by 11m (six lanes), three squash courts and a sports hall 33.7m by 17.5m. There are changing rooms and showers between the swimming pool and sports hall and above them there are observation galleries running the full length of each. The sports hall is wide enough to provide space for minor sports and athletics practice and it connects with a further gallery across the end of the hall which is built over a capacious equipment store and which is stepped in several levels for easy access. The sports hall, galleries and surrounding passages will be covered with a very hard-wearing nylon carpet called Nylfloor.

PARTIR, C’EST MOURIR UN PEU

It is an oft used sentiment, in French or German. Schopenhauer suggested that “every parting gives a foretaste of death”, and George Eliot wrote that “in every parting there is an image of death”. Fr Abbott spoke of the Community’s sentiments before we sang *ad multos annos* and raised our port glasses to the outgoing 92nd Archibishop of York, speeding him southwards to the incoming 101st Archibishop of Canterbury.

In replying with some warmth, Dr Donald Coggan told us two little tales. One concerned “my predecessor, Michael”, who, when he was a professor at Durham before his episcopal days, was given to taking fell walks in what the Services refer to as “undress order”. He arrived back one night to his digs without a key and rang the door bell: his housekeeper came and, looking at the bedraggled tramp before her eyes, said rather firmly: “I am afraid Dr Ramsey is out”. “Oh I am sorry”, replied the man under discussion, “then I will call later.”

The other tale referred to himself very directly. Before a recent farewell Liturgy at the Minster he was shown proofsheets of the order of service. The Gloria gloriously began: “Glory be to God on high, and on earth peace to me…” He approved in principle, and so do we. He joined us afterwards at Compline in the Abbey church. *Ad multos annos vivat*.

BRENDAN BRACKEN & AMPLEFORTH

Andrew Boyle, who is regarded as one of the best biographers now writing in English, has recently produced what he calls a quest for Brendan Bracken, entitled “Poor Dear Brendan” (Hutchinson £5.25): the words of the title are those of Churchill when he heard of the death by cancer of his long-known fast friend in 1957, tears welling up in the old man’s eyes.

Viscount Bracken died as he had lived, an enigma of unexpectancy and self-created mystery. By his instruction his ashes were scattered on Romney Marsh and his papers were burned in the grate of his house in Lord North Street. He left in his will £1,000 to be put to a memorial for Fr Paul Nevin, whom he had known over the years as a governor of Sedbergh School interested in other connected schools. They had met (introduced by Sir Griffiths Williams), recognised each others stature and liked one another; so that from time to time Bracken celebrated in Ampleforth’s guestroom, and even the monastery refectory during the reading of Churchill’s Second War volumes.

The Governor’s connections with Sedbergh are of interest. He was born at Templemore, Tipperary in 1901, son of a prosperous stonemason who was a member of the Irish Republican Brotherhood. He found his way to Australia to be educated by Catholic priests, who gave him to read those books that persuaded him to change his roots from the reality of Irish RC rebel to the fantasy of English country gentleman. So he needed a public school to attach his name to; and in September 1920 he called upon the Headmaster of Sedbergh, pronouncing himself 15 years old and asking to be admitted. To gloss parental difficulties, he claimed that his parents had been killed in a bush fire in Australia, from whence he had just come. Impressed with the “young” man, the Headmaster accepted him—and
The legend tells us that he offered a term's fees on the spot, as his own guardian (none other), in the form of a bag of gold dust! The term being completed, the Old Sedberghian tie being earned, he then disappeared as he had come, going on to be Sedbergh's most remarkable Old Boy.

The £1,000 which came to us in 1957 was substantially spent in commissioning the then President of the Royal Academy, Sir Albert Richardson, to execute an altar set of crucifix and two candlesticks in chased gold for the crypt altar of SS Peter & Paul, where they are to this day.

Handel's "Messiah"

On 8th April 1741, George Frederick Handel took leave of his public. In a "farewell" concert, the former celebrity—now a dispirited and broken man, failing in health and ruined in fortune—announced his enforced retirement at the age of only fifty-six, his creative power seeming a force all but spent. During this period of bleak depression, Handel's thoughts turned to memories of halcyon days, as particularly those spent with his beloved sister Dorothea, who had died tragically of consumption in 1740. Perhaps he would compose a Tragedie in her memory, based on her favourite text: "I know that my Redeemer liveth!"

In the summer of that same year, 1741, Charles Jennens, a "wealthy dabbler" in literature, brought him a libretto, culled from Scripture, of an oratorio tracing the great movement of prophecy and fulfilment in the hallowed promise of a Redeemer for the people of Israel. (Although purportedly by Jennens, the libretto was more feasibly the handiwork of his Chaplain Pooley, and ultimately revised by the composer himself to suit his own purpose.)

The moment was right. On 22nd August Handel duly set to work. Exactly three weeks later, on 12th September, the oratorio received its first performance in England the next year at Covent Garden.

The work stands unique not merely as regards its place within Handel's oeuvre as a whole, but more especially in its sui generis character within the tradition of "choral drama" as developed in the first half of the eighteenth century. Handel's aged successor, Haydn, was able to attain the achievement of an age with his "Creation" oratorio of 1797 precisely because it breathes so kindred a spirit as to influence an audience which by the end of the century must have seemed ineluctable.

It is remarkable that both "Messiah" and "The Creation" are associated with their respective composers' last public appearances. For "Papa" Haydn this was at a performance which took place in March 1808 when he was seen sick and infirm, for the last time. He died the following May, after surviving the French bombardment of Vienna.

Händel's demise is edged with tragedy. (A curious turn of fate links his physical decline with that of his contemporary Bach, both born in 1685.) In 1731, Händel feared the onset of blindness and was operated on by a charlatan oculist named Taylor, only to experience irrevocable blindness as a result. (A year earlier, Bach had suffered a similar fate at the hands of the same man.) At a performance of "Messiah" conducted by the composer on 30th March, 1759, his public saw him for the last time: he died just two weeks later on 14th April.

If we can accept the assessment that "Bach invaded the Himmelsreich: Händel found Lebensraum on earth", it is not because Händel seems a sharper spokesman for us "the people of darkness", who may be brought only by timorous and tentative steps to see the "great light" reflected in the brilliance of such a luminary as Bach? Beethoven's assessment of Händel was in fact very different, and before his judgment we have perhaps no choice but silence.

"He was the greatest composer that ever lived. I would cover my head, and kneel before his tomb."

Alexander McCabe, o.s.s.

Another Realm of the Gifts of the Spirit

Our discussion on Section 13 of the Canterbury Statement in the last issue (p. 3-16) has, as expected and invited, drawn some comment; and it is gathered up here. First, we should apologise to Fr Michael Richards, whose hand-written script was misinterpreted as it was put to print. Page 10, penultimate line should read "the sacrament of Order . . .", i.e. the sacrament that brings disorder into order; and the last word on that page should read "ministry". We should equally apologise to John Halliburton for describing him as "Dr H. R. Halliburton" when his initials are R.J.; it was, incidentally, announced in The Times of 6 December that he is to be Principal of Chichester Theological College. The same day that this was announced, he wrote asking to have the following statement published:

Thank you for printing part of my comments on the Agreed Statement on the Ministry and Ordination in your last issue. In case of possible misunderstanding, I would like to make clear that I do not consider the two commentaries on the Statement to be in any real sense contradictory in their interpretation, though I can well see why this impression could be given. I may also have done the Commission some injustice in suggesting that the Statement attempts "to deduce the reasons for a priestly title from the idea of the priestly ministry of the whole Church". This is not wholly fair, and I duly apologise.

If, in fact, the Statement does not make that deduction, in impression it does come perilously near to doing so. At lectures on the subject, questions from the audience very often indeed focus on this problem and its handling by the commentators, who have rather added to than dispelled the doubts surrounding the wording of the Statement. Perhaps this part of the Statement should be revised in the light of wide and constant criticism.
Mr Julian Charley writes that “I feel you have given a very fair presentation of the discussion, though I confess to feeling that it has all been somewhat of a storm in a teacup”. Referring to Rev George Tavard’s paragraph on “oversight” (p. 13 end) with approval, he says that Tavard “wants to find one neat single argument to explain the role of priesthood whereas I believe that there is no such explanation. Theology is not as tidy as we would sometimes like it to be and is always bigger than our systems.” Referring to Fr Michael Richards’ quotation of Romans 15.16 (p. 11), which he judges only confuses the issue, he says: “What he means is that the Christian priesthood does not fulfill the same function as Christ’s priesthood”, he has grasped only half the point of my hesitation. There is much more to it than that.”

Rev Christopher Hill, who has succeeded Rev Colin Davey as Assistant Chaplain to the Archbishop of Canterbury’s Counsellors on Foreign Relations, holds that the two commentators are addressing themselves to two separate issues, each accepting that the ministerial priesthood is different from the common priesthood: “Bishop Clark is addressing himself to the relationship between the common priesthood and the ministerial; Mr Charley is addressing himself to the different problem of the appropriateness of ministerial language as applied to the presbytery.”

Bishop B. C. Butler writes: “I wonder what you mean by saying that the priesthood of the baptised is appropriated? Certainly a baptised person shares in the priesthood in virtue of his membership of the Church. But then the ordinary man shares in the ordained ministry in virtue of his membership of the ordained group. And I would have thought that sacramental baptism (as distinct from baptism of desire) imparts permanent character that cannot be lost in this life. I should infer that the priesthood of the baptised is as permanent as that of the ordained. Incidentally, if this were so, would it not be possible for an apostate presbyter to retain his priesthood ordination without his priesthood as baptised? This would seem to me very odd since baptism is the foundation of all the other sacraments.” Yes, indeed; the Editor stands corrected.

There have been several comments about the diverse worlds of doctrinal interpretation of grace and our co-participation in the work of Christ—whosoever, for instance, inhibits Evangelicals from wanting to call the Mass a sacrifice. Mr Charley himself makes a similar point: “The problem seems to arise through the different thought-worlds. For instance, where Baranbas Ahern speaks of the power to offer Christ’s unique sacrifice (p. 15), this is language that I could never use, even though I recognize that to many Roman Catholics it does not imply what Protestants would fear that it implied. (Otherwise I find his contribution very constructive and helpful).”

Different thought-worlds, that seems in the end to be the main cause of our differences, and to unravel these patiently and sympathetically is the prime task of the ecumenical theologian.

COMMUNITY NOTES

CATHOLIC MARRIAGE ADVISORY COUNCIL AGM.

Last year Dr Dominian invited the Editor to hear his address to the C.M.A.C. A.G.M. at York University on “The Cycle of Affirmation” (subsequently printed in serial in the October 1973 Tablet). This year the Leeds branch invited him to accompany them to Lancaster University for the whole A.G.M. during 20th-22nd September. Over two hundred members were present from all parts of the British Isles, including Eire. It was a very Catholic gathering, punctuated by daily liturgy. On the Sunday Bishop Foley of Lancaster led the celebration of over thirty priests. The work of the Conference composed two plenary sessions, three group sessions and a final report session. These C.M.A.C. people, called to Christian caring, trained to sympathy, practised in kind communication, moved easily in the company of one another with a most unusual courtesy and swift depth of human relationship. They had learned to love and be loved, and to expect only what was there to be offered by another. Many of them, especially those whose spouse was also a counsellor or close participant of C.M.A.C., quickly admitted that their work, and their efforts to understand the marital stresses of the marriages of others, had immensely affected their own marital relationships for the better. Respectful consideration for others had rubbed off on themselves too. And further than this, to an outsider they spoke a sort of ‘in’ language among themselves that grew out of their fairly formalised training courses—such phrases as “non-judgmental” and “non-directive counselling” came easily to their vocabulary. They are good listeners. They share the mind of Plato, who, when asked what was the best of all Constitutions, replied: “for whom? and when?”. Their motto might well be those words of the Baptist, “He must increase, I must diminish”; for their healing technique is to allow their distressed clients, who must live on together afterwards, to heal themselves. They call on God’s grace for others, and some of it stays with them. This is the best response to those Pauline words, “bear the burden of one another”, and perhaps the best—because the deepest—apostolic work that a layman can offer to his parish. It is holy loving work.

The opening plenary address came from the retiring Director of C.M.A.C., Canon Maurice O’Leary, who had begun his work in 1956, taking over from the founder, Fr Robert Gorman SJ, after he had built up C.M.A.C. for ten years into ten city centres with two more emerging. The Canon began his swan song in these words: “In the garden of Clitherow House, our Headquarters, there is an old sundial with an inscription: ‘CORRECT THE PAST, DIRECT THE PRESENT, DISCERN THE FUTURE.’ This he now intended to do. He said that he found at the sunset that the strength and whole meaning of the C.M.A.C. was not in its priests, doctors, nurses and lawyers, but in the counsellors to whom all else should learn. From them he learned himself that the old axiom of the lay apostolate that like should help like was not enough, that counsellors did need to be drawn from the educationally more privileged, that something more than ‘natural qualities’ was needed to enable a person to develop as a counsellor, that
counselors needed to be carefully selected and trained, often at length, as a formal part of C.M.A.C. work. From this grew up the Tutor system among counselors, the experienced propagating the neophytes and conducting regular in-service training to encourage the growth of gifts and skills.

By the mid 1960s there was at least one C.M.A.C. centre in every diocese of England and Wales; and, though nine centres wilted and closed, expansion has continued until there are now sixty in the country. One was started in Belfast in 1964, and 27 other Irish centres followed; in Scotland the first of six was opened in 1965—and in some ways these Irish and Scottish are the most successful. When in 1968 the C.M.A.C. was called to weather the controversies of Humanae Vitae, it was well able to do it: "There may have been different reactions to the guidance given us by Pope Paul, but there was a recognition that the C.M.A.C. is a service agency commissioned by and responsible to our bishops; and that we do not engage in controversy, which could deter people in need from using our marriage counselling, educational counselling and medical services."

Looking to the future, the outgoing Chairman warned against centres becoming isolated from the rest, growing into elitist clubs concerned for themselves and learning little from others. Learning from others in similar fields is as vital as serving others; and Canon O'Leary cited as a welcome instance of this the pilot scheme provided by the Tavistock Institute of Marital Studies for the further training of six National Marriage Guidance Council (N.M.G.C.) and six C.M.A.C. tutors, who were to go out into the centres to train their tutors. He showed how wide that general process should be, touching on legal developments, medical research, sociological pressures, and theological growth—"We should all be concerned to relate our own experience of Christ to marriage and family, and vice-versa; this is a very real theology of marriage".

The other plenary address was given by the Director of the Institute of Marital Studies, Mr Douglas Woodhouse, who spoke on "Personal Development and Marital Interaction". The heart of his message was the complaint that, since knowledge of people in relationships derived mainly from breakdown situations and since disturbed relationships were so prevalent, the model of "remedial counselling", of counselling aimed at diagnosis and cure, had very early become entrenched, as though it were all a requisite operation. Man's emotional development continues long after physical decline sets in, its compelling nature overcoming all earlier inhibitions or impediments. In face of this potency to growth, should the focus not shift from family psychiatry to family development, from curative counselling to growth encouragement, from skilled treatment to constructive companion? Does marital union not complete the incomplete and liberate the captive? Is it not a folia a duos for mutual gratification and maturation and co-analysis not cease from retreating the charmed path of the past? Au fond, let insight take the place of diagnosis, the organic replacing the medical.

Some indication of the range of C.M.A.C. work may be gained from rehearsing the titles of a few of the group session options. Under Education may be put "planning work with secondary pupils", "moral development in educational work", "work in approved schools, community homes and borstals", "work with the handicapped", "youth counselling" and "planning engaged couples' courses". Under Counselling may be put "seminar for newly trained counsellors", "model case discussion", "making the relationship and reflective discussion" and "counselling the couple together". Under the Legal aspect may be put "the role and training of the C.M.A.C. legal adviser" and "recent developments in the Church's marriage jurisprudence". Under Medical may be put "the temperature method", "the mucous symptoms method", "psycho-sexual problems" and "helping clients who have been advised abortion or sterilisation" (this last perhaps being more moral than medical). Youth and adult, body and soul are all given due thought—and this always in Christ. Prayer for blessing and healing is never far from the work of the Catholic Marriage Advisory Council.

The new Director is to be a Scotsman, Fr Bernard Chalmers, residing at the Headquarters (Clitherow House, 15 Lansdowne Road, London W11; tel. 01.727.0141) The work of the Headquarters includes the publication of such pamphlets as "THE MIDDLE YEARS: Papers presented to the 1971 Conference of Medical Advisers of C.M.A.C." (20 pence); "THE EARLY YEARS OF MARRIAGE: Further papers presented to the 1973 Conference..." (12 pence), and "SEX EDUCATION FOR THE PRIMARY SCHOOL CHILD: Notes for Parents and Teachers" (8 pence)—all still available. In the context of CMAC mention should be made of the National Marriage Guidance Council (NMGC) under the current presidency of Rt Hon Lord Denning, with its HQ at 3 Gower St, WC1E 6HA (01.935.2838). Its work is of the same kind as CMAC, and the two organisations do liaise in their work. NMGC's latest publication is a short book by Anthony Mann, a Regional Officer, "The Human Paradox: counselling in the context of human experience", Bk Dept, Little Chareh St, Rugby, 172p £2.50 paper £1. The author, a German lawyer and 1934 refugee, has been a full time marriage counsellor since 1964. He brings a rich harvest of culture from his birthplace, and is further steeped in our own: all this is apparent in his pages.

Mr Mann begins with an essay on "Belonging & Separateness", for both are implied in a high degree in that most difficult and most rewarding of all human relationships. To emphasise the separateness he takes Celia in Eliot's "The Cocktail Party", Ester in Bergman's film "The Silence" and lines from the poets. Then to illustrate what he calls "Shadows from the Past"—child-competitive and matriarchal inhibiting influences—he draws on Beckett, Proust, Eliot again and some of his own case histories. He next turns to "Phantasy & Reality", i.e. tilting at windmills, being both affirmation and denial illusions: and that takes him to what he calls Fyg...
Having established the ground of relationships within the individual, Mr Mann now turns to interrelational situations, beginning with "Triangles & Triangles". He makes much of three: Trinity, family, Magi, Temptations, perinaeals, persons on the crosses, witches in isles, Graces and so forth—all rather Hegelian. He shows that there are two archetypal triangles in our psychological experience throughout life, Father-Mother-Child and Husband-Wife-Friend, the first often causing an inhibiting shadow upon the second where it has left scars on the adolescent memory. This brings Mr Mann to "The Dynamics of Counselling", where a different triangle emerges, the Friend being a trained marriage counselor whose whole task is neither to judge nor to take sides but to make clients face themselves and their duties.

Of course, being human—that being both a strength and a weakness of a counsellor—the tertius gaudens may well be drawn deeply into sharing the problems of others; so words on "Obstacles to Counselling" are provided, an excellent sermon on commitment and over-concern, consciousness and sensitivity to cries for help, self doubt on the part of counsellors, collusion with one party, et al.—all drawn from experience.

"To thine own self be true": Mr Mann ends with a chapter on "Identity & Integration", what the calls the freedom of wholeness and the art of harmony. Drawing on Dostoevsky, Koestler, Orwell, Huxley, Camus, Kafka and many rather beautiful musical analogies, which indicate the range of his mind brought to bear upon particular persons in distress, he ends by insisting upon the mystery of human personality and his ever-recurring uniqueness, and the need for man to descend to hell as well as rise to heaven if he is to find who he is. Conflict brings self awareness more than peace does; and that brings creativity, and that liberation. And these are found first in deep human relationships: Through the Thou a man becomes I.

A.J.S.

AG ON CONTEMPLATIVE CHRISTIANITY

A.R. Mowbray & Co. have just published Fr Aelred Graham's latest book: Contemplative Christianity—An Approach to the Realities of Religion (£2.75). Of interest to Amplefordians is the printed acknowledgment that the jacket design is "based on an original theme by Julian Gaisford St Lawrence of Ampleforth College." The blurb, in part, runs as follows:

"Surveying the religious situation today, Dom Aelred Graham, a Benedictine now in his late sixties, is persuaded that Christianity will in the long run only survive if it can be shown that orthodoxy is still compatible with intellectual honesty. His most recent book, an autobiographical inquiry entitled The End of Religion, faced this problem in terms of the ultimate meaning of religion and earned hostile criticism from some conservative Roman Catholics, while at the same time winning a national Catholic award 'for the best book on popular theology published in 1971'. Here, in Contemplative Christianity, he concentrates his lifelong allegiance to Catholicism more directly on his own religious tradition."

On 20th February, publication day, a small party to celebrate the occasion was given jointly by the Publishers and Fr James Forbes, Master of St Benet's Hall, at Oxford.
An Army Officer!
What kind of career is that for an intelligent boy?

At one time, if you were rich and well born you could get a commission in the Army simply by buying it. Not any more.
Wealth and position won't get you past the Officer Selection Board these days.
It takes brains.
The weapons, the equipment and the problems facing Army Officers are immensely more complex than they used to be.

You could be in charge of 30 men.
Before your twentieth birthday, you could find yourself in charge of thirty of the best trained soldiers you could wish to meet.
Almost certainly you will take them abroad to NATO countries on exercises.
As things stand, you could easily find yourself facing a riot in Belfast with them.
You will be responsible for their mental and physical well-being on and off duty 24 hours a day.
For all this you will get £2,276 p.a.

You never stop learning.
Of course, one keeps learning in any profession. But we think that the Army offers unequalled opportunity for a man to educate and develop his mind both academically and through experience.

After you finish your course at Sandhurst you could go on to University to take a degree course. (30% of Sandhurst ex-cadets do so.)
Along the way you will get your second pip and a salary of £2,750 p.a.
To become a Captain you will have to pass a practical examination in tactics. When you do, your salary will rise to £3,593 and you'll be about 26 years of age.
Almost certainly you will do a course in staff work at Junior Staff College.
At this point you may decide to take what you've learned and put it to use in a civilian career.
Or you may decide to have a crack at getting to the top in the Army.
The first step from Captain is to Major and for this you will have to get through a stiff exam and assessment. From Major upwards promotions are made by annual Selection Board.

There's room at the top.
On the way you could go to Staff College, the Royal Military College of Science and later the National Defence College.
By the time you reach your late thirties or early forties you could be a Lieutenant Colonel in command of a regiment of upwards of 500 men.
By the way, there's nothing whatever to prevent you becoming a General if you've got the necessary intelligence, energy and ambition. You don't need well placed relatives or a private income these days.
And the pay as a General isn't bad. You'll get £10,073 a year and quite a few fringe benefits beside.
If you're under 29 and you think the Army might be your kind of career, write a letter to:

Schools Liaison Officer
Yorkshire,
Imphal Barracks,
York.
Tel: York 59811 Ext. 132
OBTUARY

Prayers are asked for the following who have died—Edmund Cawkell (1908) in August, Timothy Robinson (J 70), Major Jeremy Ogilvie, m.b.e. (C. 35), Father Richard Sutherland (B 46) on 9th November, F. H. V. Fowke (JH 31) in November, Gerard Unsworth (B 59) on 29th December, Mark Ryan (A 60) on 31st December, and Nigel Loring (C 66) of the 2nd Light Infantry was killed in action while on loan to the Sultan of Oman's forces.

JEREMY GINONE

Major Jeremy Ginone, of the Royal Artillery, died at the tragically early age of thirty-three in the Military Hospital at Millbank on 21st September, 1974.

He came to St Dunstan's House in 1955, and made a considerable impression as a boy of ebullient friendliness and imperceptible good humour. Both his frame and his wit were large and versatile, and his gift of genial mimicry made him more often than not a centre of merriment, whether in the classroom, on the playing-fields or on the stage, where he will long be remembered as a cheerfully villainous Demon King in the "flu epidemic pantomime" of 1958.

Having become Head Monitor of his House, he left for Sandhurst in 1959, and was commissioned into the Royal Artillery in 1961. He subsequently served in Germany, Hong Kong, Libya and twice in Northern Ireland. He especially enjoyed training young recruits, and served in this capacity at Oswestry, Woolwich and Nuneaton, where with the Junior Leaders Regiment at Bramcote he was promoted Major.

His undoubted influence in the lives of many will be much missed. In 1971 he married Lyn Guest, who was at the time of his death expecting her first child. To her, and to Jeremy's parents, we extend our deepest sympathy and the assurance that he will always be remembered at Ampleforth, where, at his own request, his ashes were scattered.

D.L.M.

ANNUAL EASTER RETREAT 1975

THURSDAY, 27TH MARCH—MONDAY, 1ST APRIL

The Retreat will be given by Fr Aelred Burrows.

Besides the Holy Week liturgy, all guests are welcome to the monastic Office in the Abbey Church. A number of women will be able to stay for the Retreat. Those who wish to attend are asked to contact the Guest Master, Fr Dunstan Adams (please note the change from Fr Denis) as soon as possible and certainly not later than Monday, 24th March, stating at what time and on what day they intend to arrive. As the School does not break up until Wednesday, 29th March, it will be appreciated if guests do not arrive before Thursday after lunch.

ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING

The AGM of the Society will take place in the evening of Holy Saturday, 29th March, at the College in the School Library. The Committee will meet previously.
AGENDA

1. The Chaplain will say prayers.
2. The minutes of the last meeting will be read.
5. To recommend an increase in the annual subscription as follows:
   - Annual Subscription £4 (from £2.10).
   - First 5 years membership after leaving School £2 annually (from £1.05).
   - No change in Life Membership is proposed.
6. To consider the situation regarding the annual subscription by Standing Order Credit and to review developments in the past year concerning the invitation from the Bankers of the Society to change to the Direct Debiting Service.
   - Hon General Secretary.
   - The Chaplain.
   - Three members to the Committee to serve for three years.
8. AOB.
9. The Chaplain will say prayers for the deceased members of the Society.

FELIX STEPHENS, O.S.B.,
Hon General Secretary.

ANNUAL SUBSCRIPTION

The last rise in the subscription was voted in 1968. Since that date the Society has been paying £2.10 per copy of the JOURNAL. Increased costs and inflation have made it necessary to increase the cost of a JOURNAL to members of the Society to 50p immediately. A rise in the annual income of the Society is therefore a necessity.

It will be appreciated by everyone that the task of collecting subscriptions is time-consuming, burdensome and expensive because of the need to remind members and the high cost of postage.

Members are asked to be particularly conscientious in supporting the rise in the subscription if it is passed at the AGM. The financial year of the Society starts on 1st April and letters will be sent to all who pay by annual subscription.

Some 1,400 members pay by Bankers Order. These will be paid through to the Society's Bank at usual and the sum asked for from all these members will be the difference between the present subscription (£2.10) and the recommended subscription (£4). The Secretary would appreciate if all members who pay by Bankers Order would send the sum of £1.30.

The 500 members who pay by cheque will be circularised in the ordinary way.

Members are reminded that they may opt for life membership for £40 or £25 if they have been paying members for the past 10 years. It is very much hoped that this forced increase in the subscription will not necessitate resignation from the Society.

The Secretary would ask, however, that if a member feels he must resign, he could inform the Secretary in order to save postage through second reminders and to keep the records of the Society up to date.
THE GRANGE: O.A. PARENTS RETREAT

During 1974, three Retreats were held at the Grange for Parents of boys at present in the School. In 1975 it is proposed to hold a retreat for Parents who have had boys in the School although other Readers of the Journal are also welcome. The retreat will be given by Fr. Martin Haigh, O.S.B., and commence on the evening of Friday, 16th May, and will end after lunch on Sunday, 18th May. Those who are interested in applying are requested to please fill in the booking form inserted with the Journal. Applications should be received not later than 30th April.

RICHARD CAVE (O 31) has recently received two honours: in the new year’s honours list he was appointed a Companion of the Most Honourable Order of the Bath. A few months earlier the Grand Master of the Sacred Military Order of Constantine of St. George appointed him to be President of the newly-formed British Association of the Order. The Grand Master is H.R.H. Don Carlos of Borbon and Burbon, Duke of Calabra, Count of Caserta, Head of the Royal Dynasty, and Family of the Two Sicilies.

HUGH FRASER (O 35) contended for the Leadership of the Conservative and Unionist Party in the first ballot against Edward Heath and Margaret Thatcher. A colleague, Julian Ameen, has described him as “a man of true panache, loves paradox and holds Disraelian opinions”.

NICHOLAS LORRIMAN (H 61) has been receiving wide publicity, particularly in Paris Match. He is special English Tutor to President Giscard D’Estaing of France. He is also a lecturer in English at the Sorbonne.

HILARY GOSLING (C 46) and S. B. THOMAS (C 49) have been appointed Recorders under the Courts Act.

THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL

For Parents who have had sons in the School although other Readers of the Journal are also welcome. The Retreat will be given by Fr. Martin Haigh, O.S.B., and will commence on the evening of Friday, 16th May, and will end after lunch on Sunday, 18th May. Those who are interested in applying are requested to please fill in the booking form inserted with the Journal. Applications should be received not later than 30th April.

Richard Cave (O 31) has recently received two honours: in the new year’s honours list he was appointed a Companion of the Most Honourable Order of the Bath. A few months earlier the Grand Master of the Sacred Military Order of Constantine of St. George appointed him to be President of the newly-formed British Association of the Order. The Grand Master is H.R.H. Don Carlos of Borbon and Burbon, Duke of Calabra, Count of Caserta, Head of the Royal Dynasty, and Family of the Two Sicilies.

Hugh Fraser (O 35) contested for the Leadership of the Conservative and Unionist Party in the first ballot against Edward Heath and Margaret Thatcher. A colleague, Julian Ameen, has described him as “a man of true panache, loves paradox and holds Disraelian opinions”.

Nicholas Lorriman (H 61) has been receiving wide publicity, particularly in Paris Match. He is special English Tutor to President Giscard D’Estaing of France. He is also a lecturer in English at the Sorbonne.

Hilary Gosling (C 46) and S. B. Thomas (C 49) have been appointed Recorders under the Courts Act.

George Haddock (O 49) has been elected a Fellow of the Royal Society of Arts.

Lt. Col. Peter Mitchell (E 50) was awarded the O.B.E. in the new year’s honours list for his tour of Northern Ireland commanding the 1st Bn., the Duke of Wellington’s Regiment.

Davie Craig (H 65) has been appointed to Tokyo as Manager of Hambros Bank Far East.

John Dick (O 49) has been appointed to Singapore as Managing Director of his Merchant Bank, Arbuthnot Latham.

Hugo Young (B 57), writing in The Sunday Times of 24th November on “Ireland and the Catholic Bishops: a Time to Speak”, has accused the Catholic hierarchy in Britain of failing to face its duties vis-a-vis Ireland for the last fifty years. If English Catholicism continues in its inertia in face of the IRA campaign, he judges, it will attract “greater anti-Catholic odium than has been witnessed here this century. Equally, it could discover in these hideous times an opportunity to do good which no one else can do.” English Catholicism, on both sides of the altar, exists in many areas through the historic and continuing Irish connection; and yet the hierarchy resolutely refuses to speak at all on Irish affairs. In the last five years the Bishops’ twice-yearly Conference has given just half an hour to the subject. “It has a dreadful fear of applying its moral authority to controversial political events.” Cardinal Heenan pleads that his writ does not run to Belfast—though what happens there (the conduct of the army, the suspension of the laws) is decided only a few hundred yards from his own Westminster front door; and the Irish problem perpetually has over it the shadow of the presence of the English Catholic Church. The bishops of that Church had uniquely the knowledge, the access and the motivation to drive the Westminster Parliament to see and act: “yet their silence at that time (during the Orange supremacy), when earlier reform might have averted today’s bloody impasse, was virtually complicity.”

But now these bishops are caught on the horns of the dilemma of condemning IRA extremism and encouraging the aspirations of Irish republicanism, while the English and Irish elements of their congregations all look to them for a lead—a lead in different directions. Platitude will no longer be accepted as a proper response: if that is invoked, anti-Irishism will slide into anti-Catholicism. Free of political involvement, the English Catholic Church should act as a bridge between a post-Vatican reconstructed Catholicism and the old Irish version, with its falsified history books and its deformed education system. “It could revive and apply the theology of Christian non-violence. It could re-examine its own approach to Christian unity in the light of the Irish experience. Above all, it could—must—address itself to what it will do in face of any British policy of gradual withdrawal from Northern Ireland.” The bishops cannot remain forever trapped in their conviction that abortion, family planning, church schools and the Irish problem perpetually has over it the shadow of the presence of the English Catholic Church. The bishops of that Church had uniquely the knowledge, the access and the motivation to drive the Westminster Parliament to see and act: “yet their silence at that time (during the Orange supremacy), when earlier reform might have averted today’s bloody impasse, was virtually complicity.”

Further to those mentioned as candidates in the 10th October General Election (Autumn Journal, p. 115) we have news that Christopher Lyon (A 61) stood as a Liberal candidate for Hayes & Harlington, where Neil Balfour (B 63) stood as the Conservative candidate. He polled a safe Labour seat (52 per cent of the vote), Balfour coming second with 10,870 votes (28 per cent) and Lyon third with 6,330 votes (over 16 per cent) with two other contenders. The two Amplefordians together polled almost 45 per cent of the votes—but divided, we fall.

It is fair criticism that those who look out for these things have failed to notice the Ampleforth Liberal drive. Bernard Fogarty (A 63) has rightly pointed out that his father, Michael Fogarty (A 34) is a long standing member of the National Executive of the Liberal Party, stood in both the February and October General Elections against Airey Neave and managed February and October General Elections against Airey Neave and managed February and October General Election (Autumn Journal, p. 115) we have news that Christopher Lyon (A 61) stood as a Liberal candidate for Hayes & Harlington, where Neil Balfour (B 63) stood as the Conservative candidate. He polled a safe Labour seat (52 per cent of the vote), Balfour coming second with 10,870 votes (28 per cent) and Lyon third with 6,330 votes (over 16 per cent) with two other contenders. The two Amplefordians together polled almost 45 per cent of the votes—but divided, we fall.

It is fair criticism that those who look out for these things have failed to notice the Ampleforth Liberal drive. Bernard Fogarty (A 63) has rightly pointed out that his father, Michael Fogarty (A 34) is a long standing member of the National Executive of the Liberal Party, stood in both the February and October General Elections against Airey Neave and managed February and October General Elections against Airey Neave and managed February and October General Election (Autumn Journal, p. 115) we have news that Christopher Lyon (A 61) stood as a Liberal candidate for Hayes & Harlington, where Neil Balfour (B 63) stood as the Conservative candidate. He polled a safe Labour seat (52 per cent of the vote), Balfour coming second with 10,870 votes (28 per cent) and Lyon third with 6,330 votes (over 16 per cent) with two other contenders. The two Amplefordians together polled almost 45 per cent of the votes—but divided, we fall.

But now these bishops are caught on the horns of the dilemma of condemning IRA extremism and encouraging the aspirations of Irish republicanism, while the English and Irish elements of their congregations all look to them for a lead—a lead in different directions. Platitude will no longer be accepted as a proper response: if that is invoked, anti-Irishism will slide into anti-Catholicism. Free of political involvement, the English Catholic Church should act as a bridge between a post-Vatican reconstructed Catholicism and the old Irish version, with its falsified history books and its deformed education system. “It could revive and apply the theology of Christian non-violence. It could re-examine its own approach to Christian unity in the light of the Irish experience. Above all, it could—must—address itself to what it will do in face of any British policy of gradual withdrawal from Northern Ireland.” The bishops cannot remain forever trapped in their conviction that abortion, family planning, church schools and Community are the only safe and necessary issues upon which it is suitable to grapple. Ireland, the extreme example of their belief that to speak is to divide the unity of their diminishing flock, is in fact precisely the opposite: the problem which most demands their leadership and could most profit from it.
JOHN WETTEN (B 42) writes of a pilgrimage made in October to the French battlefields of the Great War. The Rector of St Giles-in-the-Fields, London, Mr C. C. Taylor, accompanied the party as chaplain. Afterwards he gave this warm account of his experience:

A week ago I celebrated the Communion in a Roman Catholic church. I wonder how many C of E clergymen have had that experience. It happened before the high altar of the largest church in France, the Cathedral of Notre Dame at Amiens.

In the modern fashion I faced westwards, and I spoke the words of our Series II. For the new spirit the occasion symbolised, the new service alone seemed appropriate, no matter how cherished the old. I wore the alb and chasuble provided for me, and as I spoke into a microphone I could hear the words of the Cathedral's own Mass which was taking place at the same time in a side chapel. Through the immensely tall Gothic windows the morning sunshine was pouring into the choir, where the congregation of thirty members and friends of the Royal Naval Division of 1914-18 occupied chairs between the canopied stalls.

Brigadier Basil Rackham, who led the party, read the Epistle (1 Thessalonians 4, verses 13-18, from the "Jerusalem Bible"), the Intercession included prayers for Pope Paul, the Ecumenical Patriarch, the Archbishop of Canterbury, the Bishop of Amiens, the President of France, the Queen, the Mayor and Municipality of Amiens, and for the dead of the Royal Naval Division. The wine used in the chalice was white, and the Sacrament was received standing.

It was a very great experience for us all, because the religious conflicts of over 400 years became as nothing and "the ... and we were living up to its requirements. And we felt that inasmuch as we did this thing we "did it unto Him"... 

VINCENT CRONIN (W 39) in his first letter to The Times (15th January), gave eloquent support to "the anger of the middle... traditions, as the only sure 'resistance movement' in a society of pornography, abortion, and perhaps soon euthanasia."

Admiral Gretton writes saying that MICHAEL (B 63) is happily commanding a frigate, HMS Bacchante, and is now the proud father of a daughter.

NICHOLAS ARMOUR (D 69) has graduated from Exeter University and joined the Foreign & Commonwealth Office in Whitehall where the old Colonial Office and Foreign Office buildings in Downing Street have been combined with the old India Office buildings in King Charles Street for the FCO. MARK (D 71) is still studying engineering at Caltech, Cambridge. Their father BILLY (E 37) has retired as a brigadier and is settled again at Brandsby: he is Colonel of the Prince of Wales' Own Regiment.

ANTHONY DU VIVIER (A 62), Senior Registrar at St Mary's Hospital, is at present on 18 months' leave of absence researching into psoriasis at the Scripps Clinic and Research Foundation, La Jolla, California.

MARK STUDER (D 69) has written to set the record straight. (Autumn Journal, 113). His First in Honour Mods. and Greats was from University College, Oxford; thrice he was awarded travelling scholarships, twice college prizes and he was the Basil Blackett Open Scholar. He is now reading for the Bar.

LT NICHOLAS DE HARTOG, R.N. (A 65) was presented with the Sanderson trophy at the Royal Naval Air Station at Portland. It is presented to the person who makes the biggest contribution to Naval Air Weapons.
The list of entrants into Oxford and Cambridge was published in the Journal, Spring 1974, 132. Entrants to other universities are as follows:

B. M. S. Allen
J. F. Barber
B. J. Caulfield
K. W. Cobb
M. R. Cooper
M. B. Gould
J. P. Hartley
R. G. Killingbeck
S. R. Lovegrove
N. Moroney
A. P. Oppe
N. W. Price
P. Y. Quigley
D. A. Sellers
P. J. C. Tronch

Other Universities

Durham
Manchester
Hull
Bradford
Durham
London, Bedford
Lancaster
Abigail
Liverpool
Exeter
Bristol
Newcastle
York
Trinity College, Dublin

Other Degree Courses

Hatfield Polytechnic
Stockport College of Technology
Oxford Polytechnic
Erling Polytechnic
St. Luke's College of Education
Shlvenham

The cost of printing all journals has risen very steeply in the last year, and is predicted to continue to do so. As from the next issue, it has become necessary to reduce the number of pages and put more words onto each page. The proposed format has been applied to the O.A. Notes above: the line is extended across from 4 to 5 inches, and the number of lines per page from 46 to 52. The number of pages of photographs is to be reduced to half (except on special occasions). Other economies may become necessary. [Ed.]

Stonyhurst-Ampleforth-Beaumont Association Ball

To be held at the Burlington Club, London S.W.6, on 28th June 1975 at 8 p.m. (for 8.30 p.m.). Dress: black tie. Tickets: £5.50 each approx. (to be finalised in April). Apply to B. B. C. de Houghton, 22 St. Maur Road, S.W.6. Home: 01, 731, 0130. Office: 01, 636, 2494/2495. It is proposed to sell between 350 and 400 tickets.

School Staff: September, 1974

Dom Patrick Barry, M.A., Headmaster.
Dom Denis Waddilove, M.A., Second Master.
Dom Brendan Smith, M.A., Housemaster, St Aidan's House.
Dom Martin Halgh, T.D., M.A., Housemaster, St Bede's House.
Dom Walter Maxwell-Stuart, M.A., Housemaster, St Catherine's House.
Dom Leo Chamberlain, M.A., Housemaster, St Dunstan's House (Head of History).
Dom Edward Corbould, M.A., Housemaster, St Edward's House (Head of History).
Dom Ronet Perceval, M.A., Housemaster, St John's House.
Dom Adrian Conway, M.A., Housemaster, St Oswald's House.
Dom Dominic Milroy, M.A., Housemaster, St Wilfrid's House (Head of Modern Languages).
Dom Cyril Brooks, M.A., Housemaster, Junior House.
Dom Anthony Almsough, T.D., M.A.
Dom Cuthbert Rabnett, M.A.
Dom Barnabas Sandeman, M.A.
Dom Edmund Hutton, M.A.
Dom Julian Rochford, M.A.
Dom Gervase Knowles, B.D.
Dom Simon Trafford, T.D., M.A.
Dom Nicholas Walford, M.A.
Dom Charles Maceley.
Dom Michael Phillips, M.A., (Head of Physics).
Dom Dunstan Adams, M.A.
Dom Oliver Ballinger, M.A.
Dom Anselm Cranmer, M.A.

Dom Alphonse Crossley, M.A., S.T.L.

Dom Stephen Wright, M.A.
Dom Placid Searritt, M.A., S.T.L.
Dom Alric Stacpoole, M.A., S.T.L.
Dom Andrew Beek, M.A.
Dom Adolfo Burrows, M.A.
Dom Vernon A. L. Stott, M.A.
Dom Patrick Truscott, M.A., S.T.L.
Dom David Mottram, M.A., S.T.L.
Dom Jonathan Cotton, M.A.
Dom Felix Stephens, M.A.
Dom Bonaventure Knollys, M.A., S.T.L.
Dom Gilbert Whitfield, M.A.
Dom Matthew Burns, M.A.
Dom Timothy Wright, M.A., B.D.
Dom Richard Halls, B.Sc., A.C.G.I.
Dom Justin Asbury Price, B.Sc., Ph.D.

Dom W. H. Shrewing, M.A.
Dom T. H. Charles-Edwards, M.A.
Dom J. P. MacMillan, B.Sc.
Dom B. Richardson, B.A.
Dom J. E. Pickin, M.A.
Dom G. T. Heath, B.A.
Dom P. G. Smith, M.A., (Head of Classics).
Dom E. J. Wright, B.Sc.
Dom W. A. Davidson, M.A.
Dom B. O. V. Vazquez, B.A.
Dom J. D. McDonald, M.A., B.LITT.
Dom I. R. Mackean, M.A., (Head of Modern Languages).
Dom K. Criddle, M.A.
Dom A. Forsythe, B.Sc.

Dom D. M. Griffiths, M.A., (Head of English).
Dom G. H. Moreton, M.A.
Dom S. R. Dammann, M.A.
Dom E. G. Boulton, M.A., (Head of Geography).
Dom G. J. Joannes, M.A.
Dom J. J. Davies, M.A., B.Sc.
Dom E. S. R. Dammann, M.A., (Head of Biology).
Dom L. C. Williams, B.A., (Head of Modern Languages).
Dom T. L. Newton, M.A.
Dom A. D. Stewart, B.Sc.
Dom R. F. Gilbert, M.A.
Dom H. R. Finlay, M.A.
Music:
G. S. Dowling, Mus.B., A.R.M.C.M.
D. B. Kerrash, B.S.C.

Art:
J. J. Brister, M.B.E., B.S.C.

P. A. Hawksworth,

136 THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL

THE SCHOOL OFFICIALS WERE:

Head Monitor: C. J. Satterthwaite

School Monitors:
C. J. Holroyd, R. A. Holroyd, D. J. G. Reilly, A. J. Hampson, M. Ainscough,
D. P. M. Pearce, M. A. Campbell, M. P. Ribby, K. A. Wilcox, W. S. S. Karpowska,
A. P. B. Ashbrooke, T. N. Clarke, B. P. Hadley, S. H. Davey,
D. P. Heaton, S. E. Wright, P. D. Macfarlane, N. D. Plummer, N. M. Baker.

Captain of Rugby
M. Ainscough

Captain of Athletics
S. G. T. Ashworth

Captain of Boxing
T. S. Miller

Captain of Judo
M. A. Campbell

Captain of Chess
D. A. Hemmings

Captain of Squash
C. J. Holroyd

Capatin of Shooting
B. P. Hornung

Master of Hounds
S. P. Roberts

We warmly congratulate the following boys who gained Awards and Places at Oxford and Cambridge at the recent examinations. There were 20 of them altogether—a very respectable total out of the 47 boys who left the School in December.

OXFORD

D. P. M. Pearce
A. P. Wright
P. M. F. Langdale
C. J. Satterthwaite

History

A. P. D. Bewick
C. J. Poyser
A. J. Tate
Hon D. A. G. Ainscough
P. D. Macfarlane
S. E. Wright
T. N. Clarke
M. P. Rigby
J. Melton
A. J. Craig

Hon D. A. G. Asquith

English and Economics
Among the outside lecturers who have come to give us talks this term, two should be singled out for their distinction. The first was the now retiring Headmaster of Downside, Dom Aelred Watkins, who spoke to a large gathering of senior boys in the theatre on the last day of Glastonbury Abbey before its destruction in 1549. Fr Aelred's approach was detailed and socio-economic rather than literary and romantic, giving us a minute account of the going and coming from the day sheets, bursar's accounts, customs and other hard-headed records—a quantified account, bristle with numbered fact. We were told where all the monks ought to have been at all hours, and when they employed and how. Law rolls and pay rolls, not illuminated manuscripts, were the subject of our attention, and though we skipped liturgical music or architecture, we saw the pipe better paid for his tune. It was all very exact, a kind of history (Ptolemaic or history) kindly handled.

The second talk was to the scholars, with a favoured few joining them. Vincent Cronin (who has just published another book, on "Louis & Antoinette") came to talk to us on "Art as a moral blood test". His aim was to study the non-material semi-conscious judgmental values of the educated and therefore expressive—classes, so to weigh the moral health of a society. An example of what this means is found in fifteenth century illuminations, where we can trace an unconscious shift from placing the Christian mystery at the centre to placing the owner with his coat of arms at the centre and the mystery at the margin, this being a sign of the decreasing spiritual health of that period when society was becoming secularised. Vincent Cronin developed this theme to some length by looking at two periods in detail: the Renaissance and France of the late Ancien Regime. He concluded that artists may be more truly reflectors of the mood of their age than politicians, and more reflectors than prophets.

LECTURES IN YORK

Among the lectures that parties of boys have attended in York this term were two of special note. The first was on "Non-Violent Action: a Christian Appraisal", given at the Mount School under the aegis of the Quakers and at the invitation of the Headmistress, Miss Joyce Blake, who gave us supper with the lecturer and some of the girls of her school beforehand (a happy meal it was). The lecturer was John Ferguson, Dean and Director of Studies in Art at the Open University, and inter also Vice-Chairman of the Fellowship of Reconciliation and Chairman of the Human Rights Committee. He had spent ten years at Ibadan University, Nigeria, during the troubles, so spoke from some experience.

He set his theme in a world of increasing violence where £100,000 million is spent annually on armaments—more than is spent on the saving of life, and where over a hundred wars have been fought since 1945. He lamented that violence begets violence in a rising spiral, feeling that it could never become a realistic option. For him, the root of violence is injustice in social orders that can never be reformed by mere evolution. When rights are perpetually infringed, when society is male-dominated and state-ordered, when the tools of violence are continuously in evidence, then the tendency will be towards violence, the ultimate being full revolution.

What he recommended as an alternative is symbolic action such as hunger lunches, vigils, political songs; and direct action such as withdrawal of labour (Gandhi's method), "strikes in reverse" (Danilo Dolci's method), boycotting (once Ireland's method) and civil disobedience (like the breaking of segregation barriers in the USA). He spoke of the need to expect and accept casualties peaceably: and that requires spiritual resources and personal sensitivity, partially born of practice.

Questioned, he admitted that his Report on Non-Violence did not sufficiently distinguish between individual passion and corporate policy or principle.

On Monday, 2nd December, a group of monks and boys went in to York University to hear the 1974 Goodrick lecture which was given by Ivan Illich and entitled "The destruction of equity". An immensely lively and attractive lecturer, Illich spoke to a packed central hall on the imbalance in modern tools of production between industrial systems which become their own master and technology which is genuinely made to serve human needs. He covered with remarkable expertise the complexities of schooling, medicine, agriculture and transport, stimulating the listener seriously to consider different styles of work and living, which are urgently needed for the survival as well as the happiness of humanity.

A Viennese in his late forties, Ivan Illich studied theology and philosophy in Rome, then took a doctorate in history at Salzburg. From 1951 he served as assistant pastor in an Irish-Puerto Rican parish in New York. Assigned to be vice-rector of the Catholic University of Puerto Rico during 1956-60, he organised an intensive training centre for American priests in Latin American culture. A co-founder of the Centre for Intercultural Documentation in Gueravaca, he has since 1964 directed research seminars on "Institutional Alternatives in a Technological Society", focusing on Latin America. His books include "Deschooling Society", "Celebration of Awareness: a call for institutional revolution" and "Medical Nemesis: the expropriation of health".

THE 1974 MORSE COMPETITION

It was announced in The Sunday Times of 22nd December that Charles Francis was the winner of the 1974 MORSE Competition.

The Headmaster has asked me to comment on Francis' achievement.
In September the Statistics Department at Warwick sent all schools details of a new degree course, called MORSE, and, at the same time, invited entries for a new prize of £25 to be named after the Rev Thomas Bayes, an obscure mathematical divine (d. 1751) who was a pioneer of probability theory. This year’s prize was to be for the most creative extensions and developments of Shepherd’s Piano, which is thought to be the largest rigid lamina which can be carried around an L-shaped corridor (see figure).

Francis’ thirty page thesis was in three parts. First, he analysed Shepherd’s Piano and produced pianos for corridors which do not meet at right angles. If the bend is very tight, he found that a rhombus is better than a piano. Next, he invented a shape which could negotiate both left and right hand corners in a corridor. He adapted this shape to take non-rectangular corners. We learnt from Dr Jackson of York that Francis had re-discovered Conway’s Car. Thirdly, he stated that if you take a thin slice off the top of Shepherd’s Piano, you can join it to the bottom, add a little more, and still negotiate the L-shaped corner (see figure). The improvement is small but the idea is most ingenious.

The judges’ decision was unanimous and they especially liked the development of Conway’s Car. They were uneasy about the Improved Piano, since Francis had omitted a proof.

This award finishes a lively school career which included two essay prizes won before entering the sixth form, two talks to the Mathematics Society, and a Cambridge Scholarship.
We are most grateful to our speakers for giving up their weekend so generously to take part in the Convention; their efforts were much appreciated by all who attended.

During the term we welcomed Liaison Officers from all three Services: Captain Canning, R.N., Colonel Gregg and Squadron Leader Young.

One hundred and five boys took the I.S.C.O./Birkbeck Ability and Aptitude Tests in November. These Tests should not be seen in isolation and it is important that boys should follow up any recommendations by their own enquiries, so that by the time they leave school they should at least have some idea of the possibilities that are open to them. This applies to all, including those going to university; there is strong evidence that students with a particular career in mind do appreciably better than those who drift to university with no clear purpose in view. Boys and parents are reminded that the Northern Secretary of the Independent Schools Careers Organisation comes here in the Spring and Summer Terms to give individual careers advice; this service is particularly useful for boys who are not going to university and have no idea about a career.

DAVID LENTON.

“BLITHE SPIRIT”

Noel Coward called Blithe Spirit “an Improbable Farce”. However improbable its subject, it is even less probable as the choice for a young all-male cast, as three of the four main parts are for women: two vindictive wives (one of whom has been dead for seven years) and one elderly spinster. Nine years out of ten the problems of casting would be insuperable.

This was the tenth year. It was obvious from the Exhibition production of A Midsummer Night's Dream that Julian Wadham was versatile enough, and Rupert Everett gifted enough, to tackle anything from Lady Macbeth to Desdemona, and once it had been decided to let the hefty Jonathan Humes loose as a blatantly pantomime-dame version of Madame Arcati the choice of Blithe Spirit was almost obvious. From then on it was mainly a matter of style: Noel Coward's dialogue is flippant rather than farcical, and it is always difficult in school productions to catch the mood of nonchalant and world-wearied joi de vivre which is the between-the-wars equivalent of Wilde's sparkling cynicism. It is perhaps fortunate that it is difficult nowadays to be really blasé (“A dry Martini, I think, don't you?”), but it makes period comedy that much more difficult to establish convincingly.

All the more credit, then, to the Producer, Dominic Pearce, for achieving from the central couple, Charles Condomine (John Bruce-Jones) and his wife Ruth (Julian Wadham) a really relaxed and well-sustained elegance in their handling of the all-important opening scenes. John Bruce-Jones's Charles was plump and voluble—rather more the prosperous bank-manager than the sophisticated roué—but his alternation between smoothness and petulance was wholly convincing, and his sprightliness and good timing gave the play exactly the right mood and tempo. Later on in the action, as Charles moves from mildly bombastic confidence towards a state of flustered and self-pitying irresolution (“The whole experience has unhinged me”), the balance between tension and farce was unerringly held. This was a very funny performance as well as a very intelligent one. Julian Wadham, as Ruth, produced a performance which was as good in the small details as it was in its overall grasp of character and mood. By a series of well-modulated and often minute gestures, he succeeded in building Ruth into an entirely convincing and coherent character, that of a somewhat faded debonair...
settling resignedly and rather self-consciously into early middle-age, prone to glance elegantly at her finger-nails and to retire frigidly into moments of pique. This was character-acting created from within rather than imposed from without; as a result the comedy was always being freshly improvised rather than done by numbers, so such an extent that some of the dialogue itself underwent a good deal of change without anyone in the audience knowing it. What really proved the quality of Julian Wadham's playing of this part was the skill with which he concealed the element of parody which is inevitable when a boy is playing a female role; the humour he drew from the part came genuinely from Coward's writing rather than from the enforced circumstance of sophisticated travestism.

Jonathan Barnes's playing of Madame Arcati was a good deal more problematic. It was at once clear that his style was heavily influenced by Margaret Rutherford's memorable playing of the role on film, and this was both a help and a hindrance. It gave him a clear direction in which to go, and a breeziness and variety of gesture which were sufficient to dominate the stage whenever he was on it. On the other hand it tended to stereotype his facial gestures and to present him with insuperable problems of sustained voice-production; it also created a rather distracting element of double parody—this was Jonathan Barnes imitating Margaret Rutherford imitating a fanatical elderly medium. Only he could have pulled it off with the rich and very unself-consciousness which he managed to combine; the success of the production depends on the tour de force quality of Madame Arcati's part, and Jonathan Barnes's sheer presence was quite enough to ensure that we were not being presented with a flop. It is also totally unfair, for several obvious reasons, to compare his performance with Margaret Rutherford's; it just so happened that his derivative style made the comparison hard to avoid.

Rupert Everett was very well cast as Elvira, the ghost-wife, and caught extremely well her tone of elfin malice and her calculated expeditions into petulance. Occasionally the element of calculation slipped a bit, and the tantrums tended to be a little overplayed, but this was an Elvira of considerability and waspish authority, marked above all by a fine sense of timing and of dramatic gesture. There was a very interesting contrast of styles here between the two wives, Julian Wadham's playing being more subtle and flexible, Rupert Everett's more expressive and idiosyncratic. Together with John Bruce-Jones, this must be amongst the most effective ménages à trois that the Ampleforth stage has seen.

The supporting roles were very well done. Alastair Burtt's Mrs Bradman was pleasantly vacuous and tea-partyish, and Philip Noel took obvious pleasure in doubling Dr Bradman with Edith. His Dr Bradman was urbane but somewhat light-weight, whilst his Edith was played with a really zany sense of high comedy which was almost too sophisticated for some of the audience. It is not easy to portray inanity, but Philip Noel seems to be able to switch it on at will. His very imaginative interpretation of the denouement rounded off an evening's entertainment which had surprisingly few weaknesses and which succeeded admirably in catching the authentic and characteristically English balance between elegance, wit and farce.

The staging was based closely on Noel Coward's directions, which are voluminous and precise. It was a real pleasure to see such a tasteful and well-designed set, and the lighting and special effects were handled with a smoothness and unobtrusive efficiency which suited the style of production. Dominic Pearce may have conceived this as a minor off-season production, but the outcome was a major success, which thoroughly deserved its very warm reception.

DOMINIC MILBROD, O.S.B.
JOURNEY'S END

I have had the good fortune to see two memorable performances of R. C. Sherriff's famous play and to have been invited to play a part in a third. I saw the original London production in 1929 with Colin Clive as Stanhope. Sherriff's famous play and to have been invited to play a part in a third. I

Ampleforth production being planned by Douglas Brown and Cecil Gray and Robert Speaight as Hibbert. In 1930 I was invited to take part in the

The performance by a relatively young cast, several of them in their first year in the School, was remarkable in the grasp it showed of the dramatic content of the play. A certain youthfulness of gesture and of voice could be overlooked by the audience in their general suspension of disbelief.

If I am critical of some details this only proves that the production as a whole was good enough to stand up to such criticism. The excellently realistic set, built by Jeremy Grotrian and his helpers, provided a rather spacious dug-out but the small strip of sky seen through the narrow, stepped entrance gave the right underground and claustrophobic atmosphere. Very lights shone in the night but in a somewhat regular pattern of white, red and yellow. We heard quite a deal of bombardment, both distant and close, but surely the raid which cost Osborne his life must have provoked some small-arms fire as well as a blast or two on an Officer's whistle. The final cave-in of the dug-out roof of the stage directions must surely have meant that Stanhope could not have survived—or did Sherriff deliberately end ambiguously?

The dressing can also be criticised in detail by those old enough to remember. Especially, one missed the highly characteristic British-pattern tin hats; Sam Browne belts and pistol holsters were dubious and I was very surprised to see an Officer trailing a naked respirator!

But all this carping is swept away when I speak of the performance and the performers. While Stephen Lear's casting, within its limitations of age, was very good, suspension of disbelief had to be called into play again when Officers spoke at a higher pitch than would be expected, but Edward Troughton as Stanhope showed a maturity of interpretation which easily overcome his lack of years. It is a plummy part, indeed they are all plummy parts, but this does not take away from the credit due to a sensitive, intelligent, occasionally inspired performance. Adrian Roberts was helped by his height and a slight stoop to give "Uncle" Osbourne his seniority of character, if not of rank, and Ian Baharie put the right mix of vulgarity and solid worth into Trotter. It would be easy to overlook Mason, the comic, and spoil the part. Willrid Nixon resisted the temptation and his wisecracks were all the more effective for the high drama of the rest. Hibbert's is not as easy a part as it looks and William Bruce-Jones handled it well. Hugo de Ferranti and Oliver Nicholson did a very good job with their impressive array of FOH spots. The set needed to seem dark, but we could still see the actors' faces.

Hugh Willbourn's production was of a high standard. There was very little "masking" and if "down centre" got a lot of use, well—it takes a real pro to know when and how to stay still. One more word to the director: If an actor has to smoke a pipe on stage, give him only one match. If he strikes it, holds it over the pipe and puffs, the audience will see the smoke—I promise—and I can tell two true stories to prove it!

Hugh Willbourn and all his cast and backstage helpers are to be very sincerely congratulated on a highly successful production.
THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL

Make-up by Clare Nelson, Charles Ellington, Fr Henry, Phillip Marader, Adam Stapleton
House Manager: Dominic Dobson

The Producer would like to thank Mr Ian Davie, Mr John Dean and Fr Justin for their assistance.

RECATAL
22nd September 1974


It was with considerable pleasure that we looked forward to hearing two recent old boys giving one of the now regular Sunday recitals. Patrick Newsom (cello) and William Howard (piano) (both C 70) did not disappoint us. Patrick is now master of his instrument sufficiently to play with fluency and ease, and sensitivity and of course faultless intonation. He allowed the variations in tone colour which are the special glory of the cello to be heard throughout the recital, so that the shape and texture of all three works was put before us with the utmost clarity. The Beethoven sang as struggled as the composer's hand directed; the Debussy revealed the full richness of its mysterious tones, and the Rachmaninov was uncovered to the limits of its treachery.

In such a recital it is right that the pianist should be mentioned second but William Howard was not second in any other respect. Throughout he was the partner or the accompanist according as the music required, but always sensitive to the shape of the phrase and the precision of attack or release. In combination they gave a splendid performance which was truly a pleasure to listen to.

A moderate sized but very appreciative audience gave them several deserved ovations. Perhaps such an audience deserved to have its applause more gracefully received. It did appear that the pianist was not wholly at ease with the limitations of our piano, but that was hardly sufficient explanation for a certain lack of gracefulness in the performers. It is a truth, and perhaps we need a reminder, that while the brilliant are indignant at circumstantial difficulties, the masterly surpass them.

A further sadness is that Philip Dore, who died last March, could not be present to hear these two, who were possibly the best pupils to come under his tutelage during his years at Ampleforth. May others return in similar ways.

ANSELM CRAMER, O.S.B.

PIANO RECITAL BY JOHN CLEGG

Variations in F minor
Beethoven

Sonata in C, Op. 2, No. 5
Nocturne Op. 37
Barcarolle Op. 70
Impromptu Op. 54
El Amor y la Muerte
Onafsla; Tocata

Joseph Haydn

Gabriel Fauré

Enrique Granados

Maurice Ravel

Mr John Clegg's recital was, in face of natural limitations imposed by a sadly deficient instrument, a memorable event and an aesthetic triumph by any standards. Throughout the performance his clear and sensitive melodic treatment, his sense of style, his musical integrity and mastery without mannerisms, were a constant source of joy.

THE BUILDING APPEAL CONCERT

I think that it may be worth the effort to try to clear up a possible misunderstanding about the Ryedale Orchestra. It has no direct connection with the activities of the College Music Department although it is conducted by Simon Wright and its affairs administered by Teddy Moreton. And they cannot be suppressed! Any normal, well-balanced musician should surely be able to work off all his orchestral frustrations on the four school orchestras. But no: a Chamber Orchestra of 25, a String Orchestra of 35, a Wind Orchestra of 45 and a Symphony Orchestra of 65 don't furnish sufficient stimulation (nor sufficient deibles) for the gargantuan musical appetites of Simon and Teddy—they require another Symphony Orchestra of 85 members!

And so it was that on Sunday, 6th October, a capacity house once again rose to its feet in the small Theatre to have their ear-drums assaulted by one of Mr Wright's block-busting arrangements of the National Anthem. That ordeal over we thankfully resumed our seats for Wegner's splendidly festive overture to The Mastersingers. It was immediately apparent that the performing standards had improved since the last Building Appeal Concert a year ago (the B.B.C. have been kind enough to supply us with a main line to the theatre). Once more the orchestra should be very grateful for Mr Moreton's enthusiastic and efficient organisation and Mr Wright's brilliance as a teacher, conductor and musician:

Be Alexander, in Max Bruch's popular Violin Concerto in G minor, equated his remarkably brilliant performance of the Tchaikovsky Violin Concerto last year, and once again one could not fail to notice the rapport between soloist and conductor: the ensemble in tutti passages and at orchestral leads was admirably adjusted to suit the soloist's interpretation which was, as is proper, full-blooded and romantic.

Unlike the Beethoven symphony last year, the performance of Brahms's first symphony this year provided a splendid conclusion to the concert. From the first tempestuous chromatic chords straining upwards over a pedal point to the noble serenity of the famous C major tune in the last movement the whole performance was totally convincing.

Local musicians and those boys fortunate enough to be selected for this orchestra should be very grateful for Mr Moreton's enthusiastic and efficient organisation and Mr Wright's brilliance as a teacher, conductor and musician: we, the appreciative audience, certainly made our gratitude abundantly clear. Only one caveat. It would be better if a hall could be found which would accommodate our many orchestras and choirs without having to refuse admittance to so many who would like to hear our concerts.

DAVID BOWMAN.
THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL

THE YORKSHIRE BAROQUE ENSEMBLE

While the interests of historical accuracy may be well served by the use of authentic antique instruments in the performance of Baroque music, this is often at the expense of warmth of communication between players and audience. The enfeebled tones of the Baroque violin and the Baroque flute give an admirable idea of how this music must have sounded in its day but it is surely analogous to using a stylus to write a letter when a superior result could be achieved with a fountain pen. Notwithstanding, these musicians played and sang with a fine sense of style and from a rather weary sonata for flute and harpsichord by C. P. E. Bach they progressed through three more works to end with J. S. Bach's beautiful Cantata 209 ("Sine vitam a cha sia dolorum") in which the soloist, Yvonne Seymour, sang with precision and warmth. Her performance in Purcell's "The Blessed Virgin's Expostulation" was likewise memorable, full of splendid declamation and varying emotion. Why should we have had to sit through Georg Muffat's dreary orchestral suite "Nobilis Juventus", with all its unremarkable movements, a question we might have asked when we reached the A minor violin concerto of Bach which, despite the imperfections of performance and the anaemic tone of the solo instrument, was still Bach and made the preceding work fall into instant oblivion.

Roger Nichols.

CHORAL AND ORCHESTRAL CONCERT
28TH NOVEMBER 1974

A very high standard was set at this concert given by the College Symphony Orchestra and Choral Society. Any school would be proud to be able, in one concert, to perform two complete concerti with soloists from the school and accompanied by its own orchestra. Such was the ambitious programme of this concert which included the Mozart Horn Concerto No. 2 in Eb K.417 and the Rachmaninoff Piano Concerto No. 2 in C minor. In addition to this the Choral Society also performed the Charpentier Messe de Minuit.

Nicholas Greenfeld, only in his second year of the Upper School, was the soloist in the Horn Concerto, controlling this difficult instrument superbly. The intonation and phrasing throughout were extremely good and the opening of the last movement was particularly delightful. For a first concert performance of a concerto the performance was certainly full of promise and, if the solo line was at times overshadowed by the Chamber Orchestra giving firm support, this is only to be expected. It will be interesting to hear Nicholas in the future when he has gained in experience.

A most mature interpretation of the Rachmaninoff Concerto was given by Andrew Wright who, at only 17, proved himself to be a pianist who can play not only with panache and confidence but also with rhythmical security. The opening chords were nicely judged and the work was played with sensitivity and dedication. A great deal of credit must also go to the orchestra of about 60 players including a large number of boys, and it seemed that many of these were younger members of the School Orchestra playing for the first time. The soloists and the participants are to be congratulated on achieving at times a very fine ensemble. Special praise must go to the Double Bass section who, playing with ease, provided a secure foundation. The conductor was given a lot of help by the clear direction of the Director of Music, David Bowman, who knows his musicians and gives them every assistance in their difficulties.

The orchestral items also included Flor Peeters' Festive Overture arranged from the original organ work by Simon Wright. In addition to these resources are being so fully used and giving the College an enviable music tradition.

Gillian Blake.

MESSIAH

At a time when authenticity seems to be held in such high esteem by conductors of Baroque music, one begins seriously to wonder whether the composers themselves ever produced authentic performances of their own works. For instance, did Handel, at the first performance of his Messiah, employ the "correct" all-male chorus? Did that performance take place in the proper religious surroundings? And did Handel ensure that all his dots were sufficiently doubled (so to speak)? Two facts are certain: on 13th April 1742 the composer used sopranos and contraltos in his production of the work and, never once in his lifetime was Messiah performed in a church. It is unlikely that Handel insisted on accentuating rhythms by means of "double-dottong" to quite the same extent as some modern conductors, especially where this poses insurmountable technical problems. Furthermore, nearly half the recitatives and arias exist in at least two different versions and about thirty soloists (including at least five boys) are known to have sung the solo items in performances directed by the composer: it is plain that Handel was not above using whatever resources were available, a fact which makes it about as futile to search for the "authentic" performance of Messiah as it was the fabled wolf's endeavours to dispose of a river by drinking it dry.

The performance of Messiah on 8th December given in a very full Ampleforth Abbey by the Schola Cantorum and Chamber Orchestra of Ampleforth College was more or less faithful to the printed text, even if it was not, as some might have believed, particularly authentic. There were one or two problems: the trebles occasionally found it difficult to sustain the strength of tone needed at the end of several movements; and the whole chorus had to battle perpetually against the appallingly unmanageable acoustic of the Abbey Church, where large audiences serve only to dampen the sound without significantly reducing the difficulty of the echo. Some vicious "double-dottong" as in "Behold the Lamb of God", pressed the technical resources of both choir and orchestra to their limit, and occasionally beyond; yet it is a measure of the quality of the performance that these difficulties paled into insignificance as the music progressed and confidence grew. By the time the choir came to sing "Since by man came death", they had well-nigh conquered the acoustic and interpretative difficulties were washed into irrelevance by the excitement of the moment.

At the time of composing Messiah, Handel, after some bleak years had come to yearn for "comfort", hence the prominent position of "Comfort ye my people" at the beginning of the oratorio. Ian Caley accepted whole-
heartedly the burden which this imposes on the tenor soloist and continued to excel throughout. Paul Esswood exhibited a vocal control which was uncanny: his beautifully shaped phrases and splendid ornaments were highlights of the evening. Honor Sheppard's restrained but fluent rendering of "Rejoice greatly" was almost as memorable. John Tomlinson was sadly indisposed on the night and Peter Knappe kindly elected to substitute, though the unusual ornaments which he inserted at the end of his arias were confusing and superfluous.

The orchestra accompanied well. Particularly remarkable were the strings' quiet entry in "Thy rebuke" and the excellent support to the texture provided by John Tattersdill, the bass player. There was, in addition, some fine viola playing from Fr Adrian and Lady Read. It was a noble gesture to allow two boys to share in the trumpet solo of "The trumpet shall sound", but the wrong notes and dubious tuning were an acute distraction, there and elsewhere.

It is reported that Handel once held a famous prima donna at arm's length out of a high window until she agreed to sing as it pleased him. David Bowman may not be quite as ruthless although it is well-known by now that he expects the highest possible standards of concentration and discipline during rehearsals. The Schola Cantorum is no ordinary choir and the problems experienced by the singers were environmental difficulties and not caused by any carelessness or want of enthusiasm. There were some fine moments, especially in the second part: "Surely He hath borne our griefs" was particularly moving and might have been the "Hallelujah" if it were not for the distracting habit of audiences to stand for the movement's duration. The altos were consistently excellent; the tenors and basses, apart from occasional harshness, negotiated their parts commendably; and the trebles, once they had gained confidence, produced some exhilarating sounds. And lest this review appear over-critical of details, it remains true that Messiah's first critics: "Words are wanting to express the exquisite delight it afforded to the admiring crowded Audience". Such appeared to be the experience of the Ampleforth audiences, and that experience is authentic enough.

Simón Finlow.

Ampleforth College Kinema

Selecting a programme of films for an age-group ranging from 13 to 18 plus in the Television age is a challenging task. Clearly one's function is not to duplicate a Saturday evening's viewing, but to try to select from the many films available the ones which will stimulate, intrigue, interest, inform and involve those who choose to leave the box for that more concentrated and social experience which is cinema. An intelligent film, and there were a number such this term, is never fully exhausted, but its analysis can be too much for a young audience, so there must be a central theme which is penetrable to the less initiated. However, one should always be looking for a depth in situation or character which reveals something of the real world, for without this art, especially cinema art, is mere trinketry for mindless diversion. Outstanding this term were Z and Brother Sun, Sister Moon, the former because it was a deft exposé of the pre-Colonial Greece and a detective story in its own right, and the latter because it teetered on the knife-edge of sloppy romanticism, it generated a beauty, a joy, and an elan which communicated the central Christian experience in terms of happiness and acted as an antidote to the grinding rule-play which so often sums up Christian life. The Day of the Jackal was dry in its faithful following of the novel, and once the light had gone up became utterly uninteresting. Two films which gave something to think about as well as retaining a worthwhile story line were Molly Maguires and The Horseman. Martin Ritt, using Sean Connery in a well-authenticated Pennsylvania coal mine, managed to convey the feel of brutality endemic in nineteenth-century mines, but also opening up the themes of loyalty, conscience and betrayal in the close Irish immigrant community. Frankenheimer's The Horseman, from Kessel's novel, was a film which somehow failed to let go despite its epic quality and the ferocity of the Afghan Buzakari. Its themes of barbarism in the jet age, of figures moulded by the landscape, and the inherited death wish of Uarl (Omar Sharif) tended to overload the adventure quality. Jeremiah Johnson and Gunfight were two amorphous Westerns, the first pitching into the character of a neophyte mountain man, and the second a parable showing the inevitability of war/conflict when two ex-gunfighters happen to converge in a new domestic setting. It was clearly to be seen as an anti-war film, and the actors tended to mouth the arguments which the director and producers (one of the wealthy surviving Indian tribes) had in mind.

The Raging Moon again drew out sympathetic response from the audience and it appears to be a vehicle for romance in a setting which a young audience would respond to, this is partly due to the action-packed figure of Malcolm McDowell and the firm handling which Bryan Forbes wielded in the more sub-worthy portions of the film. Traffic was French and generally split the audience into those who found it very funny and those who didn't. The Lavender Hill Mob was a success and this says much for a film over 20 years old, yet its ingredients had the quality of English humor which will probably never come back to the cinema. Gentle, understated, humane and riddled with an accepted and unspoken class consciousness, it is English and 1940s to its sprocket-holes. Both The Royal Hunt of the Sun and Henry VIII and his Six Wives had something to say and think about, but were not satisfactory in this context. While Fear is the Key and Bullitt said nothing but were. Under David Tabor, the Box crew learnt quickly and developed experience, the School, as usual, being unaware of the work and high professionalism demanded by the weekly shows.

Stephen Wright, O.S.B.
It is sometimes difficult to make clear to members of the Society that debate succeeds only when participation is active. This is why it is usually the case that during the Christmas Term (when the number of debates is highest) the Society holds a meeting on the Saturday evening of sick jokes and jaundiced non-jokes. A monastic habit was ornate enough for the occasion. The seriousness of the subject considered justifiable to have instead of a debate with the girls, a final dress debate: whose contributions to the debate have been of great value.

This meant a fancy-dress debate at which, sad to relate, the only person not to have animals. Maiden speeches were frequent, Mr. Everett, Mr. Dore, Mr. Railing, and Mr. Stourton were also frequent. Since the Richmond Convent seem foolishly to have forsaken the debate, it was well acquainted with Freud and incapable of self-control, and Mr. Hay were also frequent. Antisemite, spoke, except on one occasion, without conviction, but with intense irradiation and emotional appeal the advance of science and logic, reserving the arts for everything is delicate, yet not so much as to forfeit grandeur; everything is superbly restrained. Most of the Turner pictures were away in the Royal Academy for the restored the house during 1965-70, and it has been featured in Country Life in three instances this year. The day ended with a private tour round Harwood House at the invitation of the Countess of Harrow: set on the crest of a hill with parkland stretching away on both north and south front, the latter to a lake, it is one of the most perfect houses of its kind. Everything is large, and yet not too large so that man is dwarfed; everything is delicate, yet not so much as to forfeit grandeur; everything is superbly restrained. Most of the Turner pictures were away in the Royal Academy for the rest, and the site of the old house is now part of the new estate. The day ended with tea before the drawing-room fire of the Cray, one of the Moorhouses.

Mr. Julian Gaisford St Lawrence, the Senior Teller, spoke regularly and utility, often the best of great hilarity. Mr. Barnes, imposing physically and forensically, spoke, except on one occasion, without conviction, but with intense irritability, and Mr. Hay were also frequent. Antisemite, spoke, except on one occasion, without conviction, but with intense irradiation and emotional appeal the advance of science and logic, reserving the arts for everything is delicate, yet not so much as to forfeit grandeur; everything is superbly restrained. Most of the Turner pictures were away in the Royal Academy for the

THE FILM SOCIETY
On 24th October the Society was host to a Yorkshire Arts Association tour of the North of England by Sergei Chokmorov and his latest film Liuti. They had been invited to England by Nina Hibbins (one time film critic of the Morning Star, now film officer for the Y.A.A.). Mrs Hibbins introduced the film which was to be shown in November at the London Film Festival to a crowded theatre. Mrs Hibbins told the story since the film was, without sub-titles, but its simplicity needed little explanation. The presentation was made to the visiting Mrs Hibbins and, later, a discussion was held attended by about 20 boys. The visit was much appreciated by all and it was a delight to have such a distinguished Russian actor and his film at Angelmuir. Much of the country was restricted on Mrs Hibbins, and we hope that it might be possible for her to include us again in any future plans. It was a happy coincidence that the School had recently seen The Norvaman, E. T. A. Hoffmann's film set in Yorkshire which portrayed somewhat the same romantic lifestyle of Mr Chokmorov's countrymen. The Society had a fine programme of films this term beginning with Lindsay Anderson's O Lucky Man. This was a complex, much-liked epic film with Malcolm McDowell and Arthur Lowe satirising the British establishment with undertones of a
Zen-Marxist conflict which was lost on many in the Society, its sparkles and wit plus the remarkable musical score of Alan Price delighted and charmed all. The Distorted Chords of the Bourgeoisie was a bitter, highly entertaining attack upon the Middle Classes, most, but its high ranking with the critics suggested that the Society had much to learn.

The remarkable musical score of Alan Price delighted and charmed all. The Discreet Maricourt High School, Liverpool. We had an impressive 8-1 victory. The next match was enjoyed by all, and we must thank the Old Boys for suffering the 8-0 defeat we were earlier this season were permanently under water, thus making regular Thursday practices hard to arrange. The recent arrival of Football on Monday afternoons however has proved very popular, and successful.

The Inner Circle of the Society had two meetings this term. About 15 invited members of the newly formed Rounders Club, and Walter Matthau in a serious role. Persona finished the term and confused many praising Last Picture Show failed to capture wide appeal despite its theme of relationships between teenagers in an American town in the 1950s. It was perhaps a film prepared to wrestle with it. Christopher Miles' The Virgin and the Gypsy won much praise earlier this season were permanently under water, thus making regular Thursday practices hard to arrange. The recent arrival of Football on Monday afternoons however has proved very popular, and successful.

The Forum continues to thrive: its twenty-six Sixth Form members heard five excellent lectures in the Summer and Christmas Terms, two by masters, two by monks, and, sadly, only one by a member. He attracted the largest audience of seventeen, although all but one were well attended.

The next meeting was more formal, the motion being "This House believes that the killing of a baby on request is justifiable." The speaker showed the effects of the Reformation in history and demonstrated that it was only just coming to an end. The final motion was "This house believes that a man has the right to die as and when he wants." The major themes were euthanasia and whether lunatics should be prevented from destroying themselves. The motion was passed by 8 votes to 7 with 3 abstentions. The next meeting was more formal, the motion being "This House believes that the killing of a baby on request is justifiable." The speaker showed the effects of the Reformation in history and demonstrated that it was only just coming to an end. The final motion was "This house believes that a man has the right to die as and when he wants." The major themes were euthanasia and whether lunatics should be prevented from destroying themselves. The motion was passed by 8 votes to 7 with 3 abstentions.

THE JUNIOR DEBATING SOCIETY

This term there were three debates. They were not always well attended because we had to compete with "Planet of the Apes" on TV. As the General Election was approaching, three parties were formed to contest for a majority. Mr Nixon and Mr Smith led the Christian Democratic Party, Mr Salter and Mr Nicholson the Imperial and Economic Party and Mr Orrin and Mr Donnelly represented the斤 than the extent to which he believes that a man has the right to die as and when he wants." The major themes were euthanasia and whether lunatics should be prevented from destroying themselves. The motion was passed by 8 votes to 7 with 3 abstentions.

Prominent speakers other than those mentioned already were Messrs Durham, Anderson, Roberts and Beacher.

This term there were three debates. They were not always well attended because we had to compete with "Planet of the Apes" on TV. As the General Election was approaching, three parties were formed to contest for a majority. Mr Nixon and Mr Smith led the Christian Democratic Party, Mr Salter and Mr Nicholson the Imperial and Economic Party and Mr Orrin and Mr Donnelly represented the斤 than the extent to which he believes that a man has the right to die as and when he wants." The major themes were euthanasia and whether lunatics should be prevented from destroying themselves. The motion was passed by 8 votes to 7 with 3 abstentions.

Prominent speakers other than those mentioned already were Messrs Durham, Anderson, Roberts and Beacher.

This term there were three debates. They were not always well attended because we had to compete with "Planet of the Apes" on TV. As the General Election was approaching, three parties were formed to contest for a majority. Mr Nixon and Mr Smith led the Christian Democratic Party, Mr Salter and Mr Nicholson the Imperial and Economic Party and Mr Orrin and Mr Donnelly represented the斤 than the extent to which he believes that a man has the right to die as and when he wants." The major themes were euthanasia and whether lunatics should be prevented from destroying themselves. The motion was passed by 8 votes to 7 with 3 abstentions.

Prominent speakers other than those mentioned already were Messrs Durham, Anderson, Roberts and Beacher.
THE JUNIOR SOCIETY

The Society has had quite a successful term with a membership of twenty-seven and six meetings with lectures. The first was given by the Secretary on the Life and Work of Gregor Mendel (1822-1886), the “Father” of genetics. The President spoke on British Coelenterates under the title “Stinging Beauty” and illustrated his talk with a large number of slides on Hydroids, Sea Anemones and jellyfish. The videotape provided a film session with two programmes—“Life in Rivers” and “Life in the Soil”. S. B. Harrison talked about the rearing and conservation of duck for gaming. As Fr Damian had to cancel his lecture owing to illness at short notice, the President gave a second lecture on British Echinoderms, illustrated by slides on various species of Starfish, Brittle Stars, Feather Stars, Sea Urchins, and Sea Cucumbers.

B. L. Bunting, Hon. Sec.

THE MATHEMATICS SOCIETY

The Mathematics Society

The Mathematics Society has a membership of twenty-four and very good and well-attended lectures and our thanks go to the Chairman, Mr Nelson, for the work he put into organising them.

Dr. Terence Jackson of York University addressed the first meeting of the term on the game “solitaire”. The Society was shown a very interesting and attractive proof modulo arithmetic of why, if the middle square is left empty at the start, there are only five squares on which it is possible for the last piece to finish. The proof was of further interest in that it could be applied to other situations, so that given any particular starting position all the possible finishing positions could quickly be found.

For the second meeting the Society was pleased that Mr. T. Nosworthy, gave an amusing and useful talk on the need for common sense when dealing with statistics. The third meeting of the term was addressed by Dr. Richard Crossley of York University on the subject of “Quantum Mechanics”. He outlined the basic principles of his subject, discussing the structure of the atom, waves and particles and the nature of energy. Clearly however the topic was too large to be discussed properly in one lecture and many in the audience were unable to understand all the complex mathematics involved.

The last speaker of the term was Mr. Charles Francis of Ampleforth. His subject was the problem of finding the largest lamina that is able to move round a corner in a corridor. The problem was first put forward by Frege in 1884 and is known as the “lamina problem”. The competition had put forward what they considered to be the largest lamina that would turn a right-angled corner. Mr. Francis, however, had discovered a lamina of slightly larger area and in an entertaining lecture he showed the Society how the lamina was made up and went on to investigate the largest lamina that would turn very obtusely angled corners.

C. J. Potter, Hon. Sec.

THE NATURAL HISTORY SOCIETY

The Natural History Society

The Society has had quite a successful term with a membership of twenty-four and seven meetings with lectures. The first was given by the Secretary on the Life and Work of Gregor Mendel (1822-1886), the “Father” of genetics. The President spoke on British Coelenterates under the title “Stinging Beauty” and illustrated his talk with a large number of slides on Hydroids, Sea Anemones and jellyfish. The videotape provided a film session with two programmes—“Life in Rivers” and “Life in the Soil”. S. B. Harrison talked about the rearing and conservation of duck for gaming. As Fr Damian had to cancel his lecture owing to illness at short notice, the President gave a second lecture on British Echinoderms, illustrated by slides on various species of Starfish, Brittle Stars, Feather Stars, Sea Urchins, and Sea Cucumbers.

Fr Julian

THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL
RUGBY FOOTBALL
THE FIRST FIFTEEN

Played 10, Won 7, Lost 3, Drawn 0. Points For 243, Point Against 76

This was a very good team, nearly a great one. It had a fast and powerful pack, astute half backs and speedy threequarters with real power and not a little pace on the wings. But it had two weaknesses which stopped it from reaching the heights achieved by its immediate predecessor. Firstly its front row lacked weight and secondly the purity and timing of the passing in the centre was not always what it should have been. The first weakness cost the School the matches against Durham and Stonyhurst, the second cost the match against Whigfield. So well did the side cover these weaknesses that the combined margin by which the XV lost these three matches was 14 points; two of these were lost in the last five minutes, one of them with the penultimate kick of the game. In this sense this team did not have the best of fortune and this was underlined in the match against Stonyhurst when the vice-captain, whose power in the tight and skill in the line-outs was greatly missed, was taken ill on the journey and would not play. This is not to denigrate the performance of a genuinely good Stonyhurst side but the psychological blow to the XV was transparently obvious.

The qualities of the team were many. It speaks volumes for the pack and for the midfield backs that the wings scored 23 tries between them, more or less evenly shared. Its all-round pace and skill may be seen in the tries it scored and its defence was only beaten 6 times in the 10 matches. This ability in defence was typified by the full back, N. Plummer, who was one of the strongest tacklers in the team. One tackle of Harper, the Sedbergh captain and centre, will long live in the memory. But he was inconsistent for such a good player and had too many days when he was curiously off form. J. Hamilton-Dalrymple on the right wing made enormous strides this season. Despite his occasional blunders in defence and an occasional glimpse of nervousness in attack, he scored twelve tries and added to his speed and power, an impressive change of pace and a competitive determination which gave him the confidence of the whole side. Added to all this was his ability to kick some prodigiously long goals. The left wing, A. Marsden, lost nothing in comparison. Though a one pace player, his long stride made him difficult to tackle and he scored eleven tries in his turn. His highly admirable determination to solve his own problems of tackling never really succeeded but how he tried ! Of the centres S. Lintin was the most gifted timer of a pass but his electric acceleration was never sufficiently used. He was happy to play in a low key and serve the others around him; his loyalty and his help with the other backs was greatly appreciated. S. Bickerstaffe came into the centre for his first game against Sedbergh and gave some good displays. As yet he is not confident enough to use his individual flair and immense ability; he tended to take his eye off the ball when under pressure and his passing is nothing like as good as his carry. So his tackling improved immeasurably as the season wore on. J. Macaulay and J. Dymon were the half backs and both were gifted players. Macaulay indeed was a good tactician but he, like Lintin, underused his own great ability and it took him until the last match to try a dummy. Dymon tended to serve Macaulay too slowly and to dive-pass too much but he was a scrum half of high quality, strong in attack and defence with a heart as big as his stature is small. The back row were extremely quick to the loose ball, with P. Macfarlane at open-side in the van. When he was absent in the first three games, the side suffered accordingly. He was wonderfully supported by the No. 8, R. Stourton. His vast stride made him difficult to tackle and if he had a build it was in his distribution; the impetus of the attack too often died with him. But his line-out work was often brilliant. His intelligent application to his new role gave a breadth of vision to the back row which is often lacking. The third member of the trio, the quiet N. Georgiadis, was probably the most improved player in the team. He worked quietly away at his job and at his fitness and it would be fair to say that nobody earned his colours more than he did. In the last match against Whigfield he was quite superb. N. Bower did a wonderful job as vice-captain; his smooth, tactful and humorous approach to his own lack of panic helped a great deal to achieve, and in every match he gave his all dominating the line-outs from start to finish. He was very fast in the loose, too, and above all helped to knit the team together. It is not insignificant that the team lost by ten points against Stonyhurst when he was absent and it was as much his influence as his physical that was missed. M. Moore was the other lock and when he learned to go forward he became a powerful player. The front row, lacking in weight as it was, was very fast to the ruck; B. Corkery at tight head worked too much about his game but he was desperately keen for the team and turned in many a great-hearted performance, taking any personal disappointments with fine spirit and humour. G. Vincenti was an old hand at hooker. He always did well in the tight and he was
RUGBY FOOTBALL

Quite outstanding in the loose. His ball-handling rapidly improved this season and his sense of humour along with that of Baker did much for the team, as anything else. Behind everyone stood M. Ainscough, the captain. Asked to go loose head for lack of anyone else, he did his utmost to improve and though patiently disliking the position never uttered a word about changing back to lock. Perhaps it was this that earned him the respect of the team; perhaps it was his great ability in the loose and mauls, and the anticipation he often showed, perhaps it was for the fun he brought to training sessions, perhaps the team were inspired by his obvious determination on the field to succeed, and to do everything for them. Whatever it was, it is the credit for the great spirit of the team, for the way they played and for the success that they were. They were a side well worthy of following in the footsteps of those of the last two years.


The Captain awarded colours to the following: E. Stourton, N. Georgiadis, P. Macfarlane, M. Moir, J. Dyson, J. Macaulay, A. Marsden.

v. O.A.R.U.F.C. (29th September)

The boys started somewhat hesitantly and spent much of the first half in their own territory. If the power of the Old Boys' front row was too much for them this was certainly not true of the line-out which N. Baker controlled with great skill. The O.A.R.U.F.C. pressure eventually told and as a five-yard scrum Macfarlane ran in unopposed under the posts. A rather direful kick sent M. Cooper off on of his magic runs and when he was finally halted in the corner, Ainscough scored, from the ensuing line-out. When P. Macfarlane was helped off with a cut over his eye and half-time arrived with the School 10 points down, nobody could have foreseen the change that was to take place. Bushing their pack and enthusiasm the XV first scored a penalty and from the kick-off scored again in the corner. 10—7 and the match was very much alive. Some storming runs from E. Stourton inspired the School and it was the Old Boys' turn to defend. The loss of Thomiley-Walker was a crucial blow to the Old Boys and the School pack were now well in the ascendency. Mistakes by the Old Boys were quickly turned to the School's advantage and further tries by N. Plummer, A. Marsden and J. Macaulay sealed the issue.

Won 33-16.

v. MOUNT ST MARY'S (at Mount, 5th October)

The School could hardly have had a better start to the new season. They scored a try within a minute in the left-hand corner through A. Marsden and J. Hamilton-Dalrymple rubbed salt in the wound by hitting a monstrous conversion from the edge of touch, equaling that a few minutes later with a massive penalty. This was a flying start and the School continued to exert pressure in the Mount half, enabling Hamilton-Dalrymple to kick two more long penalties and score a fine try in the right corner. Towards the end of the half Mount began to come back into the game and kicked a close range penalty to decrease the margin, but the XV were well satisfied with their lead of 19-3. Mount now had the advantage of the wind and succeeded in worrying the XV with a series of Garryowens from one of which they gained the difference still more by scoring a try near enough to the posts for an easy conversion. But this was the signal for the School to take charge again and the last five minutes saw the School battering at the Mount line. To their credit the Mount defence held but J. Macaulay was able to add an easy penalty. All in all, a most encouraging performance!

Won 22-9.

v. DURHAM (at Durham, 9th October)

Again the XV were away to a great start as Hamilton-Dalrymple kicked a superbly struck penalty in the first minute. He followed this with a try engineered by S. Linton, converted it himself and then kicked yet another penalty. This was all too easy and the XV failed to notice the ominous amount of possession gained in the tight by the fine Durham pack. When rain began to fall in the second half, Durham adopted the necessary tactics and kicked themselves into goal attacking positions. From one of these they scored an stupendous try and continued to pressurise the XV into simple mistakes. One gave away the penalty which put them within range and another in the last few minutes gave Durham the match neatly wrapped and sealed. This was a tragedy for Moir who had played superbly throughout and who, in attempting to ground the ball behind his own line only succeeded in throwing it between the posts where a grateful
Durham took 5 points. There was only time for the XV, to their eternal credit after such a cruel blow, to make one last effort. This they did, and only a knock-on prevented a winning try.

Lost 12—13.

v. GIGGLESWICK (at Ampleforth, 12th October)

The XV were obviously determined to make Giggleswick pay for the Durham defeat, and the forwards set about their opponents with obvious enjoyment, producing such superiority that the backs did not seem to know what to do with the endless supply of good ball. An exchange of penalties followed by a try on the blind side by Plummer, converted by Macauley. But the backs did not function as a unit and continued to spurn their chances with incredible profligacy and only one more try was scored before half-time. If Giggleswick were penalised at the start of the second half, they could not have wanted things any worse. Within three minutes the School had moved further ahead with two more tries by Marsden. Though the Giggleswick pack struggled mightily, it could not score and the Ampleforth backs were just beginning to show their mettle. Their sharpness was telling and further tries were added by Marsden and Hamilton-Dalrymple. The latter’s three tries were superb efforts and a just reward for their efforts in this second half.

Won 49–6.

v. SEDBERGH (at Ampleforth, 19th October)

Sedbergh started this match in such a way as to suggest that they were far too good for the XV, winning the first two tries, making a classic break in the centre and kicking a penalty, all in the first three minutes. But that galvanised the School into action. A long Macauley kick took them immediately into the Sedbergh 25 where they camped long enough for Macauley himself to go over from a winning run. A high kick to the posts brought the second try a few minutes later scored by Marsden, and though Sedbergh reduced the lead to 10–6 with another long penalty, the School were now well in control and a superb piece of play brought Marsden a try near the posts which Macauley converted. Sedbergh were by now worn out and short of mentality, and they fixed the School and ran in a very good try on the left wing to bring the score to 16–10 as half-time. It was anybody’s match and the XV now produced their best piece of play, two lightning runs on either side of the field and swift and sure passing were enough to put Almouchi over on the left, a try promptly reduced in value by a charging tackle from Sedbergh, and finished by Macauley who converted the try and also kicked a penalty to put this right immediately with an unconverted try, but Blundell’s regained the lead for his determined second-half efforts.

Won 27–9.

v. BLUNDELL’S (at S.M.G. Twickenham, 16th December)

Denstone were a very young and inexperienced side and were not able to cope with the power and speed of the XV for long. Soon Moir, who had another fine game, had crashed over near the posts after a lovely high catch and run by Plummer. Marsden soon added to this with an admirable try near the posts which Macauley converted. And with seventeen minutes of the first half left, Sedbergh had produced a series of attacks through their powerful and speedy backs, their desperation was becoming apparent as time and again crashing tackles and brilliant cover defence snuffed them out. It was a splendid match in which both teams had played their hearts out at a very high level of skill and enterprise.

Won 21–13.

v. DENSTONE (at Denstone, 23rd October)

Denstone were a very young and inexperienced side and were not able to cope with the power and speed of the XV for long. Soon Moir, who had another fine game, had crashed over near the posts after a lovely high catch and run by Plummer. Marsden soon added to this with an admirable try near the posts which Macauley converted. Sedbergh were by now worn out and short of mentality, and they fixed the School and ran in a very good try on the left wing to bring the score to 16–10 as half-time. It was anybody’s match and the XV now produced their best piece of play, two lightning runs on either side of the field and swift and sure passing were enough to put Almouchi over on the left, a try promptly reduced in value by a charging tackle from Sedbergh, and finished by Macauley who converted the try and also kicked a penalty to put this right immediately with an unconverted try, but Blundell’s regained the lead for his determined second-half efforts.

Won 27–9.

v. ST PETER’S (at Ampleforth, 16th November)

For the second time in a week the School started slowly and without fire. For fifteen minutes a dauntless game produced few sparks of life, the few that did flash out being smothered out by the XV making careless errors with the possession they did obtain. Gradually things improved: Hamilton-Dalrymple got a second chance of a try from a Macauley kick, soon afterwards Blundell’s made a way through to score again and finally the School were controlling the play territorially and sealed the issue with a penalty. Though Sedbergh mounted a series of attacks through their powerful and speedy backs, their desperation was becoming apparent as time and again crashing tackles and brilliant cover defence snuffed them out. It was a splendid match in which both teams had played their hearts out at a very high level of skill and enterprise.

Won 49–6.

THE TOUR

The XV were obviously determined to make Giggleswick pay for the Durham defeat, and the forwards set about their opponents with obvious enjoyment, producing such superiority that the backs did not seem to know what to do with the endless supply of good ball. An exchange of penalties followed by a try on the blind side by Plummer, converted by Macauley. But the backs did not function as a unit and continued to spurn their chances with incredible profligacy and only one more try was scored before half-time. If Giggleswick were penalised at the start of the second half, they could not have wanted things any worse. Within three minutes the School had moved further ahead with two more tries by Marsden. Though the Giggleswick pack struggled mightily, it could not score and the Ampleforth backs were just beginning to show their mettle. Their sharpness was telling and further tries were added by Marsden and Hamilton-Dalrymple. The latter’s three tries were superb efforts and a just reward for their efforts in this second half.

Won 49–6.

v. STONTHURST (at Stonyhurst, 9th November)

Baker taken ill on the bus and unable to play, the pitch a quagmire after heavy morning rains, whatever the result, the School were at their best, and they needed to be against a fine Stonyhurst side. Outweighed and outjumped in the tight phases they could only hope to make up by good tackling but it was Stonyhurst who showed all the fire and fervour throughout the game. Despite an early penalty by Hamilton-Dalrymple a fine kick against a strong wind, Stonyhurst controlled the game from the outset and spent long periods in possession, though the School were never used to the conditions in the same decisive way as their opponents and squandered some relatively simple chances. As time went on and the School could make no impression, Stonyhurst got better and better and finally sealed the win with a try in the final minutes to pull further away to a well-deserved victory. This was a great disappointment to all after their superb play in the matches before half-term.

Lost 3–13.

v. ST PETER’S (at Ampleforth, 16th November)

The XV were obviously determined to make Giggleswick pay for the Durham defeat, and the forwards set about their opponents with obvious enjoyment, producing such superiority that the backs did not seem to know what to do with the endless supply of good ball. An exchange of penalties followed by a try on the blind side by Plummer, converted by Macauley. But the backs did not function as a unit and continued to spurn their chances with incredible profligacy and only one more try was scored before half-time. If Giggleswick were penalised at the start of the second half, they could not have wanted things any worse. Within three minutes the School had moved further ahead with two more tries by Marsden. Though the Giggleswick pack struggled mightily, it could not score and the Ampleforth backs were just beginning to show their mettle. Their sharpness was telling and further tries were added by Marsden and Hamilton-Dalrymple. The latter’s three tries were superb efforts and a just reward for their efforts in this second half.

Won 49–6.

v. WHITGIFT (at Whitgift, 14th December)

Tries did not settle kindly on the XV at Whitgift and as they trooped off sadly at the end of a disappointing match they could be excused for feeling that there is no justice. Within ten minutes of the start they were six points down through two well-struck penalties which were sweetly struck but were spoilt in the tackle and the XV were in both the rucks and mauls and put constant pressure on a splendid Whitgift defence. Unfortunately Hamilton-Dalrymple and Macauley were off form with their goal-kicking and all this pressure added up to one penalty and several near misses. But the XV could not have been too worried to be 6–3 down at half-time. Playing down the slope, they dominated play completely but the little bit of luck that could have saved the game continued to elude them. Macauley should have scored on the left before Hamilton-Dalrymple put over a long penalty to level the scores. Again heavy pressure was put on the Whitgift line, again a stubborn Whitgift defence refused to yield and then on what was Whitgift’s second visit to the Ampleforth half and with what was the penultimate kick of the game, Whitsgift succeeded with a very long and accurate penalty.

Lost 6–9.

v. BLUNDELL’S (at S.M.G. Twickenham, 16th December)

With only their second meeting of the season, Blundell’s came into this match as the pre-eminent side, so fiercely were they expected in the rucks and mauls and put constant pressure on a splendid Whitgift defence. Unfortunately Hamilton-Dalrymple and Macauley were off form with their goal-kicking and all this pressure added up to one penalty and several near misses. But the XV could not have been too worried to be 6–3 down at half-time. Playing down the slope, they dominated play completely but the little bit of luck that could have saved the game continued to elude them. Macauley should have scored on the left before Hamilton-Dalrymple put over a long penalty to level the scores. Again heavy pressure was put on the Whitgift line, again a stubborn Whitgift defence refused to yield and then on what was Whitgift’s second visit to the Ampleforth half and with what was the penultimate kick of the game, Whitsgift succeeded with a very long and accurate penalty.

Lost 6–9.
THE AMPLEFORTH JOURNAL

162

THE 3RD XV once again had a good season, and this year was undefeated in seven matches scoring 232 points and conceding 23 points. The forwards on all occasions, except against Barnard Castle and Durham, the team scored 92 points for with only 14 against. The forwards just did not get the ball. There was no dearth of talent; too many of them failed to give of their best and throw themselves heart and soul into the game. In the tight fords just did not get the ball. There was no dearth of talent; too many of them failed to give of their best and throw themselves heart and soul into the game. In the tight forwards just did not get the ball. There was no dearth of talent; too many of them failed to give of their best and throw themselves heart and soul into the game.

THE THIRD FIFTEEN

THE THIRD FIFTEEN

The third team started badly with the loss of the side's key winger Harney with a broken leg in the first full practice game. It was this blow to the team. There was no depth of talent; too many of them failed to give of their best and throw themselves heart and soul into the game.

THE SECOND FIFTEEN

The following played:

THE SECOND FIFTEEN

The results were as follows:

RUGBY FOOTBALL 163

Pencklington, dominated the opposition and gave the backs plenty of the ball. The backs moved the ball about freely and handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team. The back three were handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team.

THE THIRD FIFTEEN

The 3rd XV once again had a good season, and this year was undefeated in seven matches scoring 232 points and conceding only 34 points. The vast majority of the points were scored by the threequarters, especially in the last game when they played a 20-4. D. Mistick and M. T. Wood were both exceptionally quick. This gives some idea of the type of rugby playing: it was fast, open and orthodox, in spite of the often heavy grounds. The forwards on all occasions, except against Pencklington, dominated the opposition and gave the backs plenty of the ball. The backs moved the ball about freely and handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team.

THE SECOND FIFTEEN

The following played:

THE SECOND FIFTEEN

The results were as follows:

RUGBY FOOTBALL 163

Pencklington, dominated the opposition and gave the backs plenty of the ball. The backs moved the ball about freely and handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team. The back three were handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team.

THE THIRD FIFTEEN

The 3rd XV once again had a good season, and this year was undefeated in seven matches scoring 232 points and conceding only 34 points. The vast majority of the points were scored by the threequarters, especially in the last game when they played a 20-4. D. Mistick and M. T. Wood were both exceptionally quick. This gives some idea of the type of rugby playing: it was fast, open and orthodox, in spite of the often heavy grounds. The forwards on all occasions, except against Pencklington, dominated the opposition and gave the backs plenty of the ball. The backs moved the ball about freely and handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team.

THE SECOND FIFTEEN

The following played:

THE SECOND FIFTEEN

The results were as follows:

RUGBY FOOTBALL 163

Pencklington, dominated the opposition and gave the backs plenty of the ball. The backs moved the ball about freely and handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team. The back three were handled with great skill. It was perhaps no coincidence that many of them were established cricketers. The Hoe G. A. G. Asquith was considered to be the best five-eighth in the team.
enjoy passing so much that he tended to neglect his break. Behind them all Day had an excellent season at full back. He caught well and was always ready to counter-attack with flair. A good tackling was generally sound and decisive. He must improve his kicking technique if he is ever to make the grade higher up. Outs on the set who showed enough potential to make the grade further up the School were Foley who had an excellent game against Barnard, Thomlins-Walker and Knott.

The season started with a satisfactory win over Pickering in a rather ragged game. The side played well in patches, but too many errors prevented a good rhythm being established. The forwards played to some time to establish itself against Barnard, but once Day had made the initial break from the back, Lomax's strong running backed up the work of the forwards to produce a good win. In contrast the side against Sedbergh found little Newcasle and no home ground was a winning lead. It was especially pleasing to see the way in which the side could take up pressure and still finish the game strongly. The game against Barnard was disappointing. The forwards played to the very first minute of the game. However, good rucking and some fast handling saw Beck go over for an unconverted try. Stonyhurst replied with a try on the blind side of a ruck. A last minute penalty when one of our centres was off side under the post saw them draw level. Even then we had a chance to snatch the game when an excellent penalty attempt kicked by Willis into the gale saw the ball swing agonisingly round the wrong side of the post for the ball to be lost. The match was played under very difficult conditions. Early chances were thrown away with some abandon, but an excellent threequarters movement, following heavy Peter's pressure, saw Hadcock make some. They went into an eight-point lead with two tries in quick succession. The deficit was cut back by a penalty and the lead changed hands with a converted try. Leeds went ahead again with another try just before half-time. The second half was keenly fought of the game. The game against Barnard Castle started with a bang. Some impressive play brought tries to both wings. Then we sat back and allowed them to press. But once again the pack took control and we finished the game well.

Posession on the left. Quick passing looked likely to produce an Ampleforth score, but an interception saw a breakaway try for Leeds right on the final whistle. An exciting game, excellently refereed.

In conclusion the season can be summed up in three words; enjoyable, frustrating and to some extent successful. The success of the side can be deduced from its results. The team spirit and the fact that carelessness and lapses in concentration at vital times meant the team did not turn their superiority into points. The involvement lay in the vigour and the humour with which they tackled the training and the games. It made the job of the selector that much more easy and pleasant. The team spirit, hard work and sound team spirit and full credit must go to Cronan as captain for this approach. He had an excellent season as captain and the success of the side does credit to his rugby brain.

To the following were awarded their colours: R. Wakefield, E. Allerton, J. Bruce, A. Pope, D. Webber, N. Carr, J. Brennan, M. Garman, C. Danvers, B. Moody (Captain); the following also represented the School: E. Troughton, S. Hardy, A. Pope, A. Finlayson, E. Ruane, P. Borton.

The following were awarded their colours R. Wakefield, E. Allerton, J. Bruce, A. Pope, D. Webber, N. Carr, J. Brennan, M. Garman, C. Danvers, B. Moody (Captain); the following also represented the School: E. Troughton, S. Hardy, A. McDonald, A. Finlayson, E. Ruane, P. Borton.
THE HOUSE MATCHES

All sorts of conditions had to be coped with: only once was there the traditional "dry ball" and the XV ran up 30 points; four times they alternately played on a firm surface and a "dry ball", though in the last game of Neely they played on a pitch more or less bare. The rugby team of St Aidan's had to learn to play various types of game and they succeeded. It took a month to sort out the team and get it to play together; thereafter the boys played as a team, encouraged each other, played some good ball and appreciated the effort of their opponents.

The importance of modern rugby of the tight was shown to good effect is that the front row dominated throughout and, well supported by intelligence and skilful scrummaging. The front row dominated throughout and, well supported by intelligence and skilful scrummaging. The driving power of the pack was immense, consistently maintained throughout the game. The centre of the field was dominated by St John's, with Beale, Read, O'Kelly, and eventually Bumford being the most notable. The forwards were often able to use their size and strength to good effect, and the backs were more than adequately supported by the forwards.

St John's, for whom Marsden was in prime form, beat a courageous St Wilfrid's 32-4. St Thomas's, Graves, Maxwell Scott, Read, O'Kelly and eventually Bumford were all tried, the last cutting inside and strengthening their defence — he runs with fine balance. On the left wing Duthie, fine player though he will be, lacks finishing ability largely through lack of practice. Duthie passed well, ran sensibly and improved his defensive position — tackling reasonably safely and overcoming limitations in handling and passing. Paviour into space or darting up the blind-side. He controlled the tactics well and supplied the "dry ball" which Duthie, fine player though he will be, lacks. He was the player of the season.

The match between St Aidan's and St Thomas's in the semi-final was one of the few where the opposition was not as strong as expected. At the end of the first half St Bede's had a 36-0 lead, and it was only in the last quarter that St Aidan's ran away with the game. The forwards dominated, with Beale, Read, O'Kelly, and eventually Bumford being the most notable. The forwards were often able to use their size and strength to good effect, and the backs were more than adequately supported by the forwards.


OTHER ACTIVITIES

SWIMMING

Maintains the momentum of the summer season quite easily till about half term, after which interest reduces and one is left with only the more dedicated swimmers still in early part of the spring. There is, however, room for improvement and the team was excellent. We had one swimming match, a "B" team against Stockton Grammar School for the junior age groups. This gave several swimmers a chance to appear in other than their usual strokes, and others an opening into match situations sooner than they expected. It was therefore a good thing.

In York District races, C. Moore was 3rd in the Open 100 m. Freestyle and N. Mostyn 5th. In the 200 m. Breast, P. Ritchie 6th and N. Mostyn 7th. S. Ashworth was 4th in the Open 100 m. Butterfly, and 5th in the 200 m. Medley. As he had to swim heats in both, he succeeded in his object of setting a School record in the latter.

Many in the set did not play in a match but such is the overall strength that half a dozen could find their way to the 1st XV when they grow older. The skills are there and one only wishes to see more of them used. The team played seven founder's day matches and the centres and St Aidan's dominated, but the moment to remember is always in rugby: the third phase kick and speed of passing to the wing achieved perfection by 1st XV and early on at Scarborough.

Many in the set did not play in a match but such is the overall strength that half a dozen could find their way to the 1st XV when they grow older. The skills are there and one only wishes to see more of them used. The team played seven founder's day matches and the centres and St Aidan's dominated, but the moment to remember is always in rugby: the third phase kick and speed of passing to the wing achieved perfection by 1st XV and early on at Scarborough.

Many in the set did not play in a match but such is the overall strength that half a dozen could find their way to the 1st XV when they grow older. The skills are there and one only wishes to see more of them used. The team played seven founder's day matches and the centres and St Aidan's dominated, but the moment to remember is always in rugby: the third phase kick and speed of passing to the wing achieved perfection by 1st XV and early on at Scarborough.

Many in the set did not play in a match but such is the overall strength that half a dozen could find their way to the 1st XV when they grow older. The skills are there and one only wishes to see more of them used. The team played seven founder's day matches and the centres and St Aidan's dominated, but the moment to remember is always in rugby: the third phase kick and speed of passing to the wing achieved perfection by 1st XV and early on at Scarborough.

Many in the set did not play in a match but such is the overall strength that half a dozen could find their way to the 1st XV when they grow older. The skills are there and one only wishes to see more of them used. The team played seven founder's day matches and the centres and St Aidan's dominated, but the moment to remember is always in rugby: the third phase kick and speed of passing to the wing achieved perfection by 1st XV and early on at Scarborough.
JUDO

A. Gray and T. Fitzherbert, Blue bottom and Green top respectively, left at the end of the Summer Term, leaving the Senior belt—Charles Holroyd —Top Orange. A second setback was the illness, during the holidays, of Mr Callaghm, whom we all missed, and to whom we all hope he has a quick recovery.

Not unusually, Mr Callaghan had everything organised, and Mr Lang, a first dan Black belt, very kindly came over every Wednesday night. We would like to thank him and congratulate him on his efforts. Despite poor attendance from some part of the Club we were able to overcome the two major setbacks with Mr Lang’s coaching, and the vastly under-rated skill of Holroyd, Fitzpatrick and De Larriaga, more than offset the loss of Gray and Fitzherbert.

For next term it would be good to see more regular attenders from the second years and upwards. The advent of Mr Miller, an officer from the Army Physical Training Corps, and a senior coach in the Club, and the有益 from the Club in the Senior School, and countless numbers wishing to join in Junior House.

A. Gray and T. Fitzherbert, Blue bottom and Green top respectively, left at the end of the Summer Term, leaving the Blue belt to the future of the Club depends for the next few years. We shall miss C. Holroyd who is leaving and will leave the Senior belt to M. Campbell, a bottom Orange.

Mr Lang graded 21 boys before half term and notable achievements were, C. Holroyd Green top, N. C. Fitzpatrick, bottom Orange, C. de Larriaga top Yellow, and in the Juniors, N. Van den Berg, Robinson and Greenfield gained Yellow belts.

Mr Callaghan had everything organised, and Mr Leng, a first dan Black belt, very kindly came over every Wednesday night. We would like to thank him and congratulate him on his efforts. Despite poor attendance from some part of the Club we were able to overcome the two major setbacks with Mr Lang’s coaching, and the vastly under-rated skill of Holroyd, Fitzpatrick and De Larriaga, more than offset the loss of Gray and Fitzherbert.

Not unusually, Mr Callaghan had everything organised, and Mr Lang, a first dan Black belt, very kindly came over every Wednesday night. We would like to thank him and congratulate him on his efforts. Despite poor attendance from some part of the Club we were able to overcome the two major setbacks with Mr Lang’s coaching, and the vastly under-rated skill of Holroyd, Fitzpatrick and De Larriaga, more than offset the loss of Gray and Fitzherbert.

FENCING

This term saw the advent of Mr Miller, an officer from the Army Physical Training Corps, and a senior coach in the Club. The popularity of fencing in Ampleforth is now gaining momentum, and these are 26 members of the Club in the Senior School, and countless numbers wishing to join in Junior House.

The foil team is made up of nine members, selected from a total of 23, and with the help of the new coach and the equipment, T. G. Lee. In the match against the Army Apprentice’s College, T. Clarke proved himself to be a worthy opponent, and Holroyd certainly distinguished himself in combat, in spite of shortcomings in footwork. Both took their first, and the third, and the final result was 4-3 to the Army Apprentice’s College.

The Sabres were led by the School Captain, M. Hudson. His light touch and firmness of style stood him in good stead, although his attacks lacked power. M. Grofnek, backed up by his quick reactions and good style, fended off, although he had a few points to his advantage. A. Grofnek displayed a good head for combat and a certain calm while fighting, in spite of various shortcomings in technique.

The match against Army Apprentice’s College, Harrogate, the overall result was a draw after an exciting evening’s fencing.

SPARE: Won 5—4.
POL: Lost 0—0.

THE BEAGLES

To make the record complete this account should start with the Puppy Show at the Kennels on Saturday, 27th April. It was our first year, and made Reserve Champion. This was a more successful year than we have had for some time.

The new season opened with S. P. Roberts Master and hunting hounds, C. E. Lees - Millett and B. P. Horniman’s hunting, in the White House. It was not that today saw the burial of George Todd of Gillamoor, a friend and supporter of many years standing of all the local Hunts and sporting events. He had been a cripple for some time, but his courage was an inspiration to all who knew him.

Conditions were good in October and there were some enjoyable days, particularly at East Moors on the 9th and Bedlam Rigg on the 12th. The month ended with another loss in the death of Billy Wilson, perhaps one of the best-known figures in the district, particularly during his many years with the Sinnington Harriers.

It was a great disappointment that fog prevented hunting in Holroyd on 8th November since Philip Barrington was due to be out on the 9th. Conditions were better on the 10th at Cowes Hall, where he was able to see hounds and officials at work. Mr Callaghan made a good wild day at Laddingham where hounds were worked with great success. Conditions were very cold, and there was a strong wind, but the hounds were in good heart and the season ended with a good meet on 12th October at Low Mill, where the hounds were given a good run and a good time.

THE VENTURE SCOUTS

In April, Scouting magazine challenged Venture Scouts all over the country to walk from their home to the nearest Ordnance Survey Map to raise money for the Scout Association. We planned a route across sheet 90 (Wensleydale) from Ingleton across Ingleborough, Pen-y-ghent and Great Whernside to Lofthouse in Nidderdale. This was a distance of about 50 miles which involved 6,000 feet of climbing. On the first Sunday of term we were up at 4-0 a.m., and we were on our way. Michael Robinson drove us to Ingleton and at 7-45 the walkers (Mark Willbourn, Ian Millar, Tom Francis and Gerard Simpson) began the ascent of Ingleborough. We arrived at Lofthouse at 5-00 p.m., exhausted but content. Our entry for this competition was “Highly Commended” by the judges.

The annual Raven weekend was held in October when about 60 Venture Scouts and Ranger Guides from the County joined us at the lakes for an outdoor activities weekend. One new innovation this year was the opportunity to do some canoeing.

Our Pennine weekend was not very well attended—fortunately it clashed with Horse match at Low Mill, but it was very much enjoyed by those who went (Mark, Tom, Peter Blakeney, Michael Hornung and Gerard). On Saturday evening the Kingsdale Master and hunting hounds, C. E. Lees - Millett and B. P. Horniman’s hunting, in the White House. It was not that today saw the burial of George Todd of Gillamoor, a friend and supporter of many years standing of all the local Hunts and sporting events. He had been a cripple for some time, but his courage was an inspiration to all who knew him.

Conditions were good in October and there were some enjoyable days, particularly at East Moors on the 9th and Bedlam Rigg on the 12th. The month ended with another loss in the death of Billy Wilson, perhaps one of the best-known figures in the district, particularly during his many years with the Sinnington Harriers.

It was a great disappointment that fog prevented hunting in Holroyd on 8th November since Philip Barrington was due to be out on the 9th. Conditions were better on the 10th at Cowes Hall, where he was able to see hounds and officials at work. Mr Callaghan made a good wild day at Laddingham where hounds were worked with great success. Conditions were very cold, and there was a strong wind, but the hounds were in good heart and the season ended with a good meet on 12th October at Low Mill, where the hounds were given a good run and a good time.

THE SEA SCOUTS

To commemorate the 150th anniversary of the Royal National Lifeboat Institution, the Scout Association launched a nationwide operation on 5th/6th October to raise £100,000 to buy the RNLI a new lifeboat. It was decided that our Operation Lifeboat would take the form of a 24-hour sponsored rowing operation. The organisers, Simon Darlin assisted by Simon Allan, made preparations with the help of some of the old operatives, and the team were driven over to the lake and sailing started at 1400 with some of the first canoe capsized about midnight trying to take a corner too fast. James Hopkins was rescued by the safety boat within seconds and the 24-hour brew of coffee was ready.
James Hopkins, cutting firewood with an axe, gave himself a very nasty cut right in waiting for him by the camp fire. The second capsize occurred as the monks back at the Abbey were waking up. Breakfast, ... Lennon and Mr Masker who didn't stay to eat his handiwork. Through all this, the Troop raised over £116 for the RNLI.

DIARY LANDMARKS

THE JUNIOR HOUSE

We became a three-year-house for the first time in our history when we opened the School in September. So we changed our forms' names. The first form is for ten-year-olds, the second for eleven-year-olds, the third for twelve-year-olds. The three forms are made up mainly of old pupils, but life is never as neat and tidy as all that so the match is not exact. Our ten-year-olds settled in and made themselves at home straight away. It was good to welcome Mrs Nelson and Mrs Bunting who came to help teach them, Mrs Nelson in the English department and Mrs Bunting in the pottery shop.

CONCERTS, LECTURES, FILMS

The opening concert took place on 15th September, Imogen Cooper and David Bowman playing Mozart, Fauré, Schumann and Dvorak on two pianos. The house went to the theatre to listen to Major Chapman's talk on the Mount Everest Conquest expedition in the South Pole. There was a concert on the 22nd by Old Boys, Patrick Newsom (cello) and whisky Howard (piano) who played Beethoven, Debussy, Rachmaninoff. On 6th October there was a first class concert by the Rydal Orchestra which played a Wagner prelude, Bruch's violin concert in G minor and Brahms' 1st symphony. John Clegg played Haydn, Beethoven, Fauré, Grandson, Pavel, Debussy for us on 20th October. The Yorkshire Baroque concert on 10th November was particularly interesting and was the last of the term.

As Fr Geoffrey for arranging fifteen films during the term. They were all good but the most popular seem to have been How to Steal a Diamond in Four Uneasy Lessons, On Her Majesty's Secret Service, The Magnificent Seven, and amazingly enough, The Further Perils of Laurel and Hardy.

ARTS AND CRAFTS

There was relief when the last of our fire improvements were installed during the term. Fire stoves, smoke detectors, heat detectors are all in as well and all these bits of equipment were tested privately at half term and publicly for the first time on 10th November. The fire doors had two immediate and unforeseen effects: the place is much warmer, which is nice; and although there is much less noise, nobody can hear the House bell, which is not so nice.

The opening concert took place on 15th September, Imogen Cooper and David Bowman playing Mozart, Fauré, Schumann and Dvorak on two pianos. The house went to the theatre to listen to Major Chapman's talk on the Mount Everest Conquest expedition in the South Pole. There was a concert on the 22nd by Old Boys, Patrick Newsom (cello) and whisky Howard (piano) who played Beethoven, Debussy, Rachmaninoff. On 6th October there was a first class concert by the Rydal Orchestra which played a Wagner prelude, Bruch's violin concert in G minor and Brahms' 1st symphony. John Clegg played Haydn, Beethoven, Fauré, Grandson, Pavel, Debussy for us on 20th October. The Yorkshire Baroque concert on 10th November was particularly interesting and was the last of the term.

As Fr Geoffrey for arranging fifteen films during the term. They were all good but the most popular seem to have been How to Steal a Diamond in Four Uneasy Lessons, On Her Majesty's Secret Service, The Magnificent Seven, and amazingly enough, The Further Perils of Laurel and Hardy.

ARTS AND CRAFTS

There was relief when the last of our fire improvements were installed during the term. Fire stoves, smoke detectors, heat detectors are all in as well and all these bits of equipment were tested privately at half term and publicly for the first time on 10th November. The fire doors had two immediate and unforeseen effects: the place is much warmer, which is nice; and although there is much less
The Junior XV was quite skilful but it was too light to be very successful. It took a long time to select the right team and... By St Martin's. The forwards were not sufficiently aware of the need to get the ball out while the backs rarely got their

Pot, where a cave rescue practice was in progress. We were grateful for the help of the Venture Scouts who joined us for our second hike over Ingleborough and down past Gaping Gill to Clapham.

out of the 350 feet deep nearby Rowten in the Pennines, based on the Ingleton fascinating limestone country with imp-

expedition came in November when 36 of we enjoyed two splendid days in the term. Their first chance of a major... absorbed into the troop in the course of

invited to try out scouting and were gradually pros- per on Wednesday evenings and fencing... and E W Cunningham.

that first term. Their first chance of a major... and R A Robinson, dependent on Sunday.

librarians were I P MacDonald and J F T.

In October there was a long weekend training camp for Patrol Leaders and then assistant leaders who also undertook the weekend hike-camp required for the Adv. Scout Standard. The Senior Patrol Leader is Simon Hare. Andrew Morrissey is his deputy and the remaining six are: Peter Sexton, Edward Gaynor, Richard Millar, Timothy Copping, Giles Waterton and Richard Locksle.

Members of the second form were invited to try out scouting and were gradually absorbed into the troop in the course of

by A W G. McMillan and Tommy and... wish to thank most sincerely Miss Hyde, who came to look after the First Form, and...

France plays in the Gallery, admirably per-

them for all their help. The School had

for the first time there was a Fourth Form... than... J. D. Massey, P T Scanlan

Art

Sport

and line going. Yet in spite of lack of success the side played with spirit and when they have more experience they will do much better.

It was good to have help from the Upper School during the mid-term. The Plymthwaite, Martin Rigby and Auberon Ash-

brooke all did much to keep our regular rugby. Official's teas, with guest guidance, continued to prosper on Wednesday evenings and fencing began to appear on the menu on Friday afternoons, thanks to Mr Henry.

figures)

Head Captain: A H St J Murray.

Captain of Rugby: A J Stackhouse.


Secretaries: J D Campbell, J A Mauchline, J M Barron.


H C Maxwell, E L Thomas.

Secretaries: J C Campbell, J A Mauchline.

St Martin's, S E Fawcett, D J Smith


French plays in the Gallery, admirably per-

D C A Green.

in use for the second part of the term. Next

the term and has clearly made a perfect recovery. We shall be glad to have him back to normal at the beginning of next term.

We welcome Fr Gregory Carroll, who came to look after the First Form, and also Mrs Blackden, who helped us out in the Art and P.E. depart-

the term. This brought several new features: for the first time there was a Fourth Form of success. Good work was done by A W G. Green, E A Craston, W A. Gilbery, B. D. Twomey, M W Bradley, J B W Steel, O J J Wynne and E M G Soden-Bird.

The term began with the sad news that Fr Justin had been taken ill, and would spend the term convalescing. In fact, he returned to Gilling for the second part of the term and has clearly made a perfect recovery. We shall be glad to have him back to normal at the beginning of next term.

Seven IXs, three XIIIs and three IVs divided the oldest boys into two groups for Extra Art. The division gave minorities if unequal sized classes; but it also gave possible aim for this age-group.

The Second Form artists had some useful lessons from Mrs Bunting, who taught modelling and paper cutting with great success. Good work was done by A W G. Green, E A Craston, W A. Gilbery, B. D. Twomey, M W Bradley, J B W Steel, O J J Wynne and E M G Soden-Bird.

On the first day of the term the Art Competition was held. The topic was "The world of tomorrow", and a group of students were asked to

To the boys who joined the School in September 1974:


The following played for the 1st XV: T W Nelson (full back); A M Forsythe, S C C Hare, J G Waterton, C B L Roberts, D C A Green.

The Junior XV was quite skilful but it was too light to be very successful. It took a long time to select the right team and then assistant leaders who also undertook the weekend hike-camp required for the Adv. Scout Standard. The Senior Patrol Leader is Simon Hare. Andrew Morrissey is his deputy and the remaining six are: Peter Sexton, Edward Gaynor, Richard Millar, Timothy Copping, Giles Waterton and Richard Locksle.

Members of the second form were invited to try out scouting and were gradually absorbed into the troop in the course of

by A W G. McMillan and Tommy and... wish to thank most sincerely Miss Hyde, who came to look after the First Form, and...

France plays in the Gallery, admirably per-

D C A Green.

in use for the second part of the term. Next

the term and has clearly made a perfect recovery. We shall be glad to have him back to normal at the beginning of next term.

We welcome Fr Gregory Carroll, who came to look after the First Form, and also Mrs Blackden, who helped us out in the Art and P.E. depart-

the term. This brought several new features: for the first time there was a Fourth Form of success. Good work was done by A W G. Green, E A Craston, W A. Gilbery, B. D. Twomey, M W Bradley, J B W Steel, O J J Wynne and E M G Soden-Bird.

The Second Form artists had some useful lessons from Mrs Bunting, who taught modelling and paper cutting with great success. Good work was done by A W G. Green, E A Craston, W A. Gilbery, B. D. Twomey, M W Bradley, J B W Steel, O J J Wynne and E M G Soden-Bird.

On the first day of the term the Art Competition was held. The topic was "The world of tomorrow", and a group of students were asked to

To the boys who joined the School in September 1974:


The following played for the 1st XV: T W Nelson (full back); A M Forsythe, S C C Hare, J G Waterton, C B L Roberts, D C A Green.

The Junior XV was quite skilful but it was too light to be very successful. It took a long time to select the right team and then assistant leaders who also undertook the weekend hike-camp required for the Adv. Scout Standard. The Senior Patrol Leader is Simon Hare. Andrew Morrissey is his deputy and the remaining six are: Peter Sexton, Edward Gaynor, Richard Millar, Timothy Copping, Giles Waterton and Richard Locksle.

Members of the second form were invited to try out scouting and were gradually absorbed into the troop in the course of

by A W G. McMillan and Tommy and... wish to thank most sincerely Miss Hyde, who came to look after the First Form, and...

France plays in the Gallery, admirably per-

D C A Green.

in use for the second part of the term. Next

the term and has clearly made a perfect recovery. We shall be glad to have him back to normal at the beginning of next term.

We welcome Fr Gregory Carroll, who came to look after the First Form, and also Mrs Blackden, who helped us out in the Art and P.E. depart-

the term. This brought several new features: for the first time there was a Fourth Form of success. Good work was done by A W G. Green, E A Craston, W A. Gilbery, B. D. Twomey, M W Bradley, J B W Steel, O J J Wynne and E M G Soden-Bird.

The Second Form artists had some useful lessons from Mrs Bunting, who taught modelling and paper cutting with great success. Good work was done by A W G. Green, E A Craston, W A. Gilbery, B. D. Twomey, M W Bradley, J B W Steel, O J J Wynne and E M G Soden-Bird.

On the first day of the term the Art Competition was held. The topic was "The world of tomorrow", and a group of students were asked to

To the boys who joined the School in September 1974:


The following played for the 1st XV: T W Nelson (full back); A M Forsythe, S C C Hare, J G Waterton, C B L Roberts, D C A Green.

The Junior XV was quite skilful but it was too light to be very successful. It took a long time to select the right team and then assistant leaders who also undertook the weekend hike-camp required for the Adv. Scout Standard. The Senior Patrol Leader is Simon Hare. Andrew Morrissey is his deputy and the remaining six are: Peter Sexton, Edward Gaynor, Richard Millar, Timothy Copping, Giles Waterton and Richard Locksle.

Members of the second form were invited to try out scouting and were gradually absorbed into the troop in the course of

by A W G. McMillan and Tommy and... wish to thank most sincerely Miss Hyde, who came to look after the First Form, and...

France plays in the Gallery, admirably per-

D C A Green.
MUSIC

The Autumn Term in the music department tends to be more exploratory than the other two as it is important that new boys are introduced to a suitable instrument and the progress of those already learning is carefully assessed. Consequently there has only been one concert, given with considerable success, and reviewed below. Over half the boys in the School now learn an instrument and it is particularly gratifying to see the mature way the Fourth Form musicians have organised their practising. Special thanks must go to Mrs Wright who came to teach the piano for one term, and we are very pleased to have Mrs Kiswar to teach the flautists.

The end of term concert was as entertaining and impressive as those of us who have known Gilling in the past two or three years have come to expect. One is constantly amazed at the scope and variety on these occasions, so that one can glimpse the whole perspective of Gilling music. For a school the size of Gilling to be able to produce two separate orchestras, and soloists for their violin, cornets, recorders, clarinets, cellist, horn, not to mention a separate wind orchestra with a complete complement of woodwind and brass would, a few years ago, have seemed unthinkable. Most striking of all is the evident enjoyment of everyone involved, performers, listeners and teachers, and it augurs well for the future of music at Ampleforth that there is such a wealth of budding talent to be developed and tapped. Of the soloists, Nicholas Nisbet, S J Macdonald; others who played were E M G Soden Bird, J J Tigar, 0 J J Wynne, R J J Stokes-Rees, W B Hamilton-Dalrymple, J M Barton, J G Beveridge, and the captain, A J Stackhouse, who led the team by the force of his example.

The Under Eleven team was more successful, winning against St Olave’s away 4-nil and St Martin’s at home 24-4. After two good victories we had hoped to do better than to lose against Malsis away 26-nil. Others who played in the team were P T Scanlan, N S Corbally-Stourton, A H St J Murray, T J Howard, S F Evans, A B Reed, I S Wauchope, J G C Jackson, E W Cunningham, J M Barton, J G Beveridge, and the captain, A J Stackhouse, who led the team by the force of his example.

The Under Eleven team was more successful, winning against St Olave’s away 4-nil and St Martin’s at home 24-4. After two good victories we had hoped to do better than to lose against Malsis away 26-nil. A hard fought game against St Otley’s at home finished up a 12-12 draw. The team was well-captained by C L Macdonald; others who played were E M G Soden Bird, J J Tigar, 0 J J Wynne, R J J Stokes-Rees, W B Hamilton-Dalrymple, J M Barton, J G Beveridge, and the captain, A J Stackhouse, who led the team by the force of his example.

WOODEORK AND MODELLING

The carpentry shop was so utilised in break time that the boys used up almost as much wood as is normally used in a whole year. The work completed for Christmas included picture frames, book troughs, foot stools, mallets, book stands, bowls, ash trays, boot shelves, spoons and forks, and coat of arms. Some of the best work was done by A H St J Murray, F J E Redgrave, S A Medlicott, D J Smith Dodsworth and P J F Bradie. In the model room there were made with varying degrees of success 12 gliders, nine boats, and one hovercraft by J H de C Killick. The most enthusiastic modellers were A F Reynolds and J B. Ainscough.